# **REGULAR MEETING NOTICE**

# LOVELAND DOWNTOWN DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY (4:00 P.M.)

# July 10, 2023

# Cleveland Room at Desk Chair 201 East 4<sup>th</sup> Street in Downtown

The Loveland Downtown Partnership and Downtown Development Authority are committed to providing an equal opportunity for citizens and does not discriminate on the basis of disability, race, color, national origin, religion, sexual orientation, or gender. The LDP-DDA will make reasonable accommodations for citizens in accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act.

For more information, please call our offices at 970.699.2856.

#### Agenda Loveland Downtown Development Authority (DDA) Regular Meeting Monday, July 10, 2023 4:00 pm

#### Cleveland Room at Desk Chair 201 East 4<sup>th</sup> Street

#### 4:00 pm

- 1. Call to Order
- 2. Roll Call

#### 4:05 pm

3. Public Comment (individual introductions / comments are limited to 3 minutes)

#### 4:10 pm

#### 4. Approval of Minutes

"I move to approve (deny) the minutes of the Regular Meeting of June 12, 2023"

#### 4:15

#### 5. Presentation & Discussion / Action Items

- Executive Director Update HIP Streets Design, 3<sup>rd</sup> Street Pedestrian Crosswalk Line of Credit, 404 East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street, 4<sup>th</sup> and Garfield, 501 N. Cleveland Avenue, Collection property into the DDA.
- Historic Loveland Business Improvement District & Next Steps
- Approval of local match for Revitalizing Main Streets Program Grant for 3<sup>rd</sup> Lincoln / 3<sup>rd</sup> Washington Crosswalk Program in an amount not to exceed \$50,000.00.

Sample motion: "I move (deny) to approve the expenditure of up to \$50,000.00 as a local match to the Revitalizing Main Streets Program grant for the 3<sup>rd</sup> Lincoln/3<sup>rd</sup> Washington Crosswalk Program, and authorize the DDA executive director to execute agreements and other instruments in connection therewith."

- Thompson Park Conceptual Redesign Partnership with Parks and Recreation
   Department
- Loveland Police Department Presentation
- 3<sup>rd</sup> Phase Parking Discussion City of Loveland Planning Staff

#### 5:15 pm

- 6. City Council Report
- Fogle, Olson City Council

#### 5:30 pm

# 7. Adjourn

#### Meeting Minutes Loveland Downtown Development Authority (DDA) Regular Meeting Monday, June 12, 2023 4:00 pm

#### Cleveland Room at Desk Chair 201 East 4<sup>th</sup> Street

#### 4:00 pm

- 1. Call to Order Chair Steele called the meeting to order at 4:01pm
- 2. **Roll Call** Steele, Waneka, Bernhardt- absent, Patterson, Fellure, Wyrick, Gressianu, Loomis, Fogle, Olson. Also in attendance: Josh Liley, Bill Becker, Megan Griesel, Steve Taylor, Patty Spencer, Lisa Levilee,

#### 4:05 pm

3. Public Comment (individual introductions / comments are limited to 3 minutes)

There were no public comments presented.

#### 4:10 pm

#### 4. Approval of Minutes

Fogle moved to approve the minutes of the Regular Meeting of April 10, 2023. Wyrick seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

#### 4:15

#### 5. Presentation & Discussion / Action Items

- Local Lending Company Presentation Steve Taylor and Patty Spencer presented their loan program from the Local Lending Company which is a Fort Collins based non-profit. They are interested in expanding to help Loveland based businesses. Their process is easier than standard loans and can lend for building improvements, purchases, gap financing etc. Average loan amount is around \$100K.
- Executive Director Update

HIP Streets Design – Hawkins informed the board that conceptual design is moving forward and he's happy with the early work. The group is discussing materials, parking changes, maintenance, public art and more.

3<sup>rd</sup> Street Pedestrian Crosswalk Update - Design is underway and Hawkins hopes to apply for a Revitalizing Main Street grant to pay for the upgrades.

350 N. Cleveland Avenue- Hawkins has been working with a new business for the old Loveland Downtown Partnership site. It does need facade upgrades and Hawkins is anticipating a façade grant request for the project.

404 East 3<sup>rd</sup> Street – Hawkins continues to work with the developers on a tax increment agreement to make the restoration of the church a reality.

 501 N. Cleveland Avenue - Project Commitment Terms- Hawkins presented project commitment terms to aid in the completion of the new Josh and John's Ice Cream location at 501 N. Cleveland Avenue. The DDA would provide three years of sales tax reimbursement with a cap to reimburse the cost of filling the curb cut on the property on the Cleveland Avenue side of the property. In exchange, Josh and Johns would install an outdoor patio according to the plans in the packet and work with the Visual Arts Commission to install a mural on the north wall of the property.

Wyrick moved to approve the 501 N. Cleveland Avenue project plans and associated Term Sheet, and direct the Executive Director, in consultation with DDA legal counsel, to negotiate a development agreement with the developer consistent with the Term Sheet. Fogle second the motion which passed unanimously.

Historic Loveland Business Improvement District & Next Steps

Hawkins updated the board on the outreach efforts to get a Business Improvement District funding path on the fall ballot for commercial property owners only. A Base Level of Services draft agreement has been submitted to City leadership which is a key component of asking property owners to assess themselves. Hawkins will update the board on this effort at the July meeting.

#### 5:15 pm

#### 6. City Council Report

Fogle, Olson - City Council - Fogle told the board of group in the City that is trying to pass ballot initiatives- 1 remove sales tax on food, 2 is to require a citizen vote on any URA component. Removal of food sales tax would cut the City's General Fund budget by almost 16%.

Motion by Fogle to direct Sean Hawkins to ask Police Chief and several SRO officers to our next meeting to discuss coverage of downtown. Fellure seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

#### 5:30 pm

#### 7. Adjourn

Wyrick made a motion to adjourn the meeting at 5:05 p.m. Gressianu seconded the motion which passed unanimously.



## Revitalizing Main Streets (RMS)

Opportunity 2: Small Multimodal and Economic Resiliency Grant

# Application

#### Introduction

This grant program supports downtown vitality and the built environment by encouraging economic development, supporting community access to public streets and multimodal transportation, and bringing innovative uses of public spaces for people to life. The funds are used for infrastructure improvement projects that meet the aim of the program and 'shovel ready', therefore can be completed within a 12 month period from grant contract execution, if approved.

#### Eligibility



Maximum CDOT grant award per project: \$250,000. *Note*: Minimum match amount required is 10% of total project cost.



Projects must be located in the state of Colorado. On-CDOT system and off-CDOT system projects are eligible. *Note*: if a project impacts a state right of way, a <u>Special Use Permit</u> is required.



Expenses that are exempt from award, if awarded:

- Planning, design, or community engagement expenses are not allowed. Readiness to build the project is part of the scoring criteria, and the CDOT funded portion of the project must be fully constructed within 12 months.
- Work completed prior to contract execution with CDOT is not eligible for reimbursement nor can it count toward the 10% match requirement.
- Staff or volunteer time is not eligible to meet the match requirements.

Applicants must be one of the following:



- Local Governments
- Business Improvement Districts
- Council of Governments, on behalf of a local jurisdiction and with proof of support from that local jurisdiction
- University or College

#### Process

Completed applications may be submitted at any time to <u>cdotmainstreets@state.co.us</u>. See the website for additional program information.



Part 1	Overviev	v & Scope		
1. Entity Name				
Project Title				
Entity Address (Include city, state, zip)				
2. Primary Projec (person responsible and implementing	t Manager Name le for managing the project)			
Project Ma	nager Email			
<b>3.</b> Project Location: (route with start & end points or detailed geographic area & map)				
4. Does this project CDOT roadway, ac request transit age	ct touch CDOT Rig cess transit agency ency involvement	ht-of-Way, involve a y property or to operate service?Image: Special Use Permit. Special Use Permit. If yes, have you completed this submission: Image: Yes Image: No		
<b>5. Procurement.</b> By checking the box, local jurisdictions acknowledge the use of grant awards in accordance with local jurisdiction procurement standards that identify appropriate procedures to ensure projects are procured through an open and competitive process.   Yes  No				
Please describe y	our process:			
<b>6. Applicable Federal and/or state laws.</b> By checking the box, local jurisdictions acknowledge their responsibility to ensure compliance with all applicable federal and state laws (such as the Americans with Disability Act). Yes No				



**7. Project Objective.** *Provide a short, no more than one paragraph, summary of what the objective of your project is* (limited to 500 characters)? Attach current state photographs and map of the project area.

**8. Project Scope Overview**. Describe how you will achieve that objective. Please only include details specific to the work that will occur as part of this project. Include ownership information for the project improvements. (limited to 1,500 characters). *Do not include background information or justification language*.



### 9. Scope & Element Deliverables

The **RMS Grant Requested** project scope shall complete the deliverables listed below to achieve the desired outcome:

#	Deliverable	Description
1		
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		



# Part 2 Financials

**10. Costs.** Please provide the expected cost for all **RMS Funding Requested** project scope deliverables.

A. Local Agency Labor Costs:

#	Employee Classification	Hourly Rate	Estimated Total Hours	Estimated Total Cost
1				
2				
3				
4				
5				

Total Labor Costs: \$\_\_\_\_\_

#	Item Description	Vendor	Quantity	Total Cost
"		Vendor	Quarterey	lotat cost
1				
2				
3				
4				
5				
6				

#### B. <u>Vendors, Subcontractors, Materials, Equipment, and Other Costs</u>

Total Vendor/Subcontractor/Materials/Equipment/Other Costs: \$\_\_\_\_\_

#### C. <u>Total RMS Funding Requested Cost</u>

The total project cost is \$\_\_\_\_\_



## 11. Budget

Total Project Budget		
<b>RMS Funding Requested</b> (up to \$250,000)		
List all <b>additional project funding</b> source(s) & amount		
List all <b>additional project funding</b> source(s) & amount		
<b>By checking this box</b> , the applicant's President, Chief Executive Officer, Chief Elected Official (Mayor or County Commission Chair) or City/County Manager for local governments or Agency Director or equivalent for others, has certified it allows this project request to be submitted for funding and will follow all CDOT policies and state and federal regulations when completing this project, if funded.		

### Scope & Financials: Verification and Additional Information

Scope of Work & Financials Verification If an award is approved, this document represents the scope of the work and costs for the project. By signing this, the applicant has reviewed the application to ensure it represents the necessary project components required for execution. No changes to the scope of work can be submitted after this has been submitted to CDOT. Signature:	Date: 
<b>Further Review</b> . Describe any review by the applicant or by other agencies (including CDOT will be required as part of this project. For example: Identify whether the project involves a Right-Of-Way (ROW).	) that my CDOT
<ul> <li>Attachments.</li> <li>Please attach relevant maps/photographs/design documents to your application subr</li> <li>A clear project connection described to a master plan or community plan is preferred project has no connection to such plans, letters of support may be substituted.</li> </ul>	nission. I. If a



# Part 3 Narrative

Provide *qualitative and quantitative* responses to the following questions.

1. **Vitality and the Built Environment** (35%): How does the project impact the vitality of your community's downtown, mixed-use center, or community gathering space? Does this project promote economic development?



2. Active Transportation and Safety (35%): Does the project promote active transportation, including an increase to biking, walking, and/or transit? Does it improve safety for these and other vulnerable users? If so, how do you know that?



3. Equity and Access (10%): How will the project support low-income people, and/or reach populations with disproportionately lower environmental and health measures and outcomes? Describe how the project includes safe access to opportunity and mobility for residents of all ages, races, languages, incomes and abilities?

4. **Readiness of Implementation** (10%): What is the current status of planning, designing & engineering the project? When is the anticipated completion date for this project? Describe the degree to which a project is "shovel ready," and provide a project schedule to not exceed 12 months for the RMS requested portion.



5. **Community Engagement/Public Support:** (5%) Please describe how the community has been engaged to inform the location, design or intent of the project (i.e. surveys, past or current planning processes). Are there community plans that played a role in the creation of the project?

6. **Innovation** (5%) Identify aspects of the project that would involve new technologies or innovative methods, show an innovation in cost-benefit or are leading in innovative approaches.





#### **Executive Summary**

#### Background

Downtown Loveland is the heart of the city, home to restaurants, retailers, employers and community spaces, and even recognized as a National Historic District by the National Park Service. The success of Downtown is a core focus of the City's initiatives, including preservation and redevelopment, as well as policy and infrastructure initiatives. With an understanding that parking is a critical element of Downtown's vitality and vibrancy, the City chose to develop this Downtown Parking Management Plan. The Plan sets forth strategies to manage parking assets and offer convenient options to short-term and long-term parkers, now and into the future.

# The Importance of Parking Management in Downtown Loveland's Continued Success

The City of Loveland currently spends an estimated roughly \$1 million each year on providing and maintaining parking for the public, spent across 11 departments and governmental bodies like the Downtown Development Authority (DDA). While this expense is significant, it does not contribute well to an optimized parking system because little money is directly allocated for active parking management, facility upkeep, or intentional planning. As a result, the system suffers from various challenges, including user frustration and confusion, an imbalance of parking options for different users, a lack of prioritization and direction, and increasing pressure to spend even more money to add new parking inventory. The community has expressed interest in addressing these challenges and building a responsive and modern system that can respond to their needs.

As the City expands its role as the major owner, manager and operator of public parking Downtown and the area continues to grow and evolve, this Plan can guide investment and action to achieve critical goals.

#### The Downtown Parking Management Plan Vision and Guiding Principles

A vision and set of guiding principles for the Downtown Parking Management Plan was developed alongside an advisory committee assembled by staff and the DDA. Each strategy included in the Downtown Parking Management Plan was specifically selected to advance the vision.

# Loveland's Downtown Parking System will contribute to the livability, economic vibrancy and vitality, and welcoming nature of Downtown Loveland through effective and user-friendly policies that support all members of the Loveland community.

#### **GUIDING PRINCIPLES**

Principle 1: Be responsive to and supportive of a diverse range of user behaviors, needs and choices.
Principle 2: Focus on welcoming, user-friendly, and efficient customer service for all user types.
Principle 3: Prioritize customer and visitor parking Downtown while supporting options for longer-term parkers, like employees and residents.

Principle 4: Achieve a reasonable level of cost recovery in maintaining and managing the parking system.

#### **Community Engagement**

The community's voice and opinions have been reflected throughout this Plan, which included a robust engagement and outreach effort comprising an advisory committee developed in concert with the DDA, 16 in-person public events, and more than 922 written survey, poll and idea responses offered in-person and online through the Let's Talk Loveland digital hub. Key themes emerging from their participation included:

- **Get Something Done:** Stop planning and take action—particularly on signage and enforcement.
- **Support Other Modes:** Keep an eye towards other travel choices beyond just driving and parking.
- Maximize On-Street Parking Efficiencies: Increase turnover on-street and make space available to customers and visitors.
- Address Options for Long-Term Parking: Create convenient options for long-term parkers like employees and residents so they are not reliant on the on-street system.
- Focus on Enforcement: Support turnover and better manage demand "hot spots" by enforcing actively and with modern technology.
- Focus on Signage: Communicate parking options with clear signage.
- Leverage Technology: Use technology to make parking a better experience.
- Improve Maintenance and Safety: Maintain, light and secure parking facilities.

### **Parking Management in Peer Communities**

Several communities in Northern Colorado, including Fort Collins and Greeley, actively manage parking in various ways.

Fort Collins offers time-limited parking on-street and uses active enforcement with license plate recognition (LPR) technology<sup>1</sup> as its primary management tool, with some paid parking in public parking structures priced at \$1 per hour. The parking system also offers permit parking options to Downtown employees and residents, for a fee. While Fort Collins has historically generated sufficient revenue to fully cover operating costs to run the parking system, revenues have declined over the years and cost recovery is now at about 80%. This is because the system is primarily reliant on citation revenue and permit revenue, and generates little revenue from paid parking in the under-utilized garages. Parking is managed as an enterprise fund by a City department (Parking Services), which includes a parking services manager and enforcement/support staff. The Fort Collins Downtown Development Authority is a participant in making parking decisions, although they are not responsible for directly managing parking, and has contributed financially to constructing parking in the past.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> License Plate Recognition systems use a camera that converts a vehicle's license plate number into text data and automatically recognizes if the vehicle has overstayed an assigned parking time limit, or has been involved in another parking violation (e.g., parking in an unauthorized area). Many Colorado communities use LPR enforcement, including Fort Collins, Denver, and Greeley. The many benefits of LPR systems include decreased labor costs and enhanced customer experience.

Greeley offers on-street parking free for the first two hours and paid after a two-hour stay. Free parking is available even with a longer duration of stay in more remote on-street areas and in several surface lots. Longer-term, regular parkers can also use the permit parking system, where permits are offered for a fee. The City manages parking through its Parking Services division under Public Works. Cost recovery is strong, with revenues exceeding typical annual operating expenses. Revenues above operating costs have been used to fund streetscape improvements and conduct long-term maintenance on parking facilities.

## **Key Strategies and Action Steps**

#### FOUNDATIONAL STRATEGIES

**Foundational strategies** lay the groundwork and build the administrative framework necessary to achieving an effective parking system. Critical foundational strategies include:

- Create a Parking Services Division within the Public Works Department and hire a division manager. Later hires will include enforcement officers, and could include part-time support staff if needs arise.
- Build a robust and consistent signage and wayfinding program for all parking facilities.

#### SHORT-TERM PARKING AND CURB MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES

**Short Term Parking and Curb Management strategies** focus on improving the parking experience for customers and visitors in Downtown Loveland by increasing turnover in high-demand areas. Critical short-term parking and curb management strategies include:

- Enact uniform 2-hour time limits for on-street parking throughout Downtown and enforce on a regular schedule using LPR technology to maximize efficiency.
- Update the parking violation fine structure to focus on repeat violators.
- Delineate on-street spaces for very short-term stays, like commercial delivery and pick-up/dropoff, to reduce double-parking, congestion, and other undesirable impacts.
- Consider paid on-street parking in the "core" of Downtown, where activity is highest such as along 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> streets between Railroad and Washington, if and when growing demand necessitates it.

#### LONG-TERM PARKING STRATEGIES

**Long-term parking management strategies** create more long-term parking options for Downtown employees and residents, including overnight parking options. These strategies are a counterweight to stronger turnover on-street, offering convenient and appropriate options for those seeking to park for longer periods of time. Critical long-term parking management strategies include:

- Formalize and commit to maintenance and safety standards in all public parking facilities.
- Implement a permit parking system for Downtown employees and residents in designated public lots and garages.
- Address any spillover into surrounding neighborhoods through a targeted on-street resident parking permit program if and when spillover has demonstrably intensified.

#### **Unified Development Code Strategies**

**Unified Development Code Amendments strategies** enhance the regulatory environment to better support a sustainable, user-friendly, and efficient parking system Downtown. Critical unified development code amendment strategies include:

- Evaluate the parking demand impacts of the existing parking requirement exemption for multifamily residential development within mixed-use buildings in the General Improvement District (GID) boundary. Determine actions based on this evaluation, up to and including elimination of the exemption if projected parking demand impact is over 250 spaces.
- Identify transportation demand management<sup>2</sup> (TDM) strategies appropriate for Downtown Loveland and consider allowing new developments to receive parking reductions if they offer these supportive strategies—such as resident carshare programs, investment in transit stops, passenger pick-up areas, bikeshare programs, and more.

#### **Budget Impacts**

All projections are general and budget-level and have been made in close coordination with City staff. As shown, while the recommended system will incur more costs due to increased staffing and technology investment, revenues and percentage cost recovery are also projected to increase. This will result in a lessened draw on the General Fund budget to operate the parking system compared to current conditions.

	Existing- Near-	Existing- 5 Years	Recommended-	Recommended- 5
	Term		Near-Term	Years
Projected Annual Revenues	\$20,000	\$20,000	\$490,000	\$540,000
Projected Annual Expenses	\$1,400,000	\$2,100,000	\$1,630,000	\$1,960,000
Projected Cost Recovery %	1%	1%	30%	27%

### **In Conclusion**

The City of Loveland is now the chief owner, operator and manager of public parking Downtown. This Plan offers an opportunity to efficiently manage existing parking assets, plan for new ones, and offer convenient options to short-term and long-term parkers alike. The recommended program necessitates investment in staff and technology but will ultimately result in greater cost recovery and reduced reliance on the City's General Fund.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Transportation demand management refers to programs, policies and actions that help reduce the use of personal vehicles as a primary method to get from place to place. TDM can help reduce traffic and vehicle congestion, improve air quality, and lower emissions generated by vehicles.

## **Table of Contents**

Chapt	er 1: Introduction	2
Chapt	er 2: Setting the Stage	6
	Our Challenge	6
	Why Act Now?	6
	Planning Context	7
	Why Parking Management?	10
	Downtown Parking Vision and Guiding Principles	12
Chapt	er 3: Key Considerations	13
	Reflecting Community Feedback	13
	Budget Analysis	16
	Parking Management in Peer Communities	23
	Impacts and Best Practices for Mobility-Impaired Community Members	24
Chapt	er 4: Strategies and Actions	26
	Strategy Type 1: Foundational	26
	Strategy Type 2: Short-Term Parking and Curb Management	31
	Strategy Type 3: Long-Term Parking Management	35
	Strategy Type 4: Unified Development Code Updates	40
Chapt	er 5: Action Step Summary	41
	Near-Term Action Steps	46
	Mid-Term Action Steps	47

### **Chapter 1: Introduction**

Downtown Loveland (Downtown), often referred to as "the Heart", is the cultural and historic center of the city and is host to many restaurants, retailers, galleries, offices, and other gathering spaces. In addition to its modern cultural amenities, the historic nature of the Downtown, reenergized by recent preservation efforts and redevelopment projects, has made it an attractive place for tourists and visitors alike and has served as an anchor for future community reinvestment.

In recent years, the City has coupled its economic investment in Downtown with an effort to align the area's infrastructure—particularly streets, sidewalks, bike lanes, transit options and parking assets— with the growing and evolving needs of the community. This initiative has included development of the Heart Improvement Program (HIP) Streets Plan, which envisions Downtown streets as walkable, bikeable, and transit-friendly spaces that allow for gathering and social interaction in addition to travel. The HIP Streets Plan, first created in 2009 and updated in 2017, and will be completed in phases as funding becomes available.

In 2018, this infrastructure initiative expanded to include an analysis of the City's public parking system. At that time, the City had recently partnered with a private developer to construct the Foundry garage, part of a mixed-use development with public access to 300 structured parking spaces. This partnership made the City principle owner and operator of public parking Downtown, and the City had an increasingly vested interest in supporting the efficient and effective management of its Downtown parking assets, including the Foundry, and more than 2,000 other parking spaces within the public right-of-way and in surface lots.

Today, the City manages over 2,600 parking spaces in Downtown, and will soon manage an additional 171 structured parking spaces in the new Jefferson garage, another public-private partnership. **Figure 1-1** and **Figure 1-2**, respectively, depict Downtown's off-street and on-street parking locations, including the new Jefferson garage.

#### Figure 1-1: Downtown Off-Street Parking Inventory



Figure 1-2: Downtown On-Street Parking Inventory



This plan, entitled the Downtown Loveland Parking Management Implementation and Action Plan, is a step-by-step guide to enhancing the efficiency, effectiveness, and utility of Downtown Loveland's parking assets in support of broader City goals, like economic vitality and quality of life.

### **Chapter 2: Setting the Stage**

#### **Our Challenge**

# The City spends a significant amount of its General Fund budget on Downtown parking, with limited return on investment.

The City of Loveland spends roughly \$1 million per year on public parking services. That money is spent over 11 departments, governmental bodies and funds.<sup>1</sup>

Despite the significant recurring expense, the parking system is not functioning optimally because it is not being entirely actively managed and operated. There is generally sufficient supply overall to accommodate demand well into the future (particularly with the new addition of the public/private Jefferson garage); there are current challenges with the system, including:

- **Demand Distribution:** Extreme parking demand in specific areas (e.g., 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> streets).
- Imbalance of Parking Options: Limited parking options for certain user groups (especially longterm parkers such as employees and residents when their offices do not offer any), and a lack of incentive to use existing appropriate long-term parking options like The Foundry garage.
- **Confusion:** Lack of knowledge, instruction, and wayfinding signage about how and where to park.
- Administrative Challenges: Lack of prioritization and attention to parking and mobility needs, because many City departments work on parking as a "side job" rather than as the main focus.
- **Parking Policy Challenges:** The construction of new parking is not required for any mixed-use development Downtown (specifically, within the General Improvement District), even if new residences are built. This has put pressure on the Downtown public parking system to meet the needs of residents, in addition to customers, visitors and employees.
- **Looming Expenses:** Pressure to add expensive new parking supply may not solve the existing problems that Loveland faces now or in the future with the redevelopment of the Downtown, including the implementation of HIP Streets.

Should Loveland continue in this vein, the City is projected to spend over \$15 million in accrued costs over the next ten years on general upkeep of the parking and mobility system. Additionally, in response to community pressures for more parking, \$12 to 15 million in capital expenditures related to the addition of new inventory in the Downtown core are also projected.

### Why Act Now?

#### The City of Loveland is increasingly involved in the business of parking in its Downtown core.

The City currently owns and operates more than 2,600 parking spaces in Downtown Loveland on-street, in surface lots, and in garages (namely, the Foundry parking structure, shared public/private partnership)<sup>2</sup>. The City is also entering into an agreement for a new shared public/private parking structure that will add 171 new publicly available spaces to the system. The City is expanding its role as

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See Appendix B

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Figure 1-1 and Figure 1-2

an owner, operator, manager, and provider of public parking amenities and services for the Downtown community. As Downtown grows and evolves and community needs become more diverse and complex, it is increasingly important for the City to establish clear, defined, data-driven, industry-supported practices for managing and providing excellent parking services that the public can count on.

# The City of Loveland is smartly expanding the right-of-way space it dedicates to other transportation choices and modes through the implementation of the HIP Street Plan.

Implementation of the HIP Street Modernization Plan, adopted in 2017, will result in a more balanced and holistic approach to allocating the public right-of-way for pedestrians, cyclists, drivers driving and parking, and other user types. Implementation will also result in a projected total loss of 162 on-street spaces in the Downtown core once 100% complete.

A more diverse allocation of the right-of-way Downtown, and a reduced inventory of in-demand onstreet spaces, will necessitate a more careful and considered parking management approach that maximizes the efficiency of available parking.

#### The community is supportive of meaningful changes to the parking system.

The community has expressed great interest in changes to the parking system that will make a real difference in their day-to-day lives. In particular, community members are excited about predictable, active enforcement of Downtown parking, and clear identification of longer-term parking options with directional signage and wayfinding to help drivers make decisions. Many community members— particularly the business community—have expressed hope that the City will take action soon. This support is reflected in the results of engagement and outreach conducted as part of this work, summarized on pages 11-12.

#### **Planning Context**

Four key planning documents already adopted by the City of Loveland inform this work, including:

- <u>Citywide Strategic Plan (2019)</u>
- Downtown Design Standards (2018)
- HIP Streets Modernization Plan (2017)
- <u>City of Loveland Comprehensive Plan—Create Loveland (2015)</u>

#### **CITYWIDE STRATEGIC PLAN (2019)**

The Citywide Strategic Planning effort started in early 2019. It sets forth eight prioritization areas to guide community initiatives. The strategies and action steps discussed in this plan advance many of these focus areas, including:

- **Public Safety:** Improves the condition and safety of public parking infrastructure and contributes to a safer environment for pedestrians, cyclists, and other transportation users in the right-of-way by clearly allocating and managing space.
- **Economic Vitality:** Supports businesses by taking clear and decisive steps to maximize the availability of high-demand on-street parking infrastructure for customers and visitors, while creating options for longer-term parking.

- Infrastructure and Transportation: Creates a sustainable plan for providing well-managed, efficient, and user-friendly parking infrastructure to those who need it while supporting other transportation choices through holistic policy and design.
- **Fiscal Stability and Strength:** Seeks to achieve reasonable levels of cost recovery and decrease reliance on the General Fund for regular parking operations.

#### **DOWNTOWN DESIGN STANDARDS (2018)**

In 2015, Downtown Loveland was recognized on the National Register of Historic Places as a National Historic District. The Downtown Design Standards support the maintenance of the special architectural and design characteristics that make Downtown Loveland special by providing direction for rehabilitations and new developments occurring Downtown. Beyond this aesthetic framework, the Design Standards advance "actions that will maximize the collective value of Downtown visually and economically."

#### HIP STREETS (HIPS) MODERNIZATION PLAN (2017)

The 2017 HIPS Modernization Plan was published as a supplement to the original HIP Streets Concept Plan from 2009 (HIPS Plan). Largely because of the 2008 Great Recession and resounding financial impacts, most urban design concepts and strategies proposed in the original 2009 plan, like enhanced pedestrian connections and public gathering spaces—were never implemented. This modernization used urban design concepts that were originally proposed as a foundation for redesigned concepts that were more conservative and cost-effective, as well as updated to align with development and other changes that had taken place between 2009 and 2017. The HIPS Modernization Plan did espouse the same overarching goals as the original 2009 HIP Streets Concept Plan, which included:

- Create a Downtown that sustains a good network of public spaces, streets, infrastructure, cultural destinations and retail corridors, providing a vibrant environment to live, work, shop, and visit.
- Design streets that take all users into account, include sidewalks lined with a variety of interesting features and activities, and promote safety for vehicles, pedestrians, and bicyclists.
- Provide public spaces that are well-programmed, accommodate a variety of uses and users, promote social interaction and a sense of community, and include memorable architectural, landscape, and hardscape elements.

The HIPS Plan will generally result in a tightened on-street inventory and a more multimodal and pedestrian-friendly Downtown, necessitating increased attention to managing existing parking assets. The 2017 HIPS Plan calls for the conversion of all existing angled and 90-degree on-street parking Downtown to parallel spaces to accommodate wider sidewalks and prevent vehicle overhangs on the sidewalk, which can impede pedestrian circulation. This proposed on-street parking conversion was wider in scope than what was proposed in 2009. This conversion, along with the removal of all on-street parking along 4<sup>th</sup> Street between Cleveland and Lincoln, is projected to result in the loss of about 162 on-street spaces if and when implementation is fully completed. This conversion will be offset entirely by the addition of new public parking spaces to the system, including the Foundry Garage, which includes 300 spaces available to the public, and the new Jefferson Garage, which will add 171 stalls.

#### COMPREHENSIVE PLAN—CREATE LOVELAND (2015)

The Downtown Parking Management Plan advances many of the goals set forth in the Create Loveland Comprehensive Plan, including:

- A well-planned and strategically managed growth and development, by advancing marketdriven parking and access requirements for new development Downtown.
- **A vibrant economy** by creating well-managed parking options for customers and visitors, as well as employees, so that the parking system can effectively support business activity.
- An environmentally sustainable community by reducing excessive vehicle circulation in search of a parking space, which in turn reduces vehicle emissions.
- A safe and secure community by improving maintenance and safety for public parking facilities.
- Effective mobility and reliable infrastructure by building a more efficient environment for drivers and parkers, as well as for people using other modes of travel.

### Why Parking Management?

Downtown Loveland has experienced significant growth and development within the last decade. In addition to the full assortment of civic, cultural, retail, restaurant, and office uses that have existed Downtown, the more recent addition of Downtown multifamily development and the dramatic increase in event activities such as concerts and festivals have led to the Downtown becoming a central node of activity during the day and the night, and on weekdays as well as weekends.

While Loveland's Downtown parking system is not



2018 Inventory and Occupancy Analyses found that on-street spaces along 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> streets **frequently approached or exceeded effective capacity**, while many other public parking resources were at or below 50% occupancy.

technically unmanaged – posted time limits and other restrictions exist both on-street and for public offstreet parking – enforcement is sporadic and inconsistent due to a lack of dedicated staff and funding, and it does not currently function to alter parking behaviors such that the potential benefits of a managed parking system are realized. Parking systems that are effectively and consistently managed are the first step in aligning parking behaviors and needs with the needs of Downtown business owners, visitors, residents, and employees and ensuring that Downtown parking is promoting economic vitality.

Unmanaged and ineffectively managed parking can create many challenges, including:

- All parkers will naturally gravitate towards the on-street parking closest to their destination:
  - If close-in on-street parking within a block of one's destination is not available at the time of arrival, many will "cruise," or drive around and around until a space becomes available if it ever does. This "cruising" is a major contributor to traffic congestion and build-up in Downtowns.
  - Cruising behavior causes congestion because it creates an unnecessary queuing of cars waiting for cub vacancies, but cruisers are mixed in with the flow of commuters causing frustration to commuters.
  - Cruising also leads to unnecessary carbon emissions, fuel waste, and wasted time for most individuals.
- Parking supply typically "fills in" on a first-come, first-served basis:
  - Without time limits in the free parking zones or adequate enforcement of those limits, employees and long-term parkers arriving first thing in the morning will occupy most of the most convenient, close-in parking and will most likely violate the time limit.
  - Such behavior can dramatically decrease the supply of convenient parking available for visitors, business patrons, and other short-term users.

- Convenient parking may not be available for those with mobility challenges.
- With longer-term parkers occupying much of the most convenient on-street parking, vehicle turnover can be dramatically decreased, which can lead to decreased business activity and foot traffic Downtown.
- Close-in parking may not be available during business hours.
- Off-street parking assets can be chronically underutilized (meaning that on a regular basis, their may be less than 60% occupancy), especially structured assets such as the Foundry.
- Visitors and business patrons will perceive a parking shortage when one may not actually exist.
- Delivery and loading activity may be hindered, causing further cruising and traffic congestion, and double-parking.
- City lacks important set of tools in the toolkit for incentivizing longer-term parkers to park in offstreet facilities and/or along the periphery of the Downtown.
- It can be more difficult to make use of or re-purpose the curb for other non-parking-related uses, either temporarily or permanently
- Inconsistent enforcement can be viewed as punitive and even discriminatory towards certain user groups or even individuals, as "luck of the draw" becomes a factor in terms of who may get cited who gets away with flouting the rules
- Some property owners and/or regular parkers will treat the curb lane adjacent to their property or where they usually park as their property or an extension of their property, and not as a public asset available to all
- Long-term storage of vehicles, including derelict vehicles, may be a problem
- Inconsistent and inadequate data about the nature, frequency, and types of violations occurring
- Without a dedicated enforcement system or mechanism, enforcement is often left to the Police Department. This can result in a reactive approach to parking management, where the focus is on punitive responses to violations rather than on turnover and efficient management of the system.

#### Effectively managed parking can:

- Make it easier for people to reach their destination
- Reduced "cruising" activity
  - Lowers carbon emissions
  - Decreases traffic circulation and on-street congestion
  - Increases quality-of-life
- Support and encourage different modes of transportation choices
- Optimize parking and transportation programs for users
- Enhance economic growth and vibrancy
  - Increased merchant revenues
  - $\circ$   $\;$  Growth in sales tax that can be used to reinvest in development  $\;$
- Support clear, even-handed enforcement of parking restrictions and regulations for everyone, so that no one person is any more or less impacted by the rules in place
- Decrease long-term vehicle storage and minimize derelict vehicle activity
- Make it easier for pick-up and drop-off activity to occur, thus allowing for the efficient use of parking by preventing double parking in traffic lanes. Including the following types of activity:
  - Pick-up Passenger

- Quick drop off and pick-up of deliveries of merchandise or food
- Large shipments or longer delivery times
- Making it easier to balance the many competing uses for the curb, including parking, travel, commercial activity, and more.

#### **Downtown Parking System Vision and Guiding Principles**

Loveland's Downtown Parking System will contribute to the livability, economic vibrancy and vitality, and welcoming nature of Downtown Loveland through effective and user-friendly policies that support all members of the Loveland community.

#### **GUIDING PRINCIPLES**

Guiding principles are broad statements that help create policies and strategies that match a community's vision for success. Strategies selected for the Downtown Parking Management Plan have been evaluated in terms of how much they can advance these principles.

Principles were first developed under the 2019 Downtown Parking Management Plan, then vetted and updated in 2022 with the assistance of City staff and an advisory committee assembled by staff and the DDA. The proposed Guiding Principles include:

Principle 1: Be responsive to and supportive of a diverse range of user behaviors, needs and choices.
Principle 2: Focus on welcoming, user-friendly, and efficient customer service for all user types.
Principle 3: Prioritize customer and visitor parking Downtown while supporting options for longer-term parkers, like employees and residents.

Principle 4: Achieve a reasonable level of cost recovery in maintaining and managing the parking system.

### **Chapter 3: Key Considerations**

#### **Reflecting Community Feedback**

Building on community engagement and collaboration conducted in 2018 and 2019 during the first and second phases of the Parking Study, the study's third phase included a robust effort to discuss, vet, and build general support around critical strategies with a technical advisory committee, a reprised Advisory Committee including members of the Downtown Development Authority (DDA), the Senior Advisory Board, the Disabilities Advisory Commission, and business community, residents, visitors, employees and business owners more generally, and key decision-making bodies like the Planning Commission, the Transportation Advisory Board, and City Council. The engagement effort included 16 in-person engagements at various well-attended community events, supported by volunteer City staff.

#### Figure 3-1: Downtown Parking Management Plan Metrics



# Downtown Parking Management Plan

# **Community Engagement Metrics**

# Engagement Methods

- Broad Community Reach: Digital hub, online poll, open-ended questions, in-person outreach during concerts and other public events for residents and visitors
- Targeted Community Reach: Engagement & online survey for business owners and members of the Downtown Loveland Association



# **Participation Summary**

# **DIGITAL HUB**

The Downtown Parking Hub was established under the Let's Talk Loveland community engagement platform, hosted by Bang the Table. Engagement was conducted from July to December 2022.



Key themes emerged from community feedback, including:

- Get Something Done:
  - Community members, and particularly the business community, feel that parking has been thoroughly studied. Implementation particularly quick wins, like immediately upping enforcement activity, installing new signage, and creating a long-term parking permit program is necessary.
- Support Other Modes: The community has expressed excitement about HIP Streets



implementation—particularly an increase in right-of-way space available to pedestrians—and want to see parking strategies that complement the newly multimodal Downtown, with infrastructure supporting walking, biking, micro-mobility and transit.

- **Maximize On-Street Parking Efficiencies:** The community views on-street parking as a critical resource and wants to see efforts to increase turnover and make these spaces more available to those who need them most, like customers and visitors.
- Address Options for Long-Term Parking: Downtown employees and residents without off-street parking options have continually shown an interest in more options for long-term and overnight parking.
- **Focus on Enforcement:** The business community particularly is very invested in active enforcement that results in turnover on the street.
- Focus on Signage: Many community members expressed confusion about what parking options are available to them and indicated that more communication—both on-the-ground and via digital formats—is necessary.
- **Leverage Technology:** Mobile applications, digital signage, and automated enforcement are all supported by the community to enhance predictability and user experience.
- Improve Maintenance and Safety: Many community members expressed frustration at poor maintenance, lighting and safety in public parking lots.

A narrative analysis of community collaboration is included in **Appendix A**. Detailed raw responses from the public and business community are provided in **Appendix H** and **Appendix I**, respectively.
# **Budget Analysis**

The current parking management system relies on response-based, inconsistent enforcement as its sole source of revenue, and generates less than \$20,000 each year. The system necessitates a significant amount of expense both in administration and personnel costs across multiple City departments, and in operating and maintenance expenses for the City's parking assets. The City's surface lots are also overdue for substantial maintenance and repairs, which have been deferred for years due to a lack of funding. Currently, cost recovery for the system is projected at roughly 1%; cost recovery is projected to remain stable at roughly 1% for the foreseeable future assuming no changes are made.

All projections are general and budget-level and have been made in close coordination with City staff.

**Figure 3-2** provides a summary of the projections for each timeframe (near-term and over five years) and parking management approach (existing/current and recommended).

## Figure 3-2: Budget Analysis Summary

	Existing- Near-	Existing- 5 Years	Recommended-	Recommended- 5
	Term		Near-Term	Years
Projected Annual Revenues	\$20,000	\$20,000	\$490,000	\$540,000
Projected Annual Expenses	\$1,400,000	\$2,100,000	\$1,630,000	\$1,960,000
Projected Cost Recovery %	1%	1%	30%	27%

Note that cost recovery for the recommended management system is projected to hover around 30% and diminish slightly over time to a steady level of 25%. This shrinking in cost recovery is because parking enforcement is not intended as a revenue-generating endeavor but rather a turnover strategy. As such, as enforcement strengthens and improves, compliance will increase and revenues from violations will decrease and level off.

Leveraging paid parking for on-street parking options would increase cost recovery substantially within five years, by a projected margin of 15% compared to enforcement alone. Paid parking revenues would also generally grow over time, rather than decrease and level as with enforcement citation revenues.

# CURRENT PARKING MANAGEMENT SYSTEM—TODAY

The following figure shows existing estimated expenditures on the parking system based on the current parking management approach, in 2023 dollars. Figures have been rounded to the nearest \$10,000.

REVENUES		
Revenue Type	Annual Revenue	Description
Parking Violation Fine Revenue	\$20,000	Estimated revenue collected from tickets issued in Downtown Loveland in 2022, based on data provided by the Police Department (assumes that all tickets issued were paid).
ONGOING COSTS		
Expense Type	Annual Expense	Description
Administration and Personnel Costs	(\$390,000)	Administrative costs and staff time from various departments and agencies that support the parking system, including Public Works, Police, Development Services, Economic Development, Municipal Court, the DDA, Finance, the City Manager's office, and the City Attorney's office. Complete details for current expenses are provided in <b>Appendix B</b> .
Asset Maintenance Costs	(\$1,010,000)	Operations and maintenance for City parking assets, including the Foundry garage and City-owned surface lots, as well as necessary maintenance and sweeping for Downtown on-street parking resources.

## TOTAL CURRENT ONGOING SPEND

Under the current system, the City currently spends about **\$1,400,000** in ongoing annual expenses for parking.

## **COST RECOVERY**

Under the current system, the City only recoups about 1% of its ongoing annual expenses for parking.

# **CAPITAL (ONE-TIME) COSTS**

Expense Type	Total Spend	Description
Jefferson Garage Capital Contribution	\$12,000,000	The City's estimated total capital
		contribution to the construction of
		the Jefferson garage.

Page 17 of 43

# CURRENT PARKING MANAGEMENT SYSTEM—FIVE YEAR OUTLOOK

The following figure shows projected annual expenditures on the parking system based on the current parking management approach for each year over the next five years, in 2023 dollars. Figures have been rounded to the nearest \$10,000.

Revenue Type	Annual Revenue	Description
Parking Violation Fine Revenue	\$20,000	Estimated revenue collected from tickets issued in Downtown Loveland in 2027, based on data provided by the Police Department (assumes that all tickets issued are paid, and also assumes a 1% annual growth rate in tickets issued.
ONGOING COSTS	A	Description
Administration and Personnel Costs	(\$480,000)	Administrative costs and staff time from various departments and agencies that support the parking system, including Public Works, Police, Development Services, Economic Development, Municipal Court, the DDA, Finance, the City Manager's office, and the City Attorney's office. Assumes 4% annual inflation.
Asset Maintenance Costs	(\$1,630,000)	Operations and maintenance for City parking assets, including the Foundry and the Jefferson garages and City-owned surface lots, as well as necessary maintenance and sweeping for Downtown on-street parking resources. Also assumes operations and maintenance for an additional City-owned public parking structure of roughly 400 spaces.

#### TOTAL ONGOING SPEND

Under the current system, the City is projected to spend about \$2,110,000 in ongoing annual expenses for parking in five years.

# COST RECOVERY

Under the current system, the City is projected to recoup about 1% of its ongoing annual expenses for parking.

Expense Type	Total Spend	Description
Deferred Maintenance	\$275,000	Deferred maintenance for existing
		City-owned surface lots, per Public
		Works estimate, plus inflation in
		materials costs.
New Garage Capital Contribution	\$13,500,000	The City's estimated total capital
		contribution for construction of a
		new public garage of roughly 400
		spaces.

Page 18 of 43

#### PROPOSED PARKING MANAGEMENT SYSTEM—TODAY AND NEAR-TERM (WITHIN 3 YEARS)

The proposed parking management system will generate a relatively consistent revenue stream from active parking enforcement and fines resulting from violations. While expenses will grow as staff are added to support this active parking management framework, they will be consolidated primarily under the new Parking Services Division under the Public Works department, with other departments only contributing in small ways throughout the year under their own budgets. Cost recovery for the system under this new framework is projected to hover around 30% and diminish slightly over time to a steady level of 25%. This shrinking in cost recovery is because parking enforcement is not chiefly a revenue-generating endeavor, and as enforcement strengthens and improves, compliance will increase and revenues from violations will decrease and level off.

The following figure shows projected annual expenditures of the parking system within a three-year period if managed as recommended, in 2023 dollars. Figures have been rounded to the nearest \$10,000.

REVENUES		
Revenue Type	Annual Revenue	Description
Parking Violation Fine Revenue	\$490,000	Estimated revenue collected from tickets issued in Downtown Loveland during the first full year of enforcement. <sup>3</sup>
ONGOING COSTS		
Expense Type	Annual Expense	Description
Administration and Personnel Costs	(\$580,000)	Administrative, standard operating costs and staff time primarily from the new parking division, as well as from various departments and agencies that support the parking system, including Development Services, Economic Development, Municipal Court, the DDA, Finance, the City Manager's office, and the City Attorney's office. See <b>Figure 4-</b> <b>1</b> for staff assumptions for the new division.
Asset Maintenance Costs	(\$1,050,000)	Operations and maintenance for City parking assets, including the Foundry and the Jefferson garages and City-owned surface lots, as well as necessary maintenance and sweeping for Downtown on-street parking resources. This includes an additional allocation to support industry standard maintenance for parking assets.

# TOTAL ONGOING SPEND

Under the proposed system, the City currently will spend about **\$1,630,000** in ongoing annual expenses for parking.

# COST RECOVERY

Under the current system, the City will recoup about **30%** of its ongoing annual expenses for parking once the enforcement system is fully operational.

Expense Type	Total Spend	Description
Jefferson Garage Capital Contribution	\$12,000,000	The City's total capital contribution
		Jefferson garage.
Enforcement Vehicle	\$50,000	Vehicle for conducting parking enforcement activities
License Plate Recognition Camera System	\$50,000	Industry-standard automated
Signage and Wayfinding	\$250,000	
	\$250,000	
TOTAL	<b>\$12,350,000</b>	

Page 20 of 43

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Estimated based on recommended fine schedule (**Figure 4-2**), assuming 30 violations per day and 9,360 violations per calendar year (based on an average of 6 days of enforcement per week).

## PROPOSED PARKING MANAGEMENT—FIVE YEAR OUTLOOK

The following figure shows projected annual expenditures of the parking system within a five-year period if managed as recommended, in 2023 dollars. Figures have been rounded to the nearest \$10,000.

REVENUES		
Revenue Type	Annual Revenue	Description
Parking Violation Fine Revenue	\$540,000	Estimated revenue collected from tickets issued in Downtown Loveland during the first full year of enforcement. <sup>4</sup>
ONGOING ANNUAL COSTS		
Expense Type	Annual Expense	Description
Administration and Personnel Costs	(\$760,000)	Administrative, standard operating costs and staff time primarily from the new parking division, as well from various departments and agencies that support the parking system, including Development Services, Economic Development, Municipal Court, the DDA, Finance, the City Manager's office, and the City Attorney's office. See <b>Figure 4-</b> <b>1</b> for staff assumptions for the new division.
Asset Maintenance Costs	(\$1,200,000)	Operations and maintenance for City parking assets, including the Foundry and the Jefferson garages and City-owned surface lots, as well as necessary maintenance and sweeping for Downtown on-street parking resources. This includes an additional allocation to support industry standard maintenance for parking assets.

#### TOTAL ONGOING SPEND

Under the proposed system, the City currently is projected to spend about \$1,960,000 in ongoing annual expenses for parking.

# **COST RECOVERY**

Under the proposed system, the City is projected to recoup about 27% of its ongoing annual expenses in five years.

Expense Type	Total Spend	Description
Foundry Garage Access Technology and Automated Parking Guidance System	\$700,000	User-focused technology upgrades for the Foundry garage.
Additional Enforcement Vehicle	\$60,000	Additional enforcement vehicle to support efficient enforcement of managed areas.
Additional License Plate Recognition Camera System with Vehicle Mount	\$60,000	Additional LPR setup to support efficient enforcement of managed areas.
General Automated Parking Guidance System	\$700,000	Digital signage and parking guidance system for the City's garages.
TOTAL	\$1,520,000	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Estimated based on recommended fine schedule (**Figure 4-2**), assuming 2% growth in the number of violations each year due to population/visitor growth, and fines increased each year at CPI.

# POTENTIAL COST AND REVENUE IMPLICATIONS: PAID PARKING

#### **REVENUE IMPLICATIONS**

The following figure shows projected impacts to annual parking system revenue over a 5-year period if paid parking is implemented, in 2023 dollars. Figures have been rounded to the nearest \$10,000.

Revenue Type	Annual Revenue	Description
Parking Violation Fine Revenue	(130,000)	Projected decrease in parking violation fine revenue given focus on paid parking as the primary management strategy to encourage turnover.
Paid Parking Revenue	\$420,000	Estimated paid parking revenue assuming industry average returns (per the International Parking and Mobility Institute) with paid parking implemented in high- demand on-street areas comprising roughly 300 spaces. This level of revenue would necessitate a base rate of \$1.00/hour.

### **COST IMPLICATIONS**

Expense Type	Annual Expense	Description
Paid Parking Meter System Maintenance	(\$2,000)	Standard system maintenance and
and Transaction Fees		transaction fee costs from the
		vendor.

## TOTAL ONGOING SPEND

Under a paid parking system, the City currently is projected to spend about \$1,960,000 in ongoing annual expenses for parking once the system is fully operational.

# COST RECOVERY IMPLICATIONS

Under a paid parking system, the City would recoup about 42% of its ongoing annual expenses in five years—an increase of 15% compared to enforcement alone. While the cost recovery level for an enforcement-only system will gradually decrease and then stabilize, the cost recovery level for a paid parking system is projected to increase if rates are regularly evaluated and set at market levels.

ADDITIONAL CAPITAL (ONE-TIME) COSTS		
Expense Type	Total Spend	Description
Parking Meters	\$350,000	Rough estimate assuming meter coverage for an inventory of 300
		paid on-street spaces.

Page 22 of 43

# Parking Management in Peer Communities

**Figure 3-3** provides an overview of how peer communities in Northern Colorado—including the cities of Fort Collins, Longmont and Greeley—manage their parking assets. A more detailed analysis is provided in **Appendix F**.

Population	Fort Collins 170,000	<b>Longmont</b> 100,000	<b>Greeley</b> 110,000
(Rounded) Parking Inventory (Rounded)	2,700	1,900	2,000
Management Tools	gement Paid parking in Manually off-street garages, enforced time License Plate limited parking, Recognition- permit parking for enforced time- employees and limited parking, residents permit parking for employees and residents		Paid parking on- street, License Plate Recognition- enforced time- limited parking, permit parking for employees and residents
Annual Revenue (Rounded)	\$3,000,000	\$130,000	\$244,100
Cost Recovery⁵	94%	Estimated at <15%	112%
Community Benefits	Insufficient revenue generated to fund additional programs, largely because on-street parking is unpaid; however, parking management generally contributes to community quality of life and economic vitality. While the DDA is not involved in parking enforcement, the DDA has	Similar to Loveland, Longmont does not currently have an active parking management program, so no major community benefits are realized. The only revenues generated by the Longmont system are from citations, which are relatively minimal compared to system expenditures on	Funds streetscape improvements and long-term maintenance to parking structures and other transportation assets; generally contributes to community quality of life and economic vitality.

rigule 3-3. Feel community ranking management overview
--------------------------------------------------------

\_\_\_\_\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The percentage of annual operating expenses that revenues cover

contributed funds staffing, to construct maintenance and public parking more. . structures and for employee parking programs.

# Impacts and Best Practices for Mobility-Impaired Community Members

Managed and enforced parking is essential to ensuring proper usage of ADA parking spaces, communicating ADA options to those with ADA placards, and alleviating strain on the most close-in and convenient spaces so they may be used more frequently by those with mobility challenges. The ADA provides rights-of-way accessibility guidelines only regarding on-street parking, found within the *Proposed Accessibility Guidelines for Pedestrian Facilities in the Public Right-of-Way*, publication, dated July 26, 2011. While these guidelines have yet to be amended into law, municipalities are strongly encouraged to follow them to the best of their ability. The guidelines indicate required accessible on-street parking spaces be provided whenever parking is marked; therefore, within a majority of Downtown Loveland, the ADA guidelines should be followed. The following table is adapted from the referenced document showing the number of spaces per block to be provided. Based on Loveland's on-street inventory, this would generally require one to two accessible spaces per block face.

#### GUIDELINES FOR ACCESSIBLE ON-STREET PARKING

Total Number of Marked or Metered Parking Spaces on Block Perimeter	Minimum Required Number of Accessible Parking Spaces
1 to 25	1
26 to 50	2
51 to 75	3
76 to 100	4
101 to 150	5
151 to 200	6
201 and over	4% of total

#### Figure 3-4: Proposed Accessibility Guidelines—On-Street

Source: 2019, Proposed Accessibility Guidelines for Pedestrian Facilities in the Public Right-of-Way, Table R216

Walker recommends that those conducting parking enforcement not only enforce time limits, but also to enforce the Americans with Disabilities Act Guidelines (ADAG) by ensuring that any person using an ADA stall has a visible ADA placard and/or license plate.

In some cases, the City of Loveland has only one accessible space per block, rather than per block face; in some areas (e.g., primarily residential areas abutting Downtown with no parking management or time limits) there are no designated ADA spaces at all. As the City begins to formally manage its parking, Walker recommends following these guidelines.

However, inventory is only one of many guidelines for ADA spaces; others include van accessibility, slope, pedestrian path, and signage. Walker recommends that the City pursue an ADA audit every 5-7 years—particularly if ADA inventory is changed—to ensure that the provided accessibility options are in line with the current guidelines and requirements. This audit should be performed by a reputable firm with expertise in compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act Guidelines, and should constitute a review of inventory, walking distance path, signage, slope, and vehicular access, at minimum<sup>6</sup>. A reputable firm with suitable qualifications should perform this audit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> For more information on the guidelines for ADA parking and details on ADA audits, refer to <u>https://www.parking.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/TPP-2015-11-The-Americans-with-Disabilities-Act-ADA-and-Parking.pdf</u>

# **Chapter 4: Strategies and Actions**

This section outlines strategies recommended for various components of the Downtown parking system—foundational, short-term parking and curb management, long-term parking management, and regulatory amendments through the Unified Development Code. Each strategy includes recommended action steps to facilitate implementation.

# **Strategy Type 1: Foundational**

**Foundational strategies** lay the groundwork for intentional and strategic parking management in Downtown Loveland and set up the administrative framework for the parking system. All foundational strategies should be achieved within the next year to support the continued progress of the parking and mobility system.

Guiding Principle	Foundational Strategy Support
Be responsive to and supportive of a diverse range	Creates a supportive policy and staffing
of user behaviors, needs and choices.	framework to better understand and respond
	to user needs.
Focus on welcoming, user-friendly, and efficient	Creates a supportive policy, staffing
customer service for all user types.	framework, and budget to improve parking
	management techniques.
Prioritize customer and visitor parking Downtown	Builds resources that can help all parkers,
while supporting options for longer-term parkers,	including dedicated staff and infrastructure,
like employees and residents.	like signage and software tools.
Achieve a reasonable level of cost recovery in	Sets cost recovery goals and a clear plan to
maintaining and managing the parking system.	achieve them.
Key Community Feedback Theme	Foundational Strategy Support
Get something done.	Builds the staffing capacity and support
	necessary to focus on parking in the short-
	term and the long-term. Hiring a Parking
	Services Division Manager will be particularly
	responsive to this feedback.
Support other modes.	Foundational strategies do not focus on this
	feedback theme.
Maximize on-street parking efficiency.	Creates the foundational tools—including
	staffing and policy—necessary to maximize
	the efficiency of on-street parking resources.
Address options for long-term parking.	Creates the foundational tools necessary—
	including staffing and policy—to sustain
	effective long-term parking options.
Focus on enforcement.	Creates staffing and policy for effective
	enforcement.
Focus on signage.	Initiates development of a comprehensive
	parking signage program.

Leverage technology.	Invests in the technology needed to conduct strong enforcement, direct parkers to appropriate parking locations, and more.
Improve maintenance and safety.	Creates staffing and policy for improved maintenance and safety for parking facilities.

**STRATEGY 1.1:** Create a Parking Services Division within the Public Works Department. This Division will be primarily responsible for developing and implementing parking and mobility policies and managing/maintaining the parking and mobility system. The parking and mobility system will include all parking assets managed by the City and made available to the public or portions of the public and could also include management of transportation demand management programs and policies pursued by the City. All duties related to the parking system—including enforcement currently conducted by the Police Department—will become the responsibility of this new department.

**WHY?** The City of Loveland spends roughly \$1 million per year on providing Downtown parking services, spent by over eight departments and governmental bodies. This figure is expected to grow if and when the City adds more public parking to its system. Despite this significant expense, the parking system is not functioning optimally. At its core, this is because of a lack of intentional interest in the system and its operation since no one department is solely responsible for the system's success. Building a separate division is a foundational first step in strategic, long-term resource management and allocation for the parking system, and is a predicate for implementing any active parking management strategies that will benefit the end user.

Action		Month											
ACTION	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
1. Create Division Charter													
2. Set Target Cost Recovery													
3. Hire and Onboard a Division Manager													
4. Create and Implement a Data													
Collection Protocol													
5. Hire and Train Enforcement Officer													

# STRATEGY ACTIONS AND TIMELINE

Action 1.1.1: Create a division charter detailing the department's purpose, objectives and functions.

Action 1.1.2: Set a target level of cost recovery for the department (what percentage of funding will be generated by revenues created by the department's activities, and what percentage will be supported by the General Fund). Based on the budget analysis (pages 13-18), a cost recovery target of **25%** is recommended for enforcement-only parking management. If and when paid parking is pursued, a cost recovery target of **50%** is recommended.

Currently, the City manages the parking system using the General Fund. Setting a level of cost recovery will establish a reasonable expectation for how much revenue should be generated by the parking system and the extent to which this revenue pays for necessary operations, maintenance, and capital costs. Setting this level will help establish goals and strategies for the parking system today and well into the future and will support the replenishment of the General Fund.

Action 1.1.3: Hire a division manager.

**Action 1.1.4:** Create and implement a data collection protocol. Whether data collection is conducted by existing City staff, contracted through a vendor, or some combination of the options, a detailed data collection plan should be developed to guide this intensive effort. A data collection plan should specify:

- Who is collecting data
- When will data be collected
- What method of collection is to be used
- Where data collection will occur
- How results will be analyzed and presented

Data collection should first be prioritized within the Downtown core. To support efficient use of city resources, data collection should be concentrated on areas known to have parking pressures or land use conditions that are known to contribute to parking and transportation pressures.

Given that Loveland's typical busy periods for parking occupancy occur in summer and previous data collection efforts have generally occurred in July and August, the City might consider a data collection push in the summer months. Staff should select areas to cover each week over a 6- to 8-week period, with data collected on typical, non-event weekdays and weekends in the morning, afternoon, evening and late evening (after 10 p.m.). weekday afternoons (12 p.m.—2 p.m.) and late evenings (after 10 p.m.). As these duties will be predictable but outside of regular duties for Parking Services Division positions, it is recommended that the division use regular volunteer time and overtime support from the Public Works Department to complete this task. Alternatively, the City has the option to contract out the data collection.

The following data should be collected:

- **Parking Inventory:** The number of spaces available by block/facility, and any restrictions applicable to each space (ADA, reserved, emergency vehicles only, loading/unloading, etc.)
- **Parking Occupancy**. For each hour data is collected, the number and percentage of occupied spaces.
- Average Turnover or Dwell Time. The average turnover of the area of interest indicates dwell times or the time a vehicle remains parked or staged.

**Action 1.1.5:** Hire and train an enforcement officer to support an effective parking management system. At Year 5, a second enforcement officer should be considered.

Position	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5
Division Manager (EO4)	\$137,700	\$143,200	\$148,900	\$154,800	\$161,039

# Figure 4-1: Parking Services Division 5-Year Conceptual Staffing Plan

Enforcement Officer 1 (NO2)	\$71,400	\$74,300	\$77,200	\$80,315
Enforcement Officer 2 (NO2)				\$80,315
IT Support (0.5 FTE)	\$17,900	\$18,600	\$19,300	\$20,100

Figure 4-2: Parking Services Division 5-Year Organizational Chart



**STRATEGY 1.2:** Build a robust and consistent signage and wayfinding program for all parking facility options.

**WHY?** While the City has substantial, well-planned wayfinding signage to key destinations at traveler decision points, the parking system signage is inconsistent and sporadic. In particular, the Foundry garage does not have signage that indicates its status as a public facility, and the signage is aesthetically different from other parking signage throughout the community. Over the years, community members have repeatedly expressed confusion about where to park, what parking locations are public, and whether they can park at the Foundry.

#### STRATEGY ACTIONS AND TIMELINE

Action		Month											
Action	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
1. Create and Place Foundry Sign													
2. Review Draft Signage and Wayfinding													
Package													
3. Develop and Issue RFP; Review													
Responses and Award													

Action 1.2.1: Create and place a fixed "Public Parking" sign at the Foundry in keeping with existing public parking signage at City lots.

Action 1.2.2: Review draft signage and wayfinding packages provided in previous planning efforts (see Appendix C).

**Action 1.2.3:** Develop and issue a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) for cohesive signage and wayfinding package creation, development and installation based on the guidance provided in **Appendix C**. The RFQ should include the following and should be posted publicly and issued directly to reputable firms that focus on municipal branding and signage. Since the City will already have a good sense of scope of work for the signage design and installation, an RFQ would be the best option to gather a list of well-qualified firms and achieve the most competitive price.

- Evaluate existing analysis and conceptual sign packages for Downtown Loveland.
- Incorporate existing analysis and existing wayfinding and Downtown branding, develop a signage concept and full sing type array.
- Develop an opinion of probable costs for construction and asset management.
- Prepare a sign location plan and sign message schedule and develop a phasing plan.
- Develop a final estimate for construction and asset management costs.
- Prepare bid package for sign installation and manage vendor process.
- Review shop drawings, color samples and proofs and coordinate with vendors to ensure quality and alignment with signage plans.
- Conduct an inspection and punch list.

• Develop a wayfinding and signage reference manual documenting installed signage and locations.

WHAT IS AN AUTOMATED PARKING GUIDANCE SYSTEM? Automated Parking Guidance Systems are signage and wayfinding systems that use technology to monitor parking occupancy and display available parking to guide people to available facilities, areas, or even individual spaces. Action 1.2.4: Consider procurement of an Automated Parking Guidance System (APGS)<sup>7</sup> for the City's parking structures to help enhance user experience, encourage parking in the structures, and reduce excessive vehicular circulation and congestion.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See Appendix D

# Strategy Type 2: Short-Term Parking and Curb Management

**Short Term Parking and Curb Management strategies** are essential to supporting customers, visitors, and general business activity in Downtown Loveland. These strategies help to maximize existing parking inventory, contribute to a positive user experience, balance competing demands at the curb from parking vehicles, delivery drivers, and more, and slow pressure to add expensive new inventory to the system.

Guiding Principle	Foundational Strategy Support
Be responsive to and supportive of a diverse range of user behaviors, needs and choices.	Leverages technology, communication, and enforcement to support various short-term parking needs, like shopping, dining, running errands or attending a meeting.
Focus on welcoming, user-friendly, and efficient customer service for all users.	Promotes transparent, simple, and user- friendly parking management techniques to facilitate turnover while increasing compliance over time.
Prioritize customer and visitor parking Downtown while supporting options for longer-term parkers, like employees and residents.	Uses active enforcement and communication to free up high-demand on-street spaces for customer and visitor parking Downtown.
Achieve a reasonable level of cost recovery in maintaining and managing the parking system.	Can increase fine-based revenues over time, although only paid short-term parking can push cost recovery to levels over 50%.
Key Community Feedback Theme	Foundational Strategy Support
Get something done.	Strategies and action steps will enable immediate incorporation of enforcement as an effective turnover strategy to reduce on- street parking congestion.
Support other modes.	Short-term parking and curb management strategies support effective use of the curb space and facilitate an improved and more balanced environment for other travel choices.
Maximize on-street parking efficiency.	These strategies specifically focus on turnover to increase efficiency of on-street parking and reduce demand hot spots that cause user frustration.
Address options for long-term parking.	While these strategies do not specifically focus on long-term parking options, they do encourage long-term parkers to find alternatives in the system and open up on- street space for customers and visitors.
Focus on enforcement.	Builds an enforcement program to encourage turnover and maximize on-street parking inventory.

Focus on signage.	These strategies do not specifically advance this community feedback theme.
Leverage technology.	Uses state-of-the-art technology to support turnover of on-street spaces.
Improve maintenance and safety.	These strategies do not specifically advance this community feedback theme.

#### NEAR-TERM (WITHIN THE NEXT YEAR)

**STRATEGY 2.1:** Enact uniform 2-hour limits on-street throughout Downtown and enforce on a regular schedule using license plate recognition (LPR) technology.

#### STRATEGY ACTIONS AND TIMELINE

Action -		Month											
		2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
1. Amend City Ordinance													
2. Acquire Enforcement Vehicle and LPR													
3. Develop Route and Schedule Plan													
4. Inform and Educate the Public													

Action 2.1.1: Amend City Ordinance 10.20 to specifically list parking infractions, including unauthorized parking and overtime parking, and state that both the vehicle owner and driver are jointly and severally liable for parking violations.

Action 2.2.2: Acquire enforcement vehicle and vehicle-mounted License Plate Recognition (LPR)<sup>8</sup> camera enforcement system.

Action 2.2.3: Develop a route and schedule plan based on data collection conducted per Strategy 1.1.

Action 2.2.4: Inform and educate the public on enforcement program using the City website, the Let's Talk Loveland platform, and social media. Communication should include a description of the enforcement policy, the Parking Management one-pager (**Appendix E**), and details about the graduated fines policy. WHAT IS LICENSE PLATE RECOGNITION ENFORCEMENT? License Plate Recognition systems use a camera that converts a vehicle's license plate number into text data and automatically recognizes if the vehicle has overstayed an assigned parking time limit, or has been involved in another parking violation (e.g., parking in an unauthorized area). Many Colorado communities use LPR enforcement, including Fort Collins, Denver, and Greeley. The many benefits of LPR systems are listed as a footnote on this page.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> The benefits of LPR /ANPR include:

<sup>1.</sup> Decreased overhead costs through virtual permitting and reduced patrolling resources

<sup>2.</sup> Increased revenue through improved compliance, fewer scofflaws, and easier violation identification

<sup>3.</sup> Better parking management with improved access to limited parking spaces

<sup>4.</sup> Enhanced customer experiences with gate-less entry options for better access to spaces

<sup>5.</sup> Automatic plate recognition reduces staff overhead and improves operations

<sup>6.</sup> Maintain vehicle watch lists supplied by local police departments

Action 2.2.5: Implement enforcement protocol, beginning at the start of Year 2. For the first 90 days, only issue warnings to violators.

**STRATEGY 2.2:** Update the parking violation fine structure and policy to support a first-time violator warning program and graduated fines for repeat violations—meaning that fines increase with each subsequent violation within a calendar year.

#### STRATEGY ACTIONS AND TIMELINE

Action		Month												
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
1.	Finalize and Post Updated Fine Schedule													
2.	Consider Alternative Payment Methods													

Action 2.2.1: Finalize and post an updated fine schedule reflecting a 25% increase for each violation after the first, up until the third violation, and a 50% increase for the fourth and subsequent violations. The following fine schedule is recommended for standard violations (parking in an unauthorized area, such as a sign marked "No Parking", or parking for longer than posted time limits). Authorize an annual increase in fines at the Consumer Price Index (CPI) level. **Figure 4-3** shows a recommended fine schedule for standard violations.

#### Figure 4-3: Recommended Standard Parking Violation Fine Schedule

		1 <sup>st</sup> Violation 2 <sup>nd</sup> Violation		3 <sup>rd</sup> Violation	4 <sup>th</sup> + Violation								
Stando	ard Fine (1)	\$40	\$50	\$62.50	\$93.75								
(1)	(1) Applicable for standard parking violations, such as overstaying a time limit or parking in a loading/unloading zone or												
	along a curb cut. This Plan recommends that the City maintain its current fines for ADA parking violations (\$150) and												
	weight limit viol	ations in residential areas	(\$100).										

Action 2.2.2: Consider alternative payment methods, such as a <u>food drive</u> wherein parking fines can be eliminated or reduced in exchange for non-perishable food donations, for 1<sup>st</sup> time violators of basic infractions like overstaying a time limit.

**STRATEGY 2.3:** Identify and demarcate on-street spaces intended for very short-term stays (e.g., for commercial delivery or pick-up and drop-off by Uber, Lyft, or a passenger vehicle) on a demand-evidenced basis and support these stays through signage and enforcement. Generally, an inventory of roughly 1 loading/delivery space per block is recommended in high-activity areas, such as along 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> streets.

#### STRATEGY ACTIONS AND TIMELINE

Action		Month											
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
3.	Finalize and Post Updated Fine Schedule												
4.	Consider Alternative Payment Methods												

Action 2.3.1: Demarcate and sign designated loading/pick-up and drop-off spaces based on data collection conducted per Strategy 1.1.

Action 2.3.2: Inform and educate the public about loading/pick-up and drop-off spaces via the following mediums:

Action 2.3.3: Integrate enforcement of loading/pick-up and drop-off spaces into standard enforcement route.

# MID-TERM (WITHIN THE NEXT THREE TO FIVE YEARS)

**STRATEGY 2.4:** Establish paid on-street parking in the "core" of Downtown, where activity and demand are highest. Set rates and future increases in a manner commensurate to the density and scale of Downtown Loveland and the targeted level of cost recovery for the parking system. For the budget analysis (pages 13-18) it is assumed and recommended that paid parking implementation begin in high-demand on-street areas such as along 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> streets between Railroad and Washington, and along Railroad, Cleveland, Lincoln, Jefferson and Washington between 3<sup>rd</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> streets with an initial rate of \$1.00 per hour. These areas that contain roughly 300 spaces. This recommendation is based on previously conducted parking demand analyses.

## STRATEGY ACTIONS

**Action 2.4.1:** Enact an ordinance change to Article 10 of the Loveland Municipal Code to allow the City to set and charge rates for on-street parking. The following is recommended:

"The City Public Works Director has the authority to establish parking rates to be charged at parking meters, pay stations or devices regulating stopping or parking a vehicle, within rate limits established by this section. Rates may vary according to location, time of day, maximum parking time allowed, parking demand, or other factors determined by the City."

An initial rate range of \$0.75 at a minimum and \$4.00 at a maximum per hour is recommended.

**Action 2.4.2:** Determine the location of paid parking stations based on data collection protocols as established in Strategy 1.1.

Action 2.4.3: Develop, issue, and award an RFQ for pay station procurement. It is recommended that the City consider a hybrid solution that can accept coin/cash, credit card, and mobile application payments. Certain well-established vendors offer both single-space and multi-space meter solutions that include mobile application integration, cash payment options, validation options, and variable pricing options in their off-the-shelf systems.

For the budget analysis (page 13-18), we've assumed single-space meters with integrated cash and mobile payment options.

Action 2.4.4: Inform and educate the public about loading/pick-up and drop-off spaces via the City's website, the Let's Talk Loveland platform, and social media.

# Strategy Type 3: Long-Term Parking Management

**Long-term parking management strategies** are responsive to a frequently expressed desire among Downtown employees, business owners and residents for more long-term parking options, including overnight parking options. These strategies are essential to support increased management and turnover in on-street parking areas (as described in the Short-Term Parking Management section) by offering clear and appropriate options for those seeking to park for longer periods of time. Mid-term strategies will also help reduce pressure on surrounding residential neighborhoods if and when the City chooses to transition to a paid parking strategy.

Guiding Frincipie	Foundational Strategy Support							
Be responsive to and supportive of a diverse range	Leverages technology, communication, and							
of user behaviors, needs and choices.	enforcement to support a wide variety of							
	long-term parking needs.							
Focus on welcoming, user-friendly, and efficient	Promotes transparent, simple, and user-							
customer service for all users.	friendly parking management techniques to							
	allocate and enforce appropriate parking							
	locations for every long-term user.							
Prioritize customer and visitor parking Downtown	Supports clearly-articulated, well-managed							
while supporting options for longer-term parkers,	options for Downtown employees, residents,							
like employees and residents.	and others parking for longer (4+ hour) stays.							
Achieve a reasonable level of cost recovery in	Can increase revenues via parking permits to							
maintaining and managing the parking system.	cover operational and administrative costs,							
	but paid short-term parking is needed to push							
	cost recovery over 50%.							
Key Community Feedback Theme	Foundational Strategy Support							
Get something done.	Strategies and action steps will enable better,							
	and an analysis and the second state in a state in the second state is a second state in the second state is a							
	safer, and more well-maintained options for							
	long-term parkers.							
Support other modes.	long-term parkers. Some strategies—like the tiered employee							
Support other modes.	Some strategies—like the tiered employee parking permit program—will support							
Support other modes.	Some strategies—like the tiered employee parking permit program—will support commuting choice and use of other modes of							
Support other modes.	Some strategies—like the tiered employee parking permit program—will support commuting choice and use of other modes of travel.							
Support other modes. Maximize on-street parking efficiency.	safer, and more well-maintained options for long-term parkers. Some strategies—like the tiered employee parking permit program—will support commuting choice and use of other modes of travel. These strategies provide clear and convenient							
Support other modes. Maximize on-street parking efficiency.	Some strategies—like the tiered employee parking permit program—will support commuting choice and use of other modes of travel. These strategies provide clear and convenient options for long-term parkers, which will							
Support other modes. Maximize on-street parking efficiency.	safer, and more well-maintained options for long-term parkers. Some strategies—like the tiered employee parking permit program—will support commuting choice and use of other modes of travel. These strategies provide clear and convenient options for long-term parkers, which will encourage them to find parking off the street							
Support other modes. Maximize on-street parking efficiency.	safer, and more well-maintained options for long-term parkers. Some strategies—like the tiered employee parking permit program—will support commuting choice and use of other modes of travel. These strategies provide clear and convenient options for long-term parkers, which will encourage them to find parking off the street and reduce on-street parking congestion.							
Support other modes. Maximize on-street parking efficiency. Address options for long-term parking.	Safer, and more well-maintained options for long-term parkers. Some strategies—like the tiered employee parking permit program—will support commuting choice and use of other modes of travel. These strategies provide clear and convenient options for long-term parkers, which will encourage them to find parking off the street and reduce on-street parking congestion. This community feedback theme is the focus							
Support other modes. Maximize on-street parking efficiency. Address options for long-term parking.	safer, and more well-maintained options for long-term parkers. Some strategies—like the tiered employee parking permit program—will support commuting choice and use of other modes of travel. These strategies provide clear and convenient options for long-term parkers, which will encourage them to find parking off the street and reduce on-street parking congestion. This community feedback theme is the focus of these strategies.							
Support other modes. Maximize on-street parking efficiency. Address options for long-term parking. Focus on enforcement.	safer, and more well-maintained options for long-term parkers. Some strategies—like the tiered employee parking permit program—will support commuting choice and use of other modes of travel. These strategies provide clear and convenient options for long-term parkers, which will encourage them to find parking off the street and reduce on-street parking congestion. This community feedback theme is the focus of these strategies. Builds an application and enforcement							
Support other modes. Maximize on-street parking efficiency. Address options for long-term parking. Focus on enforcement.	safer, and more well-maintained options for long-term parkers. Some strategies—like the tiered employee parking permit program—will support commuting choice and use of other modes of travel. These strategies provide clear and convenient options for long-term parkers, which will encourage them to find parking off the street and reduce on-street parking congestion. This community feedback theme is the focus of these strategies. Builds an application and enforcement protocol for long-term parkers like employees							
Support other modes. Maximize on-street parking efficiency. Address options for long-term parking. Focus on enforcement.	safer, and more Well-maintained options for long-term parkers. Some strategies—like the tiered employee parking permit program—will support commuting choice and use of other modes of travel. These strategies provide clear and convenient options for long-term parkers, which will encourage them to find parking off the street and reduce on-street parking congestion. This community feedback theme is the focus of these strategies. Builds an application and enforcement protocol for long-term parkers like employees and residents.							
Support other modes. Maximize on-street parking efficiency. Address options for long-term parking. Focus on enforcement. Focus on signage.	safer, and more well-maintained options for long-term parkers. Some strategies—like the tiered employee parking permit program—will support commuting choice and use of other modes of travel. These strategies provide clear and convenient options for long-term parkers, which will encourage them to find parking off the street and reduce on-street parking congestion. This community feedback theme is the focus of these strategies. Builds an application and enforcement protocol for long-term parkers like employees and residents. These strategies do not specifically advance							

Leverage technology.	These strategies do not specifically advance this community feedback theme.
Improve maintenance and safety.	Creates a maintenance and safety assurance for all public parking facilities.

# NEAR-TERM (WITHIN THE NEXT YEAR)

**STRATEGY 3.1:** Develop and formalize maintenance and safety assurance for all public lots and garages pursuant to appropriate industry standards (for example, the International Parking and Mobility Institute's Accredited Parking Organization Maintenance Standards).<sup>9</sup> The standards will include details regarding access conditions, pavement conditions, striping, security, lighting, and more.

#### STRATEGY ACTIONS AND TIMELINE

Action		Month											
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
1.	Fund and Conduct Deferred Maintenance												
2.	Draft Maintenance and Safety Commitment												

**Action 3.1.1:** The Public Works division has identified \$250,000 in deferred maintenance (in 2022 dollars) necessary for the safety and efficiency of existing City surface lots. Fund and conduct deferred maintenance in existing City parking facilities pursuant to Public Works Department guidance.

**Action 3.1.2:** Draft the maintenance and safety assurance for all public lots and garages. The commitment should include the following components:

- Security protocol and reporting
- Lighting standards
- Cleanliness protocol
- Striping/painting standards
- Regular on-site inspection schedule (quarterly)
- Regular structural condition assessment schedule (annual)
- Maintenance work order scheduling and tracking

Publish the commitment on the City's website.

**STRATEGY 3.2:** Implement a permit parking system for Downtown employees and residents. Set a 6-hour limit for all other users of City lots and garages designated for the permit parking program, with access granted between the hours of 5:00 a.m. and 12:00 a.m., and no access privileges between 12:00 p.m. and 5:00 a.m. except for designated users.

WHAT IS PERMIT PARKING? Permit parking provides exclusive and/or prioritized access to parking facilities for a certain user group, like employees or residents. Permit parking systems can help people understand the best parking options for them, make parking predictable and simple, and eliminate the day-to-day decision of where to park.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Appendix F

## EMPLOYEE PERMIT PARKING PROGRAM DETAILS

The Employee Permit Parking Program should initially include three pass options:

- 1. A hybrid pass for part-time and partially remote workers allowing for up to 3 days per week of parking.
- 2. A monthly unlimited permit allowing for unreserved, shared access to any designated facility.
- 3. A monthly reserved permit for a particular facility, priced at a premium.

Given that, at least in the near-term, on-street parking will remain unpaid, the City should consider incentivizing Downtown employees to use appropriate parking resources to reduce the burden on enforcement and reinforce good habits. As such, it is recommended that pass prices remain low for at least the first three years following implementation. As such, revenues are expected to be nominal in the short term.

Figure 4-4 shows a conceptual permit menu for Downtown employees.

## Figure 4-4: Downtown Employee Parking Permits—Conceptual Menu

Frice Nange (2022 Donars)
)/Month
)/Month
)/Month

END USER PAYMENTS FOR PERMITS ARE THE BEST OPTION FOR SEVERAL REASONS.

1. They help employees make individual decisions based on their actual parking needs.

2. They improve the efficiency of the program by ensuring that only people who truly need a permit can purchase one, so that inventory is not artificially reduced by many people holding permits but not actually using them.

3. They can support single-occupancy vehicle commute

Downtown employees can purchase permits individually by applying and providing payment to the City's Parking Services Division. The application should require proof of employment within the Downtown study area,<sup>10</sup> such as a W2 stub including the employer's address.

The Resident Permit Parking

Program should include two pass options: a monthly unlimited permit allowing for unreserved, shared access to any designated facility, and a monthly reserved permit for a particular facility, priced at a premium.

As with Downtown employees, Downtown residents should and must be incentivized to take advantage of appropriate off-street options while on-street parking remains unpaid. As part of this incentivization, pass prices for Downtown residents who have no other parking option should remain low for the first three years following implementation. **Figure 4-5** shows a conceptual pass menu for Downtown

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Refer to Figure 1-1 and Figure 1-2

residents. While the City may have incentive to cover parking costs for residents and offer permits free of charge, some fee is recommended to cover administrative costs associated with operating the resident pass program and ensuring that it can sustain itself over time without unrecoverable losses. If economic sensitivity and equity are concerns, the City might consider offering free-of-charge or heavily-subsidized permits to residents who make below 100% AMI or are on public assistance, for example.

# Figure 4-5: Downtown Resident Parking Permits—Conceptual Menu

Pass Type	Price Range (2022 Dollars)							
Monthly Unlimited	\$25-30/Month							
Monthly Reserved	\$40-45/Month							

As with Downtown employees, Downtown residents should purchase permits individually by submitting an application and payment to the City's Parking Services Division. The application should require proof of residence in a multifamily building within the Downtown study area<sup>11</sup>. The City must verify that the multifamily building in which the applicant lives does not offer an on-site parking option, and is reliant on public parking resources. If the applicant's building does offer on-site parking, their application should be rejected.

# STRATEGY ACTIONS AND TIMELINE

Action						Мо	onth						
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
1.	Identify Appropriate Parking Facilities												
2.	Identify Appropriate Oversell Factor and												
	Issue Permits												

**Action 3.2.1:** Identify appropriate parking facilities for inclusion in the parking permit program<sup>12</sup>. Initially, the following facilities are recommended:

- Long-term parking areas along Railroad Avenue
- Public lots at 5<sup>th</sup> and Railroad and 5<sup>th</sup> and Lincoln
- Public spaces available at the Foundry garage, as refinancing requirements allow.
- Public spaces available at the Jefferson garage, as financing requirements allow.

In total, these facilities comprise roughly 760 spaces.

Action 3.2.2: Identify an appropriate oversell factor for the parking permits. An initial oversell factor of 25% for all facilities is recommended—meaning that 25% more permits than the total number of spaces available should be sold. For the first three months following program start, collect parking utilization data monthly at typical peak times (e.g., a Wednesday at 2:00 p.m., 7:00 p.m., WHAT IS AN OVERSELL FACTOR? An oversell factor is the ratio of parking permits sold compared to the actual number of parking spaces available in the facility or facilities for which they are sold. Oversell can help maximize efficiency by granting access to more parkers and taking advantage of natural absences for example, an office worker going on week-long vacation.

and 12:00 a.m., and a Saturday at 12:00 p.m., 7:00 p.m., and 1:00 a.m.). If total facility utilization is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Refer to **Figure 1-1** and **Figure 1-2** 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Refer to **Figure 1-1** and **Figure 1-2** 

below 60% at typical peak periods, increase facility oversell by a 5% margin. If total facility utilization is at or above 80%, reduce facility oversell by a 5% margin.

Action 3.2.3: Integrate enforcement of the permit program into existing enforcement schedules using the License Plate Recognition system to ensure that only permit holders are parking in designated permit lots for more than 6 hours in a single session. This will require permit holders to provide their vehicle's license plate number to the City.

### MID-TERM (WITHIN THE NEXT THREE TO FIVE YEARS)

**STRATEGY 3.3:** Consider creating an on-street resident parking permit program in neighborhoods immediately abutting the Downtown core, where (and if) spillover impacts from Downtown parking activity, management and pricing have demonstrably intensified.

An on-street resident parking permit program is a program that allows residents to have prioritized access to street parking in their neighborhoods when demand for on-street parking is already intense, or is projected to become intense because of pending development. On-street resident parking permit programs are especially useful in older single-family neighborhoods where most homes do not have driveway or garage parking options.

Rather than adopting a program that allows for exclusive access, it is recommended that Loveland pursue a program that extends time limits for all other parkers, and allows residents to exceed time limits. This will maximize efficiency of on-street inventory by eliminating cases where the parking will be reserved for a particular user (e.g., a neighborhood resident), but not utilized.

Strong on-street resident parking permit programs are informed by key performance indicators (KPIs) that tell the City an area may benefit from such a program. If those KPIs are met, residents within those eligible areas can join together to petition for a permit program to be established and enforced.

#### STRATEGY ACTIONS

Action 3.3.1: Identify and finalize Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) for establishment of the on-street resident parking permit program.

KPIs the City should consider in establishing eligibility are summarized below.

#### **Existing Condition KPIs**

- Surrounding Land Uses. A review of this KPI should include a review of the land uses surrounding the zone to confirm that these impacts are present. Note that in some cases, parking occupancy may be the result of intensive resident development—especially multifamily development—without sufficient off-street parking to accommodate new vehicles. In this case, the solution is not a permit program, but rather such initiatives as parking code updates, and transportation demand management partnerships with private property owners/operators to reduce personal vehicle usage among residents.
- **Typical Peak Hour Parking Occupancy**. Parking occupancy within the neighborhood or zone boundary exceeds 85% during typical peak parking conditions for the zone. Note that the day and time that typical peak parking conditions occur should inform the hours of applicability for

the neighborhood or zone. For example, a zone with 95% occupancy on weekends and 65% occupancy on weekdays might have active restrictions on the weekend, with looser restrictions throughout the week.

• Average Turnover or Dwell Time. The average turnover of the area of interest indicates dwell times, or the time a vehicle remains parked or staged, exceeds the goal for the area. Based on the land use context, this goal may vary and should be set so that it accommodates the adjacent land uses supported by the on-street parking supply. Dwell time data can also be used to set or amend time limits for parkers without permits.

#### **Proactive/Pre-Condition KPIs**

• New Development and Trip Generation. Planned new developments within a zone boundary or within 3 blocks or 1500' linear feet of a zone that may impact on-street parking supplies during typical peak conditions should also be considered. New developments projected to generate 401 or more new trips to the area at the peak hour without sufficient off-street parking supply to accommodate those trips and has received approval for the parking supply may be considered for eligibility<sup>13</sup>. Existing condition KPIs should be monitored in the year following the new development's completion to ensure they are met.

Once established, existing zones should also be evaluated pursuant to their adherence to KPIs. If an existing zone does not meet the KPI thresholds for three consecutive years, the zone should be marked for "Phase Out".

**Action 3.3.2:** Develop an ordinance outlining the on-street resident parking permit program, its requirements, and enforcement. An example can be found <u>here</u> and is also included in Appendix J.

Action 3.3.3: Establish an annual on-street resident parking permit cost based on current Parking Services Division operating expenses and cost recovery goals.

Guiding Principle	Foundational Strategy Support							
Be responsive to and supportive of a diverse range of user behaviors, needs and choices.	Supports holistic, equitable integration of parking and transportation amenities and infrastructure for new development.							
Focus on welcoming, user-friendly, and efficient customer service for all users.	These strategies and actions do not directly advance this guiding principle, but they help to create an environment that is welcoming, user-friendly and efficient by requiring new development to provide appropriate parking and mobility options for their users and the public							

# Strategy Type 4: Unified Development Code Amendments

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Sufficiency of off-street parking supply should be determined in concert with the Planning Department as part of the Parking Code changes.

Prioritize customer and visitor parking Downtown while supporting options for longer-term parkers, like employees and residents.	Supports data-driven parking provision for new development Downtown—particularly for new residents.
Achieve a reasonable level of cost recovery in maintaining and managing the parking system.	Facilitates the creation of a new funding source for the Downtown parking system through a piloted in-lieu fee program.
Guiding Principle	Foundational Strategy Support
Be responsive to and supportive of a diverse range of user behaviors, needs and choices.	Leverages technology, communication, and enforcement to support a wide variety of long-term parking needs.
Focus on welcoming, user-friendly, and efficient customer service for all users.	Promotes transparent, simple, and user- friendly parking management techniques to allocate and enforce appropriate parking locations for every long-term user.
Prioritize customer and visitor parking Downtown while supporting options for longer-term parkers, like employees and residents.	Supports clearly-articulated, well-managed options for Downtown employees, residents, and others parking for longer (4+ hour) stays.
Achieve a reasonable level of cost recovery in maintaining and managing the parking system.	Can increase revenues via parking permits to cover operational and administrative costs, but paid short-term parking is needed to push cost recovery over 50%.
Key Community Feedback Theme	Foundational Strategy Support
Key Community Feedback Theme Get something done.	Foundational Strategy Support Strategies and action steps will support both near-term and long-term strategies to improve the parking and mobility environment Downtown.
Key Community Feedback Theme Get something done. Support other modes.	Foundational Strategy SupportStrategies and action steps will support bothnear-term and long-term strategies toimprove the parking and mobilityenvironment Downtown.Leverages transportation demandmanagement (TDM) solutions to create afriendly environment for all transportationchoices.
Key Community Feedback Theme         Get something done.         Support other modes.         Maximize on-street parking efficiency.	Foundational Strategy SupportStrategies and action steps will support bothnear-term and long-term strategies toimprove the parking and mobilityenvironment Downtown.Leverages transportation demandmanagement (TDM) solutions to create afriendly environment for all transportationchoices.These strategies support data-driven provisionof parking for new development to reducereliance on on-street parking, particularlyamong Downtown residents.
Key Community Feedback Theme         Get something done.         Support other modes.         Maximize on-street parking efficiency.         Address options for long-term parking.	Foundational Strategy SupportStrategies and action steps will support bothnear-term and long-term strategies toimprove the parking and mobilityenvironment Downtown.Leverages transportation demandmanagement (TDM) solutions to create afriendly environment for all transportationchoices.These strategies support data-driven provisionof parking for new development to reducereliance on on-street parking, particularlyamong Downtown residents.Facilitates better long-term parking optionsfor residents by requiring new residentialdevelopment Downtown to self-provide theparking it needs.
Key Community Feedback Theme   Get something done.   Support other modes.   Maximize on-street parking efficiency.   Address options for long-term parking.   Focus on enforcement.	Foundational Strategy SupportStrategies and action steps will support both near-term and long-term strategies to improve the parking and mobility environment Downtown.Leverages transportation demand management (TDM) solutions to create a friendly environment for all transportation choices.These strategies support data-driven provision of parking for new development to reduce reliance on on-street parking, particularly among Downtown residents.Facilitates better long-term parking options for residents by requiring new residential development Downtown to self-provide the parking it needs.These strategies do not specifically advance this community feedback theme.
Key Community Feedback Theme   Get something done.   Support other modes.   Maximize on-street parking efficiency.   Address options for long-term parking.   Focus on enforcement.   Focus on signage.	<ul> <li>Foundational Strategy Support</li> <li>Strategies and action steps will support both near-term and long-term strategies to improve the parking and mobility environment Downtown.</li> <li>Leverages transportation demand management (TDM) solutions to create a friendly environment for all transportation choices.</li> <li>These strategies support data-driven provision of parking for new development to reduce reliance on on-street parking, particularly among Downtown residents.</li> <li>Facilitates better long-term parking options for residents by requiring new residential development Downtown to self-provide the parking it needs.</li> <li>These strategies do not specifically advance this community feedback theme.</li> </ul>

Improve maintenance and safety.

These strategies do not specifically advance this community feedback theme.

**Unified Development Code Amendments strategies** are intended to build a regulatory environment conducive to a sustainable, user-friendly, and efficient parking system in Downtown Loveland today and well into the future. As Downtown continues to develop and evolve, these regulatory changes will support a parking system that can accommodate demand, augment a robust environment for other transportation choices, and contribute to a healthy and flourishing economy.

## NEAR-TERM (WITHIN THE NEXT YEAR)

**STRATEGY 4.1:** Evaluate the existing and projected impacts of the parking requirement exemption for multifamily residential development within mixed-use buildings in the General Improvement District (GID) boundary.

Within the General Improvement District boundary, no new off-street parking is currently required for any commercial or mixed-use development, even if that development includes a residential component. For example, if a development includes 10,000 square feet of ground floor retail and 50 multifamily residential units, both the retail space and the residential units are exempt from parking requirements and the developer does not have to build any parking.

This policy decision, effective for years as an downtown revitalization strategy, has also resulted in some substantial pressure on the Downtown public parking system to fulfill resident demand. Especially because residents typically require long-term, predictable, and overnight parking, this has led to conflicts between resident parking demands and the City's objectives to have an efficient and manageable parking system with readily available options for customers, visitors, and other parker types.

This strategy will allow the City to ascertain actual impacts on the parking system to determine the extent of current and projected parking demand generated by residential development within the GID, and the measures necessary to accommodate that demand—up to and including the elimination of the residential exemption.

## STRATEGY ACTIONS AND TIMELINE

Action		Month											
		2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	
1. Evaluate Parking Demand from Residential Development in GID													

Action 4.1.1: Build a list of existing and planned residential developments without on-site parking within the GID boundary, including number of units and unit mix (number of studios, one-bedrooms, twobedrooms, three-bedrooms, etc.). Project long-term parking needs using the ratios shown below in **Figure 4-5** as guidance, which are derived from the Urban Land Institute Shared Parking Model ratios, 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition. Based on this analysis, consider the following actions:

• Projected demand from residential development without on-site parking is 100 spaces or fewer: Prioritize implementation of resident parking permit program.

- **Projected demand is between 100 and 250 spaces:** Prioritize implementation of resident parking permit program and a transportation demand management plan requirement for all new residential development (see page 40)
- **Projected demand is over 250 spaces:** Prioritize implementation of resident parking permit program and consider elimination of the residential development parking exemption within the GID boundary. Implement a transportation demand management plan option to allow for reductions from the new off-street parking requirements if certain criteria are met (see page 40).

## Figure 4-5: Guidance for Multifamily Residential Parking Ratios

Unit Type	Parking Ratio Guideline
Studio/Efficiency	0.90/Unit
1-Bedroom	1.0/Unit
2-Bedroom	1.45/Unit
3-Bedroom+	1.85/Unit

Visitor parking—a short-term parking need—can and should be accommodated by the public parking options available.

**STRATEGY 4.2:** Identify transportation demand management (TDM) strategies appropriate to Loveland's unique context that would justify a reduction in parking demand and a corresponding allowance for lower parking requirements on any project where such TDM strategies are applied. As an example, the City of Fort Collins offers parking reductions for various TDM strategies in Section 3.2.2 of its Land Development Code, including a 10% reduction for providing transit passes for employees, a 10% reduction for proximity to a transit station, a 5-space reduction for each carshare space provided, and a 10% reduction for strong on-site bicycle and pedestrian infrastructure.

WHAT IS TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT (TDM)? Transportation demand management refers to programs, policies and actions that help reduce the use of personal vehicles as a primary method to get from place to place. TDM can help reduce traffic and vehicle congestion, improve air quality, and lower emissions generated by vehicles.

# STRATEGY ACTIONS AND TIMELINE

Action						Мо	onth						
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
1. Build List of TDM Strategies													
2. Hold Study Sessions													

**Action 4.2.1:** Build a list of transportation demand management (TDM) strategies with a demonstrable impact on parking demand. **Figure 4-6** provides guidance on effective TDM strategies appropriate within Loveland's context, and their corresponding typical reductive impact on parking demand.

# Figure 4-6: Effective TDM Strategies and Corresponding Parking Demand Reductions

Strategy	Applicability	Description	Typical Parking Demand Reduction
100% Subsidized Transit Passes	Any land use	Developer provides COLT/FLEX transit passes at no cost to tenants/residents.	15%
Transit Station/Stop Investment	Any land use	Developer invests in a transit station or stop on- site	1%
Circulator Contribution	Any land use	Developer funds or partially funds a shuttle or other first- and last-mile mobility option for Downtown Loveland	2%
Passenger Pick-Up/Drop- Off Area	Any land use	Developer creates an on- site pick-up and drop-off area	1%
Bikeshare Program	Any land use	Developer funds and operates, or works with a partner to operate, an on- site bikeshare program	1%
Carshare Program	Any land use	Developer funds and operates, or works with a partner to fund and operate, an on-site carshare program	3%
New Resident/Employee Kits	Residential or Office	Developer/owner provides a package for new residents and/or employees showing transit and mobility options	0.5%
Emergency Ride Home Program	Office	Developer/owner provides an emergency/guaranteed ride home program for employees who use transit, vanpool, carpool, or active transportation to get to work	1%
Vanpool/Shuttle Program	Office	Developer/owner funds and operates or works with a partner to operate a vanpool or shuttle program for employees	2%
On-Site Childcare	Office	Developer/owner provides on-site childcare for employees	1%

building grocery store, pharmacy, laundry/dry- cleaning service or bodega	On-Site Conveniences for Employees/Residents	Residential or Office	Developer/owner includes programmatic elements that support building employees and/or residents, such as in- building grocery store, pharmacy, laundry/dry- cleaning service or bodega	5%
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------	--------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----

**Action 4.2.2:** Hold study sessions with Planning Commission and City Council to share findings, gather feedback, and apply feedback to create a final list of strategies and corresponding reductions.

# MID-TERM (WITHIN THE NEXT THREE TO FIVE YEARS)

**STRATEGY 4.3:** Based on TDM strategies previously identified and vetted, develop a TDM requirement or allowance for buildings constructed within the General Improvement District Boundary to encourage new developments to participate in building a more multimodal Downtown while benefitting from corresponding reductions in parking requirements.

#### STRATEGY ACTIONS AND TIMELINE

Action					Мо	onth						
		2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
1. Create and Adopt TDM Regulation												

Action 4.2.1: Based on to-date feedback provided by Planning Commission and Council and the decisions made from findings related to the resident parking exemption, create a TDM regulation in the Unified Development Code.

If the parking exemption for residential buildings within the GID boundary is not pursued based on guidance from Strategy 4.1, consider requiring that all new development applications include submittal of a TDM plan including City-vetted strategies or other strategies pursued by the developer with a demonstrated reductive effect on parking demand. If the parking exemption is pursued, consider a TDM reduction opportunity allowing for development applications that include TDM strategies to receive a corresponding parking reduction.

While TDM can be embraced as a strategy or commitment in a master planning or strategic planning effort, writing TDM into regulation through the UDC process is the only tried-and-true way to require new development to commit to demand-mitigating TDM strategies.

# **Chapter 5: Action Step Summary**

The City of Loveland has much to accomplish to achieve its parking management goals. **Figure 5-1** shows a summary list of strategies and action steps proposed to be accomplished in the first year of implementation. Because these action steps are more fully developed and in line with available funding, a timeline for action has been provided.

#### Figure 5-1: Near Term Action Steps

		Action					Мо	nth						
		Action	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
		1. Create Division Charter												
	Strategy 1.1: Create a Parking	2. Set Target Cost Recovery												
	Services Division	3. Hire and Onboard a Division												
		Manager												
		4. Create and Implement a Data												
Foundational Strategies		Collection Protocol												
		5. Hire and Train an Enforcement												
		Officer												
		6. Create and Place Foundry Sign												
	Strategy 1.2: Build a Parking	7. Review Draft Signage and												
	Signage and Wayfinding Program 8.	Wayfinding Package												
		8. Develop and Issue RFP;												
		Review Responses and Award												
		9. Amend City Ordinance												
	Strategy 2.1: Enact and	10. Acquire Enforcement Vehicle												
	Enforce Uniform 2-Hour	and LPR												
	Time Limits On-Street	11. Develop Route and Schedule												
		Plan												
Chart Tama Daulia		12. Inform and Educate the Public												
Short-Term Parking		13. Finalize and Post Updated												
and Curb Management	Strategy 2.2: Adopt a	Fine Schedule												
Strategies	Graduated Fine Schedule	14. Consider Alternative Payment												
Sudlegies		Methods												
		15. Demarcate Loading/Pick-Up												
		Areas												

	Strategy 2.3: Identify,	16. Inform and Educate the Public						
	Demarcate and Enforce	17. Integrate Enforcement						
	Loading/Pick-Up Areas							
		18. Fund and Conduct Deferred						
	Strategy 3.1: Develop and	Maintenance						
	Formalize a Maintenance	19. Draft Maintenance and Safety						
Long-Term Parking	and Safety Commitment	Commitment						
Management	for Public Parking Facilities							
Strategies		20. Identify Appropriate Parking						
	Strategy 3.2: Implement a	Facilities						
	Permit Parking System for	21. Identify Appropriate Oversell						
	Downtown Employees and	Factor and Issue Permits						
	Residents							
	Strategy 4.1: Evaluate	22. Evaluate Parking Demand						
	Parking Impacts of Existing	from Residential Development						
	and Planned Residential	in GID						
Unified Development	Development in the							
Code Amendment	General Improvement							
Strategies	District							
	Strategy 4.2: Identify	23. Build List of TDM Strategies						
	Transportation Demand	alongside						
	Management Strategies	Community/Property Owners						
	Appropriate for Loveland	24. Hold Study Sessions						

**Figure 5-2** shows a summary list of strategies and action steps proposed to be accomplished in the next three to five years. Because these strategies are more future-oriented and depend on the successful implementation of near-term strategies, no timeline has been provided.

# Figure 5-2: Mid-Term Action Steps

		1.	Amend City Ordinance	
	Strategy 2.4: Establish On-	2.	Determine Location of Paid Parking Stations	
Short-Term Parking	Street Paid Parking in Core	3.	Develop, Issue and Award Pay Station/Technology RFP	
and Curb	Areas	4.	Inform and Educate the Public	
Management				
Strategies				
		5.	Identify and Finalize Key Performance Indicators (KPIs)	
Long-Term Parking	Strategy 3.3: Consider	6.	Develop Resident Parking Permit Program Ordinance	
Management	Creating an On-Street	7.	Establish Permit Cost Based on Cost Recovery Goals	
Strategies	<b>Resident Parking Permit</b>			
	Program			
	Strategy 4.3: Develop	8.	Create a TDM Regulation in the Unified Development Code	
Unified Development	Transportation Demand			
Code Amendment	Management Requirement			
Strategies	or Reduction Allowance			

# **Appendices**

Appendix A: Community Engagement Summary

Appendix B: Current Parking Costs by Department/Fund

Appendix C: Detailed Signage Analysis and Recommendations

Appendix D: Automated Parking Guidance Systems Summary

Appendix E: Parking Management In Loveland One-Pager

Appendix F: Accredited Parking Organization Checklist

Appendix G: Supporting Practices from Other Communities and Detailed Peer City Metrics

Appendix H: Survey Questions and Responses—General Public

Appendix I: Survey Questions and Responses—Business Association

Appendix J: Ordinance Example

# **APPENDIX A**

Community Engagement Summary
# , Community Engagement Metrics

- **Digital Hub:** In June 2022, Loveland established and spotlighted the Downtown Parking project under its Let's Talk Loveland community engagement site. The site uses the Bang the Table digital engagement platform. The Downtown Parking hub included a project summary and study area map, provided regular updates on the status and schedule, informed the public on dates and times for City Council and other Board planning sessions, study sessions, and meetings, and provided links to relevant historical planning documents and technical reports. The digital hub was also where residents and visitors were directed to take a 10-question poll/survey about downtown parking.
  - Resident/Visitor Survey: Between July and December 2022, about 216 responses were received from the Resident and Visitor online parking poll/survey. Respondents were asked questions such as where they prefer to find parking downtown, what factors are most important to them in terms of finding parking, and where overnight parking should be located. Also, they were provided an opportunity to leave an open-ended comment about the parking system; 106 respondents chose to leave a comment. When including the number of in-person respondents to the Resident/Visitor Survey, about 525 responses were collected and compiled.
  - Downtown Association Survey: Separately, also through the online digital engagement platform, the City provided stakeholders and downtown business owners the opportunity to provide their feedback through a different 10-question survey. Between July and September 2022, 29 responses were collected and compiled. Respondents were asked to comment on questions such as the type and size of the business operated, how many private on-street spaces they have, if downtown should continue to have outdoor dining, and if loading zone spaces are needed were asked. Also, respondents were provided an opportunity to leave an open-ended comment about how the City could improve parking in the downtown business zone.
- In-Person Events: Throughout Summer 2022, City staff operated a booth during selected summer special events and concerts where attendees could provide in-person feedback and take the Resident/Visitor Survey. About 315 in-person responses were received for the Resident/Visitor survey across all in-person events. In addition, attendees were presented with a large map of the downtown parking area and asked to identify locations where they've had a good or bad parking experience, as well as locations where they had an idea for improvements. Also, they were encouraged to provide short open-ended comments through sticky notes or longer ones, if desired, on a separate comment sheet. Events where in-person engagement was conducted included the One Sweet Summer Concert Series, the Foote Lagoon Concert Series, and the Loveland Farmers' Market in August.

# Downtown Association Survey

• About the Businesses: Out of all respondents, about 4 in 5 members reported that their business is open on Saturdays, and about 3 in 4 reported that their business is open on Sundays.

- **Private Off-Street Parking Supply:** Association members also surveyed reported that they employ an average of 6 employees per shift per business, ranging from 1 to 32 employees, along with an average of about 1 private, off-street parking space per business, ranging from 0 to 8 spaces.
- **Outdoor Dining:** A majority of members (54%) said that on-street parking spaces should no longer be used for bump-outs/outdoor dining.
- Short-Term Parking: 1 in 4 members reported that they need an on-street pick-up space for activities such as Door Dash and Uber, with a 15-minute duration the most common length of time needed for such spaces. 64% of members reported that they don't need on-street loading, as alley loading is mostly sufficient for their needs. Also, 79% of members said that a drop-off zone or space for customers was not necessary.
- Ways to Improve Parking: The most frequently provided idea, at 38% of all ideas expressed, was that more enforcement is needed, primarily to disincentivize employees from parking on-street and occupying valuable parking spaces for the entire day. The second most common idea, at 19%, was that more parking and/or a new parking garage are needed. Third, at 13%, was that the City should get rid of bump-outs for outdoor dining, or at least tighten up rules about how they are used and where they can be located. 2 comments were provided in support of paid parking, while only 1 was provided against it.

# Resident/Visitor Survey

- About the Residents and Visitors: About half of all residents and visitors to downtown Loveland prefer to park on-street, while 25% prefer public parking surface lots. About 1 in 5 said they prefer a parking garage, such as The Foundry. Also, 67% of residents reported that they typically park for fewer than 2 hours, while only about 4% reported that they are overnight parkers
- Understanding Parking Options: While there was no clearly predominant idea about how residents and visitors could better understand their parking options, a little more than 1 in 4 said that better static signage and wayfinding would help, while a parking app and dynamic signage and wayfinding (signs that share information about parking availability) were nearly tied for the second most predominate idea (22% and 23% respectively).
- **Deciding Where to Park:** Parking being close to a destination was the most frequently occurring important factor for residents and visitors in deciding where to park (32%), followed by if parking is easy to find (26%). Also, 90% of respondents reported that they would be willing to park more than a block away from their destination, and 80% reported they would be willing to park more than two blocks away.
- Paid Parking: About 34% thought that a standard parking meter rate with free parking after 10 PM each day would be a feasible paid parking model to implement, the most frequently occurring response, while 1 in 4 reported that a variable parking rate based on location and proximity to key destinations, with cheaper parking options further away, would also be feasible (the second most frequently occurring response). 56% reported that they would only need a minimum of an hour or less for parking, assuming they were parked at a metered on-street spot less than a block away from their destination. Finally, nearly 9 in 10 said that, if on-street parking were paid, that they would rather park in the Foundry Garage if it were free.

- **Overnight Parking:** About 58% said that free, overnight public parking should be available in a parking structure, with nearly 5 in 10 saying that it should be available in the downtown core. Only 14% said it should be available on-street in downtown.
- Ways to Improve Parking: Out of about 106 respondents who left comments, about 86 ideas emerged. The most commonly occurring idea was that the City should not charge for parking (23% of all ideas provided). The second most common idea expressed (13%) was that downtown should be less auto-orientated, with less parking, more transit, and more multi-modal/bike parking and amenities. The third most commonly occurring idea (9%) was that more parking and/or parking options are needed. The idea that the city should charge for parking and/or that employees should be moved off the street was fourth at 8%. Other ideas (11%) expressed ranged from remote parking with golf cart shuttles to a tram. 5 comments related to the Foundry Garage being too small, inadequate for maneuvering, and having a bad configuration.

# In-Person Feedback

- **ADA Parking:** The most predominate idea expressed was that accessible parking was inadequate or hard to access downtown, at 12% of all ideas
- Five ideas tied for second most commonly expressed at 9% each:
  - **Road Safety:** There are road safety challenges, particularly with inadequate crosswalks, dangerous intersections, and the roundabout
  - Enforcement: More enforcement is needed
  - **Foundry Garage:** Parking is difficult in the Foundry Garage (spaces are too small, maneuvering is difficult, turn radii are tight, etc.).
  - **Pedestrian Mall:** There should be a pedestrian mall downtown
  - **Auto Dependency:** There should be more transit and less auto dependency
- **Bad or Challenging Parking Experiences:** About 4 in 10 (41%) of all locations identified were along 4<sup>th</sup> St. The Foundry Garage was second at 16% and other parking lots were third at 14%
- **Good Parking or Mobility Experiences:** The off-street surface lots were the most common locations identified at 28%. The Civic Center ranked second at 23%.
- Ideas for Improvement: Nearly half of locations identified as potential areas of improvement were along 4<sup>th</sup> St.

# **APPENDIX B**

Current Parking Costs by Department/Fund

Disclaimer: The Appendix B chart data offers a conceptual analysis of total allocated operations, management, and maintenance costs from each departmental fund associated with the administration of on-street and surface lot parking management. It is to be noted that an official, City Council-approved parking management system is nonexistent in the City of Loveland; thus, these cost estimates are not directly tied to the appropriation of monies and, as such, have been expended by each departmental fund listed as part of their funded operations. Additionally, as a result of not having an official parking management system, related data is lacking or non-existent, so an accurate representation of allocated expenses for on-street and surface lot parking management cannot be fully represented at this time; thus, projections must be heavily relied upon to capture current and future parking management costs conceptually.

#### Projected 2023 Expenditures: Current Parking Management System

Department/Fund	Estimated	% of	Assumptions	Rationale
	Total	Total		
Foundry OpEx	\$450,000	32%	Total allocated (rounded) for 2023 for Foundry operations, management and maintenance	Existing/City-funded parking structure
Draper OpEx	\$350,000	25%	Projected ongoing total for Draper operations, management and maintenance	Budgeted/City-funded parking structure
Public Works	\$320,000	23%	5% administration, 1% facility maintenance, 5% street repair/maintenance from 2023 budget. Maintenance has been extensively deferred on surface parking. Street sweeping comes from stormwater maintenance program. Street maintenance has been deferred as well.	Current costs to maintain, operate, repair, manage and administer on-street and surface lot parking and respond to issues
Police	\$66,470	5%	Approximately \$60,000 in personnel fees for partial community service offer assignments, plus 1% administrative costs from 2023 budget	The police department currently conducts all enforcement of time limits that occurs in Downtown Loveland, and responds to some additional parking-related complaints.
Development Services	\$100,000	7%	Assumes 5% administration, 5% capital planning functions, and 5%	Development Services is responsible for reviewing new developments for parking compliance, planning the parking and mobility system, and responding to some parking-related complaints and challenges.

			strategic planning functions from 2023 budget	
Economic Development	\$58,000	4%	Assumes 5% visitor services administration and 5% visitor services community marketing	Economic Development is partially responsible for managing visitor and existing/new/prospective business owner issues and challenges around parking, and participates in strategic planning efforts related to the parking and mobility system.
Municipal Court	\$9,800	<1%	Assumes 1% total expense budget from 2023	Municipal Court manages ticket review and revenue administration for parking fines
Downtown Development Authority	\$10,000	<1%	Assumes 5% of total expense budget from 2023 – Ask Sean Hawkins to weigh in	The DDA is partially responsible for managing visitor and existing/new/prospective business owner issues and challenges around parking, and participates in strategic planning efforts related to the parking and mobility system.
Finance	\$8,500	<1%	Assumes 1% of total administration budget from 2023	The finance department is responsible for financial planning and administration related to the parking and mobility system, such as reviewing contracts and financial commitments for the Foundry and Draper garages.
Attorney's Office	\$13,000	<1%	Assumes 1% of total personnel budget from 2023	The attorney's office reviews contracts and financial commitments for the Foundry and Draper garages.
City Manager's Office	\$19,200	1%	Assumes 1% of office budget from 2023 plus 2% of community and engagement office budget	The City Manager's office reviews and executes contracts and financial commitments for the Foundry and Draper garages, oversees staff departments as they conduct parking activities, and manages

Total \$1,404

\$1,404,970 100%

## Projected Expenditures: Near-Term—Current Parking Management System

Department/Fund	Estimated	% of	Assumptions	Rationale
	Total	Total		
New Garage OpEx	\$400,000	20%	Projected allocation for a new 400-space garage owned or partially owned by the City	With no parking management intervention, community pressures to build more parking inventory are expected to mount in the next several years even with the new Draper garage coming online.
Foundry OpEx	\$463,500	22%	Total allocated (rounded) for 2023 for Foundry operations, management and maintenance	Existing/City-funded parking structure
Draper OpEx	\$360,500	17%	Projected ongoing total for Draper operations, management and maintenance	Budgeted/City-funded parking structure
Public Works	\$329,600	16%	5% administration, 1% facility maintenance, 5% street repair/maintenance from 2023 budget. Maintenance has been extensively deferred on surface parking. Street sweeping comes from stormwater maintenance program. Street maintenance has been deferred as well.	Current costs to maintain, operate, repair, manage and administer on-street and surface lot parking and respond to issues
Public Works – Deferred Maintenance	\$275,000	13%	Estimate from Public Works, plus assumed inflationary increase in materials	Necessary deferred maintenance on existing City-owned surface lots

Police	\$69,000	3%	Approximately \$60,000 in personnel fees for partial community service offer assignments, plus 1% administrative costs from 2023 budget	The police department currently conducts all enforcement of time limits that occurs in Downtown Loveland, and responds to some additional parking-related complaints.
Development Services	\$103,000	5%	Assumes 5% administration, 5% capital planning functions, and 5% strategic planning functions from 2023 budget	Development Services is responsible for reviewing new developments for parking compliance, planning the parking and mobility system, and responding to some parking-related complaints and challenges.
Economic Development	\$59,500	3%	Assumes 5% visitor services administration and 5% visitor services community marketing	Economic Development is partially responsible for managing visitor and existing/new/prospective business owner issues and challenges around parking, and participates in strategic planning efforts related to the parking and mobility system.
Municipal Court	\$10,000	<1%	Assumes 1% total expense budget from 2023	Municipal Court manages ticket review and revenue administration for parking fines
Downtown Development Authority	\$10,300	<1%	Assumes 5% of total expense budget from 2023 – Ask Sean Hawkins to weigh in	The DDA is partially responsible for managing visitor and existing/new/prospective business owner issues and challenges around parking, and participates in strategic planning efforts related to the parking and mobility system.
Finance	\$8,800	<1%	Assumes 1% of total administration budget from 2023	The finance department is responsible for financial planning and administration related to the parking and mobility system, such as reviewing contracts and financial commitments for the Foundry and Draper garages.
Attorney's Office	\$13,400	<1%	Assumes 1% of total personnel budget from 2023	The attorney's office reviews contracts and financial commitments for the Foundry and Draper garages.
City Manager's Office	\$19,900	<1%	Assumes 1% of office budget from 2023 plus 2% of community and engagement office budget	The City Manager's office reviews and executes contracts and financial commitments for the Foundry and Draper garages, oversees staff departments as they conduct parking activities, and manages

Total

\$2,122,500 100%

### Projected Capital Costs

New City Parking Structure – Assume 400 Spaces \$14,00,000--\$18,000,000 City Contribution

# **APPENDIX C**

Detailed Signage Analysis and Recommendations



## Introduction

The City of Loveland has asked Walker to investigate strategies to help minimize the number of visitors to downtown who park on-street along 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup>, as on-street parking along these corridors between 1<sup>st</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> is typically at capacity at peak times. Drivers tend to circulate around the two corridors until an on-street space opens up, as opposed to going to an off-street public lot. With the opening of the new Foundry parking garage, there is an ample amount of free, public, off-street parking available in downtown, even during peak times. Traffic congestion, as well as frustration for drivers trying to find parking, could be minimized if visitors to downtown were more aware of the location of off-street parking facilities and the ample supply of available parking in those facilities, particularly in the new garage.

In order to gain an understanding of the problem, as well as to formulate recommendations and solutions, Walker staff conducted an inventory of all wayfinding and parking signage, at both the vehicular and pedestrian level, found within the downtown area. This included wayfinding and destination signage posted along Garfield Avenue and Buchanan Avenue to the north, Eisenhower Boulevard immediately to the east, and Lincoln Avenue and Cleveland Avenue to the south. Additional selected vehicular wayfinding signage was also inventoried along Eisenhower, Taft Avenue, and 29<sup>th</sup> Street around the perimeter of Lake Loveland as well as further east on Eisenhower approaching the I-25 freeway, in order to provide context for downtown wayfinding as well as to inform of types and designs of wayfinding and parking signage currently used in the city.

This inventory will enable Walker and Loveland staff to understand existing signage content and locations as well as of the various sign families and design languages that currently exist. In all, 67 signs in all were documented and geolocated, including some miscellaneous signs that may or may not be considered public wayfinding signage. A Google Earth .kmz file will be provided to city staff as a supplement to our report that contains photos of all signs inventoried along with their location.

# **Existing Signage**

### PRIMARY WAYFINDING AND DESTINATION SIGNS

There were two distinct families of primary vehicular wayfinding signage observed: one with multiple destinations and one with a single destination. Both sign families have a stylized "double-peak" forming the top edge of the sign with a supplementary sign above it in the middle featuring a Manual of Uniform Traffic Control Devices (MUTCD) purple background and the Visit Loveland logo in the foreground, the logo used as part of the city's Community Marketing Commission (CMC) brand to promote local tourism, with the main sign area having an MUTCD brown background. The MUTCD is a federal document that outlines design specifications for most signs that are used on public roads for all purposes.

The multiple-destinations sign family contains two or three destinations in the legend in standard MUTCD series font separated by white lines. These signs are rounded at the bottom at both corners and feature a white border around the main sign area and legend, and they are mounted on two poles.

The single-destination signs, however, contain a purple supplementary sign at the bottom, below the main legend with the destination, displaying either the street to be turned onto with a directional arrow or simply a



directional arrow. The font of these signs is a non-MUTCD serif font and the signs have 90-degree corners and no border. The single-destination signs come either standalone mounted on a pole or integrated as part of a monument structure illuminated by a light above.

Figure 1 below shows the two sign family types described above.

Figure 1: Primary Wayfinding and Destination Sign Families



Examples of Multi-destination Signs



Examples of Single-destination Signs



#### SECONDARY WAYFINDING SIGNAGE

Secondary wayfinding signage typically comes in the form of simple sign blades with rounded corners and borders and feature either the MUTCD blue, green, or brown background. They are used to indicate wayfinding for destinations like golf courses, police, fire, courts, the civic center, or museums. They typically feature the City of Loveland logo instead of the Visit Loveland logo. These signs do not have a consistent design language.

Figure 2 below show some examples of secondary wayfinding signs that were inventoried.

Figure 2: Selected Examples of Secondary Wayfinding Signage





#### **PARKING SIGNAGE**

Parking destination signage in the downtown typically comes in the form of a circular "P" on a white background, with the circle alternating between MUTCD green and blue, mounted at the top of a pole in the center. Below it is a simple sign blade with rounded corners and a MUTCD green border and white background displaying parking duration, parking prohibitions, and sometimes the intersection that the parking lot is located.

Parking wayfinding comes in the form of either standard MUTCD-recommended signs or in the form of custom signs with rounded corners but no border displaying the same circular "P" described above along with a blue directional arrow.

Figure 3 below show some selected parking signage inventoried.

Figure 3: Selected Examples of Parking Signage





## **Conclusions and Recommendations**

After conducting its inventory, Walker staff has identified some areas of improvement for existing signage as well as opportunities for new wayfinding signage in order to improve overall aesthetics and functionality. These improvements and new signs would help to alleviate on-street parking demand along 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup>, direct and nudge drivers towards the Foundry Garage and other surface lots, as well as improve overall wayfinding both within downtown and outside of downtown.

#### **OPPORTUNITIES FOR ADDITIONAL SIGNS**

The number and location of most primary wayfinding signs and parking signs are, overall, adequate. The greatest opportunity for improvement in the form of new signs relates to the new Foundry Garage.

The opening of the new Foundry parking structure just north of 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue has significantly changed the overall parking supply and parking dynamics in the downtown area. Currently, none of the wayfinding or parking signage features or directs to the Foundry Garage. In addition, the garage itself, while featuring prominent building-mounted "PARK" signage above the entrance, does not have clear signage indicating that it is, in fact, a public garage and is now the preferred place to park for visitors to downtown and the surrounding area.

The Foundry Garage should be either added to existing primary wayfinding or should be included as part of a new sign family providing multi-destination parking-specific wayfinding. If included as part of a new sign family, Walker recommends that it be more prominently featured than the other surface lots so as to signal to drivers that it is the main/preferred public parking facility. Also, Walker highly recommends that supplementary signage be mounted on the façade of the parking garage in multiple locations, including at the garage entrance as well as at the building corners, that clearly indicates that the garage is public parking. This signage should follow the same design theme as the new parking destination signage described and recommended in the next section.

The figures on the following pages display design concepts for proposed new Foundry and surface lot parking signage.



### MEMORANDUM

LOVELAND SIGNAGE AND WAYFINDING

PROJECT #23-7825.00

Figure 4: Foundry Garage Structure-Mounted Signage





Figure 5: Proposed New Parking Multi-destination Wayfinding Signage Including Foundry





Walker staff also identified two other lower-priority opportunities for new signage outside the downtown area proper that could be explored, if desired.

- Loveland is rapidly expanding southward from downtown, and Highway 402/14<sup>th</sup> Street South is the secondary access point to downtown Loveland for drivers along the 25 freeway coming from Denver/from the south. A single set of new wayfinding signs for westbound drivers approaching Lincoln Avenue might be warranted.
- When going south on Garfield Avenue, drivers encounter their first set of stylized wayfinding signs. They do not encounter a second set of signs until after they cross the intersection with Eisenhower Blvd, which is over a mile to the south and after Garfield has turned into Buchanan and then split off into the Cleveland/Lincoln one-way couplet that goes through downtown. An additional set of wayfinding signs located at the Lincoln/Cleveland split would provide wayfinding reassurance for drivers at a point about halfway between the two existing sign sets, as well as mirror the setup found on the south of downtown where the couplet merges back into one road.

#### **DESIGN CONTINUITY**

For the primary vehicular wayfinding, Walker recommends that Loveland either adopt features of the multidestination family to the primary-destination family or vice versa. Corner rounding, borders, and font should all be consistent across both sign families.

For the secondary wayfinding signs that do not feature the stylized top with the Visit Loveland logo, Loveland should adopt a more consistent design featuring the MUTCD brown background color. Loveland should consider incorporating a smaller, integrated version of the stylized top featured in the primary wayfinding signs, which could either feature the same Visit Loveland logo or feature the City of Loveland logo to set these signs apart from the primary signs, as the destination family for these signs is different and mostly includes civic institutions such as police, fire, and golf courses.

For the parking signage, Loveland should consider removing all existing parking lot destination signage and replace it with a single sign family that follows the same overall design language as the primary wayfinding sign families. Also, the current "P" logo used should be consistent across all signs; Walker recommends that the entire symbol, including the circle, be MUTCD green to bring its design more in line with MUTCD guidelines. This new all-green "P" symbol should be used on all parking signage, including parking directional signage mounted on traffic signal poles and light posts, to provide a single "brand" for all public parking.

Installing all new parking destination signage would necessitate adopting a consistent nomenclature or identification system for all public lots. This system could name all the lots after the street intersection they are located at (5<sup>th</sup> and Railroad Lot), as is the case currently, could have a unique single name for each lot (Railroad Lot, 5<sup>th</sup> Street Lot, Museum Lot, et cetera), or could assign a unique letter or number to every lot and the Foundry Garage (Lot A, Lot B, Garage A, et cetera).

The following figures below show three examples of existing parking destination signs and a proposed replacement signs using Walker's conceptual design that mostly follows the design language of the primary single-destination signs (with MUTCD font instead of custom serif font) and using existing lot identification/nomenclature.



### MEMORANDUM LOVELAND SIGNAGE AND WAYFINDING

PROJECT #23-7825.00

Figure 6: Proposed Parking Destination Signage (1)





# MEMORANDUM

PROJECT #23-7825.00

Figure 7: Proposed Parking Destination Signage (2)





MEMORANDUM LOVELAND SIGNAGE AND WAYFINDING

PROJECT #23-7825.00

Figure 8: Proposed Parking Destination Signage (3)





## MEMORANDUM LOVELAND SIGNAGE AND WAYFINDING

PROJECT #23-7825.00

#### Figure 9: Proposed Parking Symbol and Parking Wayfinding Signage



# **APPENDIX D**

Automated Parking Guidance System Summary

#### AUTOMATED PARKING GUIDANCE SYSTEMS

As important as static signage is, the effectiveness of static signage, including the type and dynamic nature of information conveyed, are limited. In the context of parking, the next level of wayfinding is automated parking guidance. Automated parking guidance systems (APGS) are automated information networks that provide parking availability and directional guidance to motorists. An APGS utilizes dynamic variable message signage to display occupancy information and/or directional arrows at key decision points so that motorists know what to expect and where to find parking as they drive to or through a garage or surface lot parking facility.

There are three basic types of APGS for a parking facility, each of which communicates a different level of detail. These types are, in order of complexity:

- 1. Systems that communicate the occupancy status of the parking facility (garage or surface lot).
- 2. Systems that communicate the number of spaces available by level (multi-story garage only).
- 3. Systems that communicate whether each individual space is occupied or vacant in real time (garage or surface lot).

The first type of system is used to communicate the total number of parking spaces available to motorists before they enter a parking facility. Within this, there are two sub-types: systems that only alert when a parking structure is full or not and systems that indicate vacancy status along with the approximate number of vacant spaces in total at a given time. These types of systems can be deployed both inside a garage as well as in surface lots. They can drive signs not only at each parking facility or can also drive signs at major intersections and along key corridors to allow motorists to make the decision to park off street as soon as arriving Downtown, saving them from having to navigate to a parking structure or surface lot and also from having to circulate through a parking facility in order to find a parking space that may not be available.

The second type of system, applicable to multi-story garages only, allows users to see how many available spaces are available on each floor of the garage. This type of system provides an extra level of detail for the driver entering a parking structure, allowing them to know beforehand what level they need to circulate to in order to start looking for empty parking. This can make overall circulation during peak times more efficient, as people will typically avoid bothering to search for an empty space on a parking level with little to no availability. While useful inside and immediately on the outside of a garage entrance, this level of detail is ineffective at the street corridor/district perimeter level.

The third type of system displays the exact location of available spaces within a parking garage or surface lot through the use of overhead signage and/or indicator lights.

In a parking garage setting, such systems can either have one row of lights for each drive aisle or one row for each column/row of parking spaces. Drive-aisle-type systems are typically more affordable, as one row of lights can display the status for respective spaces to the left and to the right. While traditionally these systems either display red for "occupied" and green for "available," more recent systems may instead simply turn the light off when a space is available. When using multi-colored light emitting diode (LED) lights, the light can be any color, not just red or green. This allows the system to display, for instance, the location of accessible spaces with a blue light, so that persons needing accessible spaces can navigate right to where they need to go.

 In a surface lot setting, it is not currently possible to have a single space indicator light over every parking stall. However, some APGS's are available with elevated signs mounted on luminary poles that show the number of spaces available in sectors or sub-areas of the lot. Also, some system can drive mobile applications which show available spaces in real-time overlaid on a map of the surface lot.

This type of system (known as a single space or individual space APGS), while becoming more affordable and popular with each passing year, only yield additional utility/information for the end user in parking facilities with flat floors and/or circulation patterns that do not force the user go drive by every space as they circulate through a garage or surface lot. Even if those conditions are met, this level of detail is typically only useful in facilities that see very high occupancy, so that vacant spaces can be easily and quickly identified, thus resulting in a very high effective supply and usage efficiency. I

#### FACILITY-STATUS SYSTEMS

A facility-status system is used to communicate parking availability to motorists before they enter a facility. Count modules, (loops, cameras, magnetic sensors, or ultrasonic sensors) monitor the number of vehicles that enter and exit the facility to maintain an overall count of vehicles in the facility. The parking access and revenue control (PARCS) equipment installed in the facility can keep a count of monthly parkers, transit parkers that pull a ticket, and outstanding reservations to display only the available public parking spaces using already installed loops. This count data can be sent to dynamic signs through either a hard-wired communication line or by using cellular data communications. Facility counts tend to lose accuracy, so it is important to check the count displayed against the number of spaces occupied in the garage. Adjustments may be required periodically to ensure an accurate display. More modern APGS counting sensors such as cameras tend to offer much better accuracy than older methods such as loops and accordingly require significantly less frequent recalibration.

Dynamic signage (typically LED in modern installations) displays the number of available spaces and/or color-coded messages such as "Full" in red, or "Open" in green. The newest signs have begun to move towards full LED screens, where flexible messaging including text and graphics can be displayed, as the unit cost of such systems has decreased notably.



Examples of Facility-Status Type Guidance Signs







The above images are various examples of facility-status signage from across the country. The images at top are from private developments/shopping centers in Miami (top left), Liberty Center, OH, and Lincoln, NE. The bottom two are from public downtown parking systems in Omaha, NE (bottom left) and Asheville, NC (bottom enter), and Redwood City, CA (bottom right).

Note the varying complexities, with the first two showing simple availability figures for a single garage, the third displaying availability for multiple garages as well as incorporating shopping center business wayfinding, the fourth incorporating a full variable message LED sign capable of displaying dynamic rates along with number of open spaces, and the fifth being a fully flexible, full color, edge-to-edge LED panel sign showing a temporary custom City message.

#### COSTS AND MAINTENANCE

Costs can vary widely.

Facility counting APGS for a garage may cost in the range \$25,000 to \$50,000, depending on the number of entry/exit plaza, number of nested areas, and the type and number of local signs selected. Level counting and single space counting systems will cost accordingly more.

Facility counting APGS for surface lots may cost in the range of \$30,000 to \$80,000 per lot, depending on the number of entry/exit plazas and lanes, the number of stalls in the lot, and the type and number of local signs selected. Systems that can track the occupancy of each space and support additional signs internal to the lot will be somewhat more expensive. It is important to understand that surface lot APGS accuracy will be easier to achieve with more modern camera-based systems using elevated cameras mounted on luminary poles. These sort of systems, while initially more expensive, will tend to provide more accurate results over time. Some vendors of such systems are providing low up-front costs in exchange for ongoing Software-as-a-Service (SaaS) fees.

Once the internal infrastructure framework for obtaining raw data from garages and surface lots has been established, the added cost to the parking system of installing on-street facility-status type guidance signs is mostly comprised of the signs themselves, any new sign mounting structures if existing structures cannot be used, infrastructure required to send data and power to those signs, and wayfinding signage control software. Some level of active maintenance, in the form of periodic calibration of the counts to ensure the data remains accurate, will be required for the sign network.

Assuming a standalone sign (pole, cabinet, and two dynamic inserts with space for up to six), our highlevel opinion of materials cost is \$8,000-\$10,000 per sign location, plus on-going costs for sending data to remote signs using either cellular data or a Wi-Fi enabled device and installation.

With a projected installation cost of between \$4,000 - \$5,000 per sign assuming existing poles can be utilized, the total cost of each sign would range from between \$12,00 to \$15,000. If any of these signs require new poles and pole foundations due to the inability to utilize existing traffic or luminary poles, the projected installation cost is likely to increase to the range of \$15,000-\$20,000 per sign due to additional engineering design and installation labor costs. Therefore, we recommend that signs be placed on and powered from existing poles whenever possible.

# **APPENDIX E**

Parking Management in Loveland One-Pager

#### Amether lor

ILS AII	other Sum	y Day III L	.overanu
NUM			
North Control		NV3.12	Van Deland
MEET	EXISTING	PARKING MANAGEMENT STRATEGY	PROPOSED
Neelle	Noelle lives outside the City and		
Noelle	works in an office Downtown.		Noelle lives outside the City and
<b>b</b>	<b>She drives to work around 7:30</b>		works in an office Downtown.
	a.m. so that she can find a		a m and parks in the Foundry
	parking spot on the street near		arage for which she has a
	her office, in front of other		parking permit. She loves this
	businesses. The spot is signed		option because she knows
11	as two-hour parking, but she		exactly where to park in the
	knows it's unlikely that she'll get	and the second s	garage and knows she will have
МІЛ	a ticket if she parks there for the		a space. She also has time to
	the enstreet perking bee been		grab coffee and a scone on her
MORNING	taken by other office workers		way into the office!
	taken by other office workers.		
	losé has plans to go shopping		
José	Downtown today. He's excited as		José has plans to go shopping
	he drives down Cleveland around		Downtown today. He's excited as
	2 p.m. but quickly becomes		he drives down Cleveland around
	frustrated as he turns onto 4th		2 p.m., and feels relieved when
	Street. All the good spots are		ne sees a big sign that says "Park
	already taken! He circles around		direct him to the Foundry Garage
	Downtown for a few minutes		where he parks. The garage floor
JL	before finally finding a parking		he parked on is clearly marked
	spot in a 2-hour parking zone. He		and he knows he can stav all day
EARLY	worries that he'll be out for more		to shop, eat, and drink without
ΔFTERNOON	than two hours and get a ticket,	State - Indiana	worrying about a ticket.
/	but decides to chance it.		No.D. Delan D. C.
Jonah	It's Jonah's first day as a server		It's Jonah's first day as a server at
oonan	at one of Downtown Loveland's		one of Downtown Loveland's
2	delicious restaurants. He drives		delicious restaurants. His boss
	Into work around 4 p.m. His boss		nas already provided him with a
	the street but he's not sure		him where to park. He gets GPS
	where else to go! He drives by		directions directly to this parking
	Foundry garage, but he's not		facility, feeling confident about
	sure if it's public because the	_	leaving his car. At his last job, he
	signs confuse him. After about		was always getting parking
LATE	15 minutes of driving, he parks		tickets, and never knew where to
ΛΕΤΕΡΝΟΟΝ	on a neighborhood street and		park! He heads into work ready to
ALLENNOON	walks into work from there.		conquer the day.
	Around 6 n m locá is tired from		Around C.n.m. José is tired from
José	Around 6 p.m., Jose is tired from		Around 6 p.m., Jose is tired from
	some dinner. He's been parked in		some dinner. He's still narked in a
	a 2-hour space for almost 4		covered, safe, and convenient
	hours now, but is happy to see		parking space where all-day
	he doesn't have a ticket. He's		parking is allowed, so he doesn't
	worried that enforcement might		worry about needing to move his
11	increase in the evening, though,		car. With so many dining options
	and doesn't want to walk to		within a few blocks, he can simply
	dinner. He hops in his car and		walk to his restaurant, window
EARLY	circles the block a few times		shopping along the way amongst
	trying to find a parking space	Black _ Black	all the others who are out and

F

even closer to his restaurant.

**EVENING** 

all the others who are out and about on this perfect evening.

# **APPENDIX F**

Accredited Parking Organization Checklist

# ACCREDITED PARKING ORGANIZATION and ACCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION MATRIX

APPLICA	NT:			
DATE:				
SITE REV	/IEWER:			
1.0 G	overnance and Organization			
Accredited	l Criteria	Possible	Yes/No	EVIDENCE
1.1	Provides a copy of official documentation that defines a contract, charter, ordinance, or enabling legislation.	R		
1.2	Provides documentation showing governance hierarchy (Board of Directors/Executive Director roles, responsibilities, terms, and relationships) is current, and policy-making authority, process, record-keeping, and decision-making are transparent.	R		
1.3	Regulations regarding limits or restrictions on the organization's authority to change/amend rates, fines, use of funds, agency jurisdiction, operating rules, etc., are current and well-defined.	1		
1.4	Current operational policies and procedures are documented with amendments and/or revisions.	1		
1.5	Mission and vision statements (or equivalent definitions of purpose) are current and available to the public, and to stakeholders and parent companies or organizations.	1		
1.6	A current organizational chart is available and reflects the program's mission.	1		
1.7	Comprehensive organizational structure is in place that clearly defines relationships between functions, process, and staff assignments.	1		
1.8	Appropriate and accurate position descriptions are current within three years of the accreditation inspection date.	1		
TOTAL S	TANDARD SCORE	6	0	
Accredited	l with Distinction Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE
1.9	There is an active stakeholder committee, with a documented Terms of Reference, that participates in governance.	1		
1.10	There is a senior leader or Executive Director with professional training in planning and delivery of parking services.	1		
1.11	The senior leader or Executive Director represents the parking organization in public and to the media.	1		

1.12	Retains annual reports or departmental profiles that explain the role and mission of the parking organization.	1		
1.13	Retains past performance documentation.	1		
TOTAL A	CCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION SCORE	5	0	

2.0 Pla	2.0 Planning and Monitoring					
Accredited	l Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE		
2.1	Provides current documentation stating short- and long-term goals and identifying measurable objectives and timelines for achievement.	R				
2.2	Provides documentation outlining planning process and procedures that translate daily activities into long-term or strategic planning – minimum two years beyond current fiscal year.	1				
2.3	Planning includes an annual or multi-year budget and financial projection, with periodic tracking and analysis and coordinated with related community or institutional planning entities.	R				
2.4	Maintains a detailed and up-to-date inventory of all parking resources (permits, facilities, parking stalls).	1				
2.5	Conducts parking supply, demand, and utilization studies at regular intervals.	1				
2.6	Uses performance measurements in decision-making and regular benchmarking activities.	1				
TOTAL S	TANDARD SCORE	4	0			
Accredited	with Distinction Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE		
2.7	Demonstrates a solid understanding of the operational use of study results, metrics, and benchmarks.	1				
2.8	Demonstrates a practice of using metrics to explain and illustrate features of the parking program to the public.	1				
2.9	Participates in broader industry benchmarking and measurement studies and initiatives outside of his/her own organization or corporation.	1				
2.10	Planning outlines the schedule and process for key day-to-day operational and administrative activities, including responsible staff, timing/communication, frequency, and documentation to indicate activities are a well-established part of the organization's management process.	1				
TOTAL A	CCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION SCORE	4	0			

3.0 Fir	3.0 Financial Budgeting and Financial Management				
Accredited	l Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE	
3.1	Mission and vision or other guiding statements address financial principles, such as transparency, accountability, and responsibility.	R			
3.2	Produces and maintains an annual budget and projects a future (three or more years) financial planning document.	R			
3.3	Produces a monthly report identifying revenues and expenses as well as variance budget to actual.	1			
3.4	Maintains and regularly reviews organization's capital plan noting project status and associated budget financial status.	1			
3.5	Maintains a calendar of planned and completed audits (revenue control, employee safety, environment, labor control and management, cost management, etc.).	1			
3.6	Audits include all aspects of finance and operations, including cash and financial recordkeeping and management, as well as utilization and inventory control.	1			
3.7	Maintains audit protocol and procedure documents.	1			
3.8	Circulates documentation identifying audit findings or shortcomings to senior management and management reviews recommendations.	1			
3.9	Senior leadership (audit committee, etc.) responds to audit findings and recommendations, decides upon a plan of action and completion timeline, and documents response and plan of action.	1			
3.10	Maintains current SOP for accounts payable/accounts receivable.	1			
TOTAL S	TANDARD SCORE	8	0		
Accredited	l with Distinction Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE	
3.11	Reviews budget and performance documentation with authorized stakeholder groups.	1			
3.12	Demonstrates consistent and acceptable financial performance year after year.	1			
3.13	Financial performance meets or exceeds the targets established by the governing authority of the parent corporation.	1			
3.14	Financial management is subject to routine internal audit and process improvement measures.	1			
3.15	Produces a budget year-end financial report and operational summary.	1			
3.16	Achieved a strong bond credit rating from a third-party reviewing agency. (Moody A3, S&P A–, Fitch A–)	1			
3.17	Developed or achieved a level of public/private cooperation, such as a P3 partnership or other community partnership.	1			
TOTAL A	CCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION SCORE	7	0		

4.0 Cu	4.0 Customer Service					
Accredited	l Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE		
4.1	Commitment to service is identified and detailed in mission and/or vision statements.	R				
4.2	Refers to philosophy of customer service in routine correspondence.	1				
4.3	Refers to philosophy of customer service in long-and short-term planning documents.	1				
4.4	Provides and maintains a proactive customer-service training program for all staff.	R				
4.5	Conducts customer-service training for new staff.	1				
4.6	Offers annual customer-service refresher training for all staff.	1				
4.7	Responds to customer-service feedback.	1				
4.8	Staff are available remotely or in person to assist customers.	1				
4.9	Employs regular customer surveys (one-year interval minimum).	1				
4.10	Demonstrates a variety of customer-service programs.	1				
TOTAL S	TANDARD SCORE	8	0			
Accredited	with Distinction Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE		
Accredited 4.11	with Distinction Criteria     Provides a variety of parking payment options.	Possible 1	Achieved	EVIDENCE		
Accredited 4.11 4.12	with Distinction Criteria     Provides a variety of parking payment options.     Provides a variety of parking permits options.	Possible 1 1	Achieved	EVIDENCE		
Accredited     4.11     4.12     4.13	with Distinction Criteria   Provides a variety of parking payment options.   Provides a variety of parking permits options.   Provides a variety of options for response to compliance tickets or citations.	Possible     1     1     1	Achieved	EVIDENCE		
Accredited     4.11     4.12     4.13     4.14	with Distinction Criteria   Provides a variety of parking payment options.   Provides a variety of parking permits options.   Provides a variety of options for response to compliance tickets or citations.   Provides a choice of mode of interaction: telephone, email, text, or in- person.	Possible     1     1     1     1     1     1	Achieved	EVIDENCE		
Accredited 4.11 4.12 4.13 4.14 4.15	with Distinction Criteria   Provides a variety of parking payment options.   Provides a variety of parking permits options.   Provides a variety of options for response to compliance tickets or citations.   Provides a choice of mode of interaction: telephone, email, text, or in- person.   Uses social media to enhance customer service.	Possible     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1	Achieved	EVIDENCE		
Accredited     4.11     4.12     4.13     4.14     4.15     4.16	with Distinction Criteria   Provides a variety of parking payment options.   Provides a variety of parking permits options.   Provides a variety of options for response to compliance tickets or citations.   Provides a choice of mode of interaction: telephone, email, text, or in- person.   Uses social media to enhance customer service.   Gives credit to the team.	Possible     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1	Achieved	EVIDENCE		
Accredited     4.11     4.12     4.13     4.14     4.15     4.16     4.17	with Distinction Criteria   Provides a variety of parking payment options.   Provides a variety of parking permits options.   Provides a variety of options for response to compliance tickets or citations.   Provides a choice of mode of interaction: telephone, email, text, or in- person.   Uses social media to enhance customer service.   Gives credit to the team.   Offers customer-appreciation days, activities, or events. Conducts contests, special days, and special offers to promote its role and product or relationship to its customers.	Possible     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1	Achieved			
Accredited     4.11     4.12     4.13     4.14     4.15     4.16     4.17     4.18	with Distinction Criteria   Provides a variety of parking payment options.   Provides a variety of parking permits options.   Provides a variety of options for response to compliance tickets or citations.   Provides a choice of mode of interaction: telephone, email, text, or in- person.   Uses social media to enhance customer service.   Gives credit to the team.   Offers customer-appreciation days, activities, or events. Conducts contests, special days, and special offers to promote its role and product or relationship to its customers.   Engages stakeholders to assist in data collection or other tasks.	Possible     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1	Achieved	EVIDENCE		
Accredited     4.11     4.12     4.13     4.14     4.15     4.16     4.17     4.18     4.19	with Distinction Criteria   Provides a variety of parking payment options.   Provides a variety of parking permits options.   Provides a variety of options for response to compliance tickets or citations.   Provides a choice of mode of interaction: telephone, email, text, or in- person.   Uses social media to enhance customer service.   Gives credit to the team.   Offers customer-appreciation days, activities, or events. Conducts contests, special days, and special offers to promote its role and product or relationship to its customers.   Engages stakeholders to assist in data collection or other tasks.   Engages stakeholders in the customer service survey and acts upon the results of the survey.	Possible     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1	Achieved			
Accredited 4.11 4.12 4.13 4.14 4.15 4.16 4.17 4.18 4.19 4.20	with Distinction Criteria   Provides a variety of parking payment options.   Provides a variety of parking permits options.   Provides a variety of options for response to compliance tickets or citations.   Provides a choice of mode of interaction: telephone, email, text, or in- person.   Uses social media to enhance customer service.   Gives credit to the team.   Offers customer-appreciation days, activities, or events. Conducts contests, special days, and special offers to promote its role and product or relationship to its customers.   Engages stakeholders to assist in data collection or other tasks.   Engages stakeholders in the customer service survey and acts upon the results of the survey.   Uses rapid entrance and exit techniques for special event parking.	Possible     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1     1	Achieved			

5.0 Per	5.0 Personnel Education and Development					
Accredited	Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE		
5.1	Provides all staff with an employee handbook or equivalent document(s) identifying roles, tasks, responsibilities, operational policies, and procedures.	R				
5.2	Administers a training program that features a defined structure, outline, schedule, and materials.	1				
5.3	Maintains current job descriptions for each position and files training documentation for regular staff.	R				
5.4	Provides an orientation to facilities, organization, operations and lines of authority, introductions, and review of personnel policies for new staff.	1				
5.5	Provides formal instruction on functional responsibilities and procedures.	1				
5.6	Utilizes trainee assessment/testing to test comprehension of concepts and essential information.	1				
5.7	Directly supervises employees while in training before they begin performing duties independently.	1				
5.8	Uses follow-up training to address identified weaknesses and documents eventual competency.	1				
5.9	Maintains process for annual evaluations and professional development of staff.	1				
5.10	Utilizes evaluation criteria that are relevant to the functions and responsibilities of the employee, with an opportunity for written and verbal feedback.	1				
5.11	Provides employees the opportunity for documented input into evaluation.	1				
TOTAL STANDARD SCORE		9	0			
Accredited	with Distinction Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE		
5.12	In the case that an employee reports to multiple supervisors, provides opportunity for input from each supervisor.	1				
5.13	Provides a range of other training programs for the benefit of employee or organization.	1				
5.14	Senior manager holds a current CAPP designation.	1				
5.15	Middle management team participates in professional develoopment and/or CAPP point courses	1				
5.16	Provides all staff with ongoing professional development on a two year cycle, to include courses, external resources (i.e., membership/trade organizations), and/or industry-specific continuing education opportunities.	1				
---------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---	---	--		
TOTAL A	CCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION SCORE	5	0			

6.0 Access and Revenue Control				
Accredited	l Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE
6.1	Maintains effective access and revenue control plan for all facilities and services.	R		
6.2	Provides appropriate control methodologies (PARCs, timed parking, meters, etc.).	1		
6.3	Provides a current SOP that includes access and revenue-control requirements.	1		
6.4	Provides a systematic and documented process for obtaining and evaluating collection data.	1		
6.5	Equipment used to control facilities provides sufficient documentation for revenue generated.	1		
6.6	Incorporates reporting features into accounting reconciliation and reporting processes that include both transactions and revenue.	1		
6.7	Maintains a standard counting and reconciliation practice.	1		
6.8	Conducts periodic unannounced or opportunity counts or audits.	1		
6.9	Demonstrates that employees responsible for revenue management are trained in relevant policies, procedures, and audit processes.	1		
6.10	Provides a write-off policy/procedure.	1		
6.11	Maintains copies of bank transaction reports on at least a weekly basis that includes all forms of payment.	1		
6.12	Requires supervisory sign-off on void transactions and reconciliation documentation.	1		
6.13	Provides a process to resolve financial discrepancies.	1		
6.14	Provides a current letter, contract, or agreement between the applicant and any special event clients.	1		
6.15	Provides an automated process for reserving and/or vending parking space for events.	1		
6.16	Has the ability to issue a receipt to customers during special-event parking operation.	1		
6.17	Captures utilization reporting and routinely debriefs management and staff on the outcome of each event.	1		
6.18	Vault or counting room is monitored and access control is maintained.	1		
6.19	Properly limits and controls access to bulk permit or card stock.	1		
6.20	Documents custody of unissued permits and access cards.	1		
6.21	Inventories and counts meter canisters.	1		
6.22	Procedures and/or report slips show cashier stations are subtotaled and cash counted periodically during each shift.	1		
TOTAL S	TANDARD SCORE	21	0	

Accredited	with Distinction Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE
6.23	Monitors gate equipment and cashier positions controlling revenue areas with cameras.	1		
6.24	Audit process includes periodic review of statistical patterns related to equipment activity, cashiering functions, and field revenue collections.	1		
6.25	Provides a copy of most recent third-party audit (external or internal).	1		
TOTAL A	CCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION SCORE	3	0	

7.0 Ass	7.0 Asset Maintenance				
Accredited	l Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE	
7.1	Demonstrates that regular onsite inspections are an integral part of facility maintenance quarterly (at a minimum).	R			
7.2	Tests emergency systems quarterly (at a minimum).	1			
7.3	Maintains a maintenance program that includes inventory of maintenance items.	1			
7.4	Maintains copies of current maintenance agreements with third parties.	1			
7.5	Maintains a capital renewal plan.	1			
7.6	Budgets for maintenance reserves or funds set aside for parking facilities and services replacement and upgrade.	1			
7.7	Performs condition assessments by a qualified structural engineer, who conducts a walk-through inspection (annually).	R		WAIVED	
7.8	Performs condition assessments by a qualified structural engineer who conducts a full condition assessment including all disciplines (once every three years at a minimum).	1			
7.9	Provides a reconciliation report and schedule of repair completion for items identified in the condition appraisal.	1			
TOTAL ST	TANDARD SCORE	7	0		
Accredited	with Distinction Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE	
7.10	Maintains a maintenance program in accordance with Parking Consultants Council or equivalent guidelines, including a formal work order and tracking process.	1			
7.11	Posts maintenance, ownership, and contact information and hours of operation.	1			
7.12	Regulations and restrictions are posted and explained at customer-service locations.	1			
7.13	Replaces lighting ballasts and illuminators on a regular basis.	1			
7.14	Encourages customers to report security breaches or risks, and follows up with recorded action.	1			
7.15	Conducts routine physical security audits.	1			
7.16	Offers car wash, concierge, laundry, vehicle repair, or other value-added services.	1			
TOTAL A	CCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION SCORE	7	0		

8.0 Regulations, Enforcement, Adjudication and Collections				
Accredited	l Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE
8.1	Documents current compliance goals designed to encourage voluntary compliance.	R		
8.2	Regulations and processes related to enforcement and appeals are transparent and available to the public.	R		
8.3	Uses data to allocate resources and improve effectiveness (voluntary compliance).	1		
8.4	Conducts periodic review of patrol zones and activities monthly (at a minimum).	1		
8.5	Reviews officer performance and productivity monthly.	1		
8.6	Utilizes positive customer-service techniques to encourage compliance.	1		
8.7	Conducts daily shift briefings or other daily communication/updates.	1		
8.8	Details role of enforcement and compliance in training materials.	1		
8.9	Uses technology to monitor patrol routes and officer activities.	1		
8.10	Uses digital images to document and improve the accuracy of the enforcement process.	1		
8.11	Officers are identifiable and uniformed.	1		
8.12	Utilizes hand-held computer, license plate recognition, or equivalent systems that tie regulation, customer performance, and administrative service delivery together in a comprehensive way.	1		
8.13	Offers a transparent and publicly available appeals program.	1		
8.14	Offers appellants access to a multi-level review process.	1		
8.15	Considers the views of adjudicators when regulations are designed.	1		
8.16	Demonstrates that citations written in error represent fewer than 2 percent of all citations.	1		
8.17	Uses a fine collection process.	1		
8.18	The fine collection process collects 80 percent or more of fines.	1		
8.19	Maintains a boot/tow policy.	1		
8.20	Trains officer/third-party providers in the boot/tow process in customer service and conflict resolution.	1		
8.21	Provides 24-hour service at impound facility and vehicle storage areas.	1		
TOTAL ST	TANDARD SCORE	19	0	

Accredited	with Distinction Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE
8.22	Demonstrates an advanced degree of care for the customer during the enforcement, adjudication, and collection process.	1		
8.23	Enforcement staff works with customer service staff to ensure that service issues are dealt with in the office environment rather than in the public eye.	1		
8.24	Uses principles of parking supply/demand measurement, capture, and patrol frequency to optimize the enforcement process.	1		
8.25	Works proactively with the court system to ensure that regulations are being documented and processed in an acceptable manner and that new practices and procedures will be supported by the adjudication process.	1		
8.26	Utilizes customer-performance data to determine appropriate corrective action.	1		
8.27	Provides appellants access to an objective third-party (court of law, adjudication committee, etc.).	1		
8.28	Adopted parking ambassador program or approach.	1		
TOTAL A	CCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION SCORE	7	0	

9.0 Safety, Security and Risk Management				
Accredited	l Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE
9.1	Outlines safety and security philosophy in organization objectives and values.	R		
9.2	Documents effective workplace safety and risk management practices.	1		
9.3	Maintains SOPs or manuals and conducts testing, drills, and emergency communication procedures (i.e., 911, police, fire, administration, supervision.)	R		
9.4	Conducts periodic inspection of facility infrastructure and maintains documentation of inspections.	1		
9.5	Incorporates passive and active security measures in facility design and operation.	1		
9.6	Responds to public safety inquiries.	1		
9.7	Security staff are identifiable and uniformed.	1		
9.8	Trains security staff to respond to public safety and security issues.	1		
9.9	Documents point load limit for parking structures.	1		
TOTAL S	TANDARD SCORE	7	0	
Accredited	l with Distinction Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE
9.10	Participates in community safety and security organizations.	1		
9.11	Utilizes customer surveys in assessing security and safety measures.	1		
9.12	Develops safety-oriented partnerships with stakeholder and other interested groups.	1		
9.13	Provides onsite security staff or equivalent personnel.	1		
TOTAL A	CCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION SCORE	4	0	

<b>10.0 St</b>	10.0 Sustainability				
Accredited	l Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE	
10.1	Demonstrates a strategic commitment to environmental sustainability.	R			
10.2	Demonstrates implementation of sustainable practices that showcase a direct reduction in energy or resource use.	R			
10.3	Provides incentives to promote use of low-emitting and fuel-efficient or alternative-fuel vehicles.	1			
10.4	Demonstrates use of alternative-fuel fleet vehicles.	1			
10.5	Provides payment system in parking facilities to reduce idling upon exiting.	1			
10.6	Recycles or repurposes materials and equipment (recycling paper, reusing signs).	1			
10.7	Uses energy-efficient lighting systems and/or controls in parking facilities.	1			
10.8	Uses energy-efficient, environmentally favorable heating ventilation and air conditioning (HVAC) systems and/or controls in facilities requiring ventilation or facilities designed without mechanical ventilation.	1			
10.9	Uses halon-free fire-suppression systems.	1			
10.10	Demonstrates planning for continued sustainability gains.	1			
TOTAL ST	TANDARD SCORE	8	0		
Accredited	l with Distinction Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE	
10.11	Achieved Green Garage Certification, LEED Certification, Green Globes rating, or equivalent certification for at least one parking facility.	1			
10.12	Posts policies regarding sustainability in prominent public space.	1			
10.13	Manager(s) directly responsible for day-to-day parking operations has earned and maintained a qualified environmental sustainability credential.	1			
10.14	Implemented external wayfinding system to reduce time spent searching for a parking space.	1			
10.15	Implemented internal wayfinding system within parking facility or facilities to reduce time drivers spend locating a space.	1			
10.16	Installed and maintains electric vehicle charging stations.	1			
10.17	Provides tire inflation stations or mobile tire inflation services.	1			
10.18	Implemented water-reduction technologies/strategies.	1			
10.19	Roofing system designed to reduce heat-island effect and/or provide stormwater mitigation.	1			

10.20	Generates renewable energy on site, and/or purchases renewable energy credits.	1		
10.21	Provides proactive parking facility maintenance plan.	1		
10.22	Uses permeable materials in at least in one surface parking facility.	1		
TOTAL A	CCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION SCORE	12	0	
<b>11.0</b> A	ccess Management			
Accredited	l Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE
11.1	Demonstrates a commitment to reducing or distributing travel demand.	R		
11.2	Charges for parking to impact transportation choice.	1		
11.3	Provides for, or supports, the use of bicycles.	1		
11.4	Provides for or supports the use of carpooling or vanpooling.	1		
11.5	Uses parking guidance, traffic management, or parking reservation systems.	1		
11.6	Provides for, or supports, car share programs or services.	1		
11.7	Provides for, or support, bicycle share programs or services.	1		
11.8	Parking facilities are located at least .25 miles from mass transit services.	1		
TOTAL ST	TANDARD SCORE	7	0	
Accredited	l with Distinction Criteria	Possible	Achieved	
11.9	Participates in a Transportation Management Agency or similar organization aimed at reducing congestion and travel demand.	1		
11.10	Provides for, or supports, guaranteed ride home programs and services.	1		
11.11	Provides for, or supports, ride matching services.	1		
11.12	Provides for, or supports, transit, universal bus pass, or shuttle services.	1		
11.13	Provides short-term, occasional parking options for flexible commuting.	1		
11.14	Parking facilities are part of or proximate to transit-oriented developments.	1		
TOTAL A	CCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION SCORE	6	0	

12.0 Marketing and Communications				
Accredited	l Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE
12.1	Develops and maintains a communications and marketing plan that supports the program's larger strategic goals.	R		
12.2	Strategic planning documents specifically focus on communications and marketing that are reviewed annually and current.	1		
12.3	Annual budget includes dedicated funding for communication and marketing activities.	R		
12.4	Provides opportunities for customer feedback (at least quarterly) and responds to feedback.	1		
12.5	Media relations protocols include a specific list of approved media spokespeople and chain-of-command for approving and reviewing information that is released to the media.	1		
12.6	Employs a current media list that includes key media organizations and contact information for key staff.	1		
12.7	Uses a press/news release template.	1		
12.8	Crisis/emergency situation protocols, including a specific list of key contacts, clearly defined chain-of-command and areas of responsibility, are in place.	1		
12.9	Maintains expedited method of communication specifically for crisis/emergency situations.	1		
12.10	Maintains policies and/or procedures for addressing annual, seasonal, campaign-based, and event-specific communications functions in a timely manner (i.e., special events, construction, service disruption, routine maintenance).	1		
12.11	Branding includes a logo or distinct visual marker that is consistent across media.	1		
12.12	Website includes 1) map of facilities, pricing, payment options, 2) contact email, phone number, hours of operation; 3) instructions for after-hours emergencies; 4) how to pay and/or appeal a citation; 5) information on monthly parking, if applicable; 6) ADA information.	1		
TOTAL ST	TANDARD SCORE	10	0	

Accredited	with Distinction Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE
12.14	Shares best practices in marketing and communications with parking industry colleagues.	1		
12.15	Conducts information sessions for the public and can demonstrate how feedback is incorporated into operational efforts.	1		
12.16	Posts up-to-date information on programs and practices in public places and online.	1		
12.17	Participates in public events, public-education sessions, lunch-and-learn sessions, or other awareness- and confidence-building activities.	1		
12.18	Utilizes new communication technologies (YouTube, social media, blogs, etc.) to reinforce its message to the public.	1		
12.19	Uses resources to support community quality-of-life programs.	1		
TOTAL A	CCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION SCORE	6	0	

13.0 D	13.0 Data Management and Security			
Accredited	l Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE
13.1	Has a policy for protecting sensitive data and retaining or destroying secure data.	R		
13.2	Provides a policy that outlines the type of Personally Idenitifable Information (PII) used/collected, individual responsibilities, how sensitive data is processed when expired, and references appropriate laws.	1		
13.3	Provides a policy that defines how access to systems is managed and controlled.	1		
13.4	Contractually requires all vendors to follow the applicant's data and IT security policies.	1		
13.5	Maintains inventory of all IT assets and data assets and where they are located.	1		
13.6	For organizations accepting payment cards: Submits to Payment Card Industry (PCI) certification or self-certifications, and ensures timely security scans; any issues are documented and resolved in a timely manner.	1		
13.7	Employing Tokenization for web based transactions.	1		
13.8	Reviews existing systems to ensure that necessary patches and updates (operating systems, applications, etc.) are performed and implemented in a timely manner.	1		
13.9	Uses firewalls, gateway antivirus, intrusion-detection devices, and other forms of dynamic monitoring to screen for vulnerabilities.	1		
13.10	All equipment and services purchased are certified as PCI-DSS- or PA-DSS- compliant.	R		
13.11	Vulnerability scans should be performed and reviewed monthly (at a minimum).	1		
13.12	Encrypts all sensitive personal information and credit card data.	1		
TOTAL S	TANDARD SCORE	10	0	

Accredited with Distinction Criteria			Achieved	EVIDENCE
13.13	Conducts a quarterly review of users and their permissions.	1		
13.14	Vulnerability scan should be performed and reviewed weekly (at a minimum).	1		
13.15	Servers are in locked cabinets or secure locations and firewalls are actively managed with consistent monitoring for intrusion (PCI requirement).	1		
13.16	Purges non-essential data in accordance with the data-retention policy.	1		
13.17	Ensures that all employees complete annual data security, PII, or PCI recurring training.	1		
13.18	Retains an inventory of all devices connected to network that touch or store personal or credit card data.	1		
13.19	Has limited, or eliminated, the use of removable data/media storage and any writeable media related to personal or credit card data.	1		
13.20	Has a response plan for a data security breach.	1		
13.21	Employing Point to Point Encryption solutions.	1		
TOTAL STANDARD SCORE		9	0	

14.0 Third-Party Contractors and Service Level Agreements							
Accredited	l Criteria	Possible	Achieved	EVIDENCE			
14.1	Maintains active contracts with external service providers.	R					
14.2	Uses Memorandums of Understanding (MOUs) or (Service Level Agreements (SLAs) with internal service providers.	1					
14.3	Contracts/agreements include a defined start and end date, and clear and precise renewal terms.	1					
14.4 Contracts/agreements include a statement of work that clearly defines the work to be performed by contractor/service provider.							
14.5 Contracts/agreements incorporate specific performance objectives and a written process of measuring and assessing progress toward goals and objectives.		1					
<ul> <li>Holds periodic performance reviews with third parties and identifies</li> <li>performance deficiencies against performance objectives annually (at a minimum).</li> </ul>		1					
14.7	Documents the specific modules of accreditation that third parties deliver on behalf of the applicant.	1					
14.8	Maintains process/policy for amending contracts/agreements, including clear documentation of changes.	1					
TOTAL S	TANDARD SCORE	7	0				
Accredited with Distinction Criteria			Achieved	EVIDENCE			
14.9	Requires performance guarantees in contracts, MOUs, and/or SLAs.	1					
TOTAL A	CCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION SCORE	1	0				

SUMN	IARY - REQUIRED	Possible	Achieved	
1.0	Governance and Organization	2		
2.0	Planning & Monitoring	2		
3.0	Financial Budgeting and Financial Management	2		
4.0	Customer Service	2		
5.0	Personnel Education & Development	2		
6.0	Access & Revenue Control	1		
7.0	Asset Maintenance	2		
8.0	Regulations, Enforcement, Adjudication, and Collections	2		
9.0	Safety, Security, and Risk Management	2		
10.0	Sustainability	2		
11.0	Access Management	1		
12.0	Marketing and Communications	2		
13.0	Data Management and Security	2		
14.0	Third-Party Contractors and Service-Level Agreements	1		
	TOTAL REQUIRED	25		
	100% THRESHOLD FOR AWARD OF ACCREDITED PARKING	25	0	
	ORGANIZATION			
SUMN	IARY - GENERAL	Possible	Achieved	
1.0	Governance and Organization	6	0	
2.0	Planning & Monitoring	4	0	
3.0	Financial Budgeting and Financial Management	8	0	
4.0	Customer Service	8	0	
5.0	Personnel Education & Development	9	0	
6.0	Access & Revenue Control	21	0	
7.0	Asset Maintenance	7	0	
8.0	Regulations, Enforcement, Adjudication, and Collections	19	0	
9.0	Safety, Security, and Risk Management	7	0	
10.0	Sustainability	8	0	
11.0	Access Management	7	0	
12.0	Marketing and Communications	10	0	
13.0	Data Management and Security	10	0	
14.0	Third-Party Contractors and Service-Level Agreements	7	0	
	TOTAL GENERAL	131	0	
	80% THRESHOLD FOR AWARDING ACCREDITED PARKING ORGANIZATION	105	0	

II	Site Visit Field Assessment Checklist	43	
	80% THRESHOLD FOR AWARDING ACCREDITED PARKING	<u></u>	
	ORGANIZATION	34	0
Part I			
	REQUIRED	25	0
	GENERAL	105	0
	TOTAL FOR PART I	130	0
Part II			
	GENERAL	34	0
	TOTAL FOR PART II	34	0
	ACCREDITATION GRAND TOTAL	164	0
			U
		-	
SUM	MARY - ACCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION	N	
1.0	Governance and Organization	5	0
2.0	Planning & Monitoring	4	0
3.0	Financial Budgeting and Financial Management	7	0
4.0	Customer Service	10	0
5.0	Personnel Education & Development	5	0
6.0	Access & Revenue Control	3	0
7.0	Asset Maintenance	7	0
8.0	Regulations, Enforcement, Adjudication, and Collections	7	0
9.0	Safety, Security, and Risk Management	4	0
10.0	Sustainability	12	0
11.0	Access Management	6	0
12.0	Marketing and Communications	6	0
13.0	Data Management and Security	9	0
14.0	Third-Party Contractors and Service-Level Agreements	1	0
	TOTAL ACCREDITED WITH DISTINCTION	86	0
	80% THRESHOLD FOR AWARDING ACCREDITED WITH		
	DISTINCTION PARKING ORGANIZATION	69	0

NCTION GRAND 69 0
-------------------

# **APPENDIX G**

Supporting Practices from Other Communities and Detailed Peer City Metrics

## Best Practices and Success Stories

## Foundational Recommendations

Create a Parking and Mobility Services department with the primary responsibility of managing the parking system, creating long-term strategy, and implementing all recommendations.

#### San Francisco, CA

Parking operations in San Francisco have been under the purview of the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Authority since 1999. Along with parking, SFMTA also oversees all city transit under the San Francisco Muni brand, traffic operations, bicycling, walking, and regulates taxi services.

Prior to 1999, the above-listed divisions were decentralized and under the purview of multiple different city agencies. By uniting them under one agency, the management of all transportation modes was integrated with a mission of optimizing the use of transportation assets and the quality of the travel experience regardless of which mode or combination of modes are being used. The SFMTA organizational structure also includes a Division of Sustainable Streets, which is a focal point for the agency's mobility management mission.

Long-range transportation policymaking and planning are also conducted within and by SFMTA. As a result, the formulation of long-term strategies and transportation goals and implementation of those strategies and goals can be coordinated, streamlined, and centralized, with parking, traffic, and multi-mobility all working together towards the accomplishment of the same common strategies and goals.

#### Rapid City, SD

In 2016, a Downtown Parking Study was conducted, which led to the identification of the following challenges and obstacles with Rapid City's parking system that impeded the downtown parking system's ability to effectively serve users. These included:

- On-street parking was free (time-limited only) in many high-demand areas, but some obsolete parking meters did exist in lower-demand areas where they weren't warranted or needed
- City's focus was on penalization for violating parking restrictions instead of managing demand via a market-based approach
- Time limits were longer in high-demand areas than lower-demand ones
- A variety of time limits, with some block faces having spaces with multiple sets of restrictions and/or parking fees
- Lack of technology needed for good enforcement
- Employees occupying much of the most convenient and highest-demand free and paid parking in the city center and high-activity areas
- Employees were not taking advantage of an available option for monthly permit parking in some off-street facilities despite availability
- No option for on-street employee permit parking, even along low-demand or periphery streets

• Management and operations technology used in the off-street facilities was not consistent with technology used for managed on-street parking

In response to these challenges and obstacles, the Downtown Area Master Plan was published and adopted in 2017, with recommended solutions including:

- Removing obsolete technology
- Installing a unified PARCS solution for all managed and paid parking, on-street and off-street
- Universal two-hour time limit for free time-limited parking around downtown periphery
- Employee parking permit program for on-street parking around periphery
- Incentives to get employees to use off-street monthly permit parking

Beginning in 2019, most of the recommendations made were implemented, including a revamp of PARCS technology. Parkers can pay at on-street smart meters, pay stations located throughout the city center, or through a smartphone app. Technology and meters are smart enough to detect if spaces are occupied and can feed real-time parking availability information to parkers, reducing "cruising" behavior

Part of the city's revamp included a mission to educate the public and be open and transparent with the goals of managed parking downtown, which are stated on the parking system's site and in other areas. Ordinances were implemented in order to encourage turnover of parking downtown and to encourage longer-term and employee parkers to park on the perimeter of downtown.

In 2021, local news station KEVN reported that the parking meter app was gaining popularity, and that 2020 revenue from meters and permits amounted to about \$1.3 million.<sup>1</sup>

## Set a target level of cost recovery for the department.

## Portland, OR

Portland's Parking Facilities Fund, an enterprise fund, supports the operations and maintenance of the six city-owned parking garages in the SmartPark garage system. The garage system includes about 3,800 parking spaces and approximately 72,000 square feet of commercial space. These assets are the primary revenue sources for the Fund.

The City has structured its cost recovery for the parking system in such a manner that the system is designed to generate excess revenue above and beyond simply meeting operating costs. Any revenues that remain after annual overhead transfers to the city's general fund are made to pay for parking related services provided by other city departments, debt payments are made on construction debt, and after all operating, maintenance, capital, and other fund requirements have been met go to the City's Transportation Operating Fund. These requirements also include a 10% operating reserve fund to cover revenue shortfalls or unexpected costs. This reserve is sized based on a percentage of the budget for fixed expenses. The fund has the option to adjust rates in order to replenish reserves if they fall under the 10% target and/or use reserves for capital improvements or construction. Parking rates in the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> https://www.blackhillsfox.com/2021/01/23/parking-meter-app-gaining-popularity/

garages may be adjusted by the Portland Bureau of Transportation without having to seek approval from Portland's City Council.

The Parking Facilities Fund has a major maintenance account to ensure that garage assets will remain in a state of good repair. This account is not used to replace buildings or infrastructure; it is only used for continuous maintenance improvements. Also, the Fund includes a set-aside for future equipment replacements and upgrades.

#### Sacramento, CA

Sacramento's public parking system operates under a hybrid enterprise/general fund model, with different cost recovery goals for each. On-street parking operates under a general fund model with cost recovery structured to offset costs. Off-street parking operates under an enterprise model with cost recovery structured to generate excess revenue.

The Parking Services Division's on-street parking facilities and real property rental leases are directed to the City's General Fund. Under the City of Sacramento Municipal Code Chapter, meter revenues are dedicated for parking enforcement and regulation uses, operation of off-street parking facilities, and management and maintenance of on-street parking spaces.

The Parking Services Division's off-street parking facilities and real property rental leases are operated as an enterprise fund, called the Parking Fund. The Parking Fund is restricted and can only be used on operational transactions for off-street facilities.

The Parking Fund has had stable revenue growth due to its maintaining occupancy rates and new leases for tenant spaces consistent with forecasts. Fiscal Year 2020 revenues are expected to be approximately \$16.9 million. Revenues are projected to remain steady in FY2019/20 and then increase by 1% annually. Expenditures are projected to grow by approximately 2% annually.

Because Sacramento's enterprise fund model has its own dedicated capital fund to pay for projects, it faces fewer challenges undertaking maintenance, new projects, technology or other initiatives. Further, revenue surpluses are allocated to pay for minor maintenance projects such as surface or wall cracks, and lighting.

The Parking Services Division does not have a debt coverage ratio requirement and generally uses City treasury funds to invest in major capital projects, due to favorable interest rates. The Parking Services Division also transfers a percentage of its revenue surplus to the General Fund to support the City as a whole.

#### Robust and consistent signage and wayfinding program for all parking facility options.

#### Easton, PA

In 2019, the City of Easton transitioned its paid public parking garages to a gateless system with pay-onfoot parking stations. These operational and technology changes made existing signage functionally obsolete. As a result, the City needed to overhaul existing signage in order to reflect the new gateless system. As part of the process for upgrading the signage, it was identified that the garages lacked a consistent brand and design aesthetic for their signage. Parking wayfinding signage directing to the garages and within the garages was lacking, and informational signage was small and inconsistent.

In order to address these problems, the City expanded the scope of signage replacement to accommodate a revamped, unified design and brand being deployed across the parking signage system. The design united informational signage and wayfinding signage under one identity, color scheme, and a unified overall aesthetic. Also, new signage placed on the garage façades, large in size and conspicuously placed at key decision points, would clearly communicate both the names of the garages as well as key information about how managed/paid parking operates within the garages in order to speed up transactions by reducing the time needed for first-time visitors to figure out what to do after parking.



#### Davis, CA

The City of Davis, CA is a large city about halfway between San Francisco and Sacramento, home to the University of California – Davis. The city has a large public parking system downtown that encompasses two parking structures and multiple surface lots. By 2017, public parking facilities were nearing capacity during peak times, especially on weekdays. Visitors to downtown would cause traffic congestion by circulating around downtown streets and in close-in surface lots waiting for a space to become available while peripheral lots and the garages frequently had plenty of extra capacity.

In order to reduce such activity and better balance parking use across the system, City staff and Council became interested in ways to make the parking system work more efficiently. While the City had an existing parking signage and wayfinding system that featured a unified design, all existing signage was static, and some parking facilities were not clearly identified on some signage. There was no easy way to communicate parking availability in real time to drivers, nor was there an easy way to let drivers know when parking facilities were near or at capacity.

To help address some of these problems, the City installed a systemwide automated parking guidance system (APGS). Dynamic electronic signage installed with the system complemented and incorporated the existing design and brand of public parking signage while prominently featuring the parking facility name on all new signs installed. In addition, central wayfinding signs were constructed on main entrance roads. With the new system, accurate parking occupancy counting systems were put into place for all downtown parking facilities.

When the system was completed in 2020, drivers entering the downtown could be informed of parking availability in real time via highly visible digital roadside signs, making parking easier to locate. A decrease in vehicular circulating activity was observed, reducing traffic congestion and increasing safety. The technology behind the system also could provide parking occupancy data and reports to the City

parking division, enabling the City to understand facility utilization patterns to a high level of detail and accuracy, reducing the need for manual data collection.



## Short-Term Parking Management Recommendations

Establish paid on-street parking in core areas and set rates in a manner commensurate with Downtown's density and scale

## Idaho Springs, CO

Idaho Springs is a small mountain community located along the I-70 Freeway corridor and is the first incorporated mountain town on the corridor after leaving metro Denver. Though it is a small town of about 2,000, it sees significant tourism that has grown considerably in recent years. By 2018, public parking in Idaho Spring's central business district was near or at capacity. According to one elected official, the parking situation was so dire that people would leave Idaho Springs because they could not successfully find any available parking. Also, it was noted that employees were taking up much of the on-street parking.

Council voted unanimously to implement metered parking in its downtown in 2019, initially as part of a trial program from May through October. Managed parking enabled the Town to begin regular data collection on occupancy to determine whether new off-street parking assets were/are needed and, if so, how many additional spaces were needed.

Initially, the parking rate was set at \$1 per hour for the first three hours for visitors. City residents and employees could park for free after registering with the city's private parking operator. In 2021, however, rates were changed, and other changes were made in order to fine-tune the system based on feedback and observations over a two-year period.

As of 2022, key features of the program are:

- On-street parking
  - \$0.25 per 15 minutes for the first hour
    - Free parking for the first 30 minutes was eliminated in 2021
  - \$1.50 per hour for the first 3 hours; \$5.00 per hour thereafter
  - Paid parking area was expanded
  - Paid parking resets to lowest rate for returning visitors after at least a 3-hour absence per day

- City residents can park for free anywhere
- Permits moved to being renewed bi-annually
- Off-street parking
  - \$1 per hour for first 5 hours instead of first 3 hours.
  - County residents and employees can only park for free in designated areas
  - County residents are limited to 3 hours of free parking

According to the Idaho Springs Downtown Plan, published in December 2021, the paid parking system "has been successful at better managing parking and increasing the turnover rate, netting additional revenue for the city."

## Manitou Springs, CO

Hikers and outdoor recreators coming to Manitou Springs began to engage in serious competition for off- and on-street public parking with downtown visitors, residents, and employees in Manitou Springs in the 2000s. Beginning in 2007 with the City's Parking Management Study & Strategic Plan, the Town began a series of planning efforts to systemically address its parking challenges. In conjunction with a beautification project for Manitou Ave., the City's central business corridor, the City implemented metered parking using multi-space meters along Manitou Avenue in stages in the early 2010s.

Some areas were designated for resident permit parking only. Between 2010 and 2016, the paid parking areas were vastly expanded to include Ruxton Avenue and most off-street city lots. In that time period, paid parking helped to significantly improve parking turnover along the central business corridor, with Barr Trail, Pikes Peak, and Incline hikers and outdoor recreators not occupying that parking for extended lengths of time on most days

Paid parking also helped fund notable improvements to the parking system, such as the paving of the Barr Trail Parking Lot, signage and wayfinding, and a free shuttle that transports parkers from free satellite/periphery lots located east of downtown to destinations within the central business area as well as to the major trail heads and to the Cog Railway.

Throughout the 2010s and into 2022, many significant changes and revisions were made to all aspects of the City's paid parking system. In 2020, the paid parking area was extended/enlarged again, and some resident permit only areas were added.

Paid parking is structured as follows:

- 30 minutes of free parking
  - On-street rates
    - \$1 \$2 per hour, depending on location and demand
    - In effect 7 AM 6 PM 7 days a week
  - Off-street rates
    - Free parking on east side of town
    - All lots have graduated rate structures depending on lot with notable increases per each time period tier
    - Lot for Barr Trail is a flat \$20 per day to accommodate hikers and outdoor recreators and account for very high demand in the 40-space lot

In 2022, the latest changes to the paid parking system include:

- Dynamic pricing was introduced, where parking downtown for 1 3 hours is \$2 per hour but is only \$1.50 per hour outside of downtown
- \$10 an hour parking for stays over 8 hours was implemented to further discourage all-day parking
- Seasonality was introduced, with parking in winter months less expensive than summer
- A program was implemented that distributes free parking credits for residents.
  - o One credit is equal to one hour of parking downtown or at local parks
  - Each resident gets 50 credits annually
- A pass for regular visitors to Manitou was created with discounted parking rates, purchased in 10hour increments for \$15 per 10 hours.

During special events, some other public and private parking facilities in and around Manitou become available for parking, such as Manitou Springs High and Middle Schools, Hiawatha Gardens, or Briarhurst Manor. On such days, free shuttles transport parkers from these event-only lots to downtown and other key destinations.

Create a framework that allows for variable pricing for very high-demand days, like event days

#### Sacramento, CA

In Sacramento, on-street public parking operates as a tiered system. The base rate is \$1.75 per hour with 4 meter tiers. Each tier represents the time limit for parking at the base rate. Tiers range from 1+ hour to 4+ hours. For all tiers, the rate for next hour after the time limit is \$3. For each hour thereafter, the rate is \$3.75. Some long-term meters exist that allow for up to 10 hours of parking with a \$3 or \$6 max rate, depending on location.



Source: City of Sacramento

In addition to different tiers that vary based on location, with lower tiers representing higher-demand parking areas, there is also a separate rate schedule for special events. Event rates apply during events where more than 15,000 attendees are expected within a designated special event parking zone. During events, an event flat rate applies after the tiered time limit expires. The base rate for all tiers is \$1.75. For Tier 1, the flat rate is \$14; for Tier 2, the flat rate is \$15.25; for Tier 3, the flat rate is \$13.50.

Under the City of Sacramento Municipal Code, parking meter zones are designated, giving the parking manager the authority to install, regulate, and control all meters in the system. Parking meter rates are set by ordinance. Meters are operational in the parking meter zone Monday through Saturday (except for legal holidays) between the hours of 8:00 a.m. and 6:00 p.m. The parking manager can add meters within a zone without needing to seek approval from the City Council. However, if meters are added, the parking manager is expected to do so in a transparent fashion, engaging in a process of community engagement.

#### Seattle, WA

In Seattle, on-street parking rates and time limits vary by zone and time of day. Morning rates are in effect between 8 AM and 11 AM. Midday rates are in effect between 11 AM and 5 PM. Evening rates are in effect between 5 PM and 8 PM (5 PM and 10 PM in some zones). Morning rates range from \$0.50 to \$2 per hour. Midday rates range from \$1 per hour to \$4 per hour. Evening rates range from \$0.50 to \$2.50 per hour. In some zones, parking is free after 6 PM with no evening rate in effect.

In some districts, event rates may apply. Event rates apply during events where more than 10,000 attendees are expected within the Uptown and Uptown Triangle zones. During events, between 5 PM and 10 PM, the first 2 hours of parking are \$3 per hour. Additional hours after the first 2 are \$8 per hour.

#### Brookline, MA

The downtown in Brookline experiences significant increases in parking demand during Red Sox games. Until 2011, on-street parking per hour was the same during non-event days as it was during Red Sox games. The rates, which were significantly cheaper than off-street market rates during games, resulted in traffic and parking crunches.

In 2011, the Town implemented event parking rates for Red Sox games. For hours after the 2<sup>nd</sup> hour, the rate increased from \$1.50 per hour to \$10 per hour. Town planners hoped that the rate hike, in addition to generating extra revenue and aligning the market rate of spaces with off-street parking in the area, would encourage Red Sox fans to park further away from Beacon Street or to simply take transit instead of driving and parking.

## Long-Term Parking Management Recommendations

#### Leverage existing options

## Arizona State University Parking System

Arizona State University operates and manages a total of 11 parking structures across its four campuses, which have a combined student population of about 100,000. One of the goals and main focus points of ASU's Parking and Transit Services is to efficiently manage the parking system such that use of existing

parking inventory is maximized. By maximizing use of existing parking resources, the need to construct new or additional parking can be delayed or eliminated entirely.

Through a mixture of strategic planning work, working with the right partners, and creativity, ASU believes it has attained much success with its parking system management. Beginning in 2015, ASU prioritized implementing the latest in parking technology, partnering with many established technology vendors to cater to the many different stakeholder groups that ASU serves. Implementation of smart technologies, such as the use of license plate reader technology (LPR) for more regular and streamlined enforcement, had the effect of improving customer service for parkers as well as increasing parking revenues across the same parking inventory. The technology provided ASU's parking department more insight into where parking crunches existed and how to manage parking more efficiently. Better data also helped to prevent over-construction of new parking.

In light of ASU's commitment to maximize usage of existing parking assets through efficient management and technology, ASU was named IPI's Parking Program of the Year in 2017.

## Sacramento, CA

Another effective option in leveraging existing underused parking is through shared parking contracts with private landowners. The City of Sacramento Parking Division (SacPark) takes an active role in promoting and facilitating efficient operations of off-street parking assets by offering resources and partnering with the private sector.

The Parking Division offers the following important programs specific to efficient use of existing parking resources through shared parking contracts: Managed Parking Solutions and the Certified Partners Program.

For Managed Parking Solutions, the Parking Division offers four types of services for privately-owned parking facilities: Enforcement only, payment management and enforcement, enforcement and monthly parking contracts, or full management. The program is meant to ease the operational burden on private entities operating and managing private parking resources along with maximizing accessibility, efficiency, and revenue. Program participants include parking facilities associated with a variety of user types, such as government entities, office complexes, mixed-use residential and others.

The Certified Partners Program aims to increase the use of privately-owned parking assets with available inventory by providing marketing and operational assistance. Participating facilities in the Certified Partners Program are included in SacPark's online parking reservation system and mobile parking app, as well as cashless payment functionality. The program also includes a no-risk three-month trial period and options for enforcement, revenue control, validation and other management assistance upgrades from SacPark.

#### Build an off-street parking permit program

#### Bozeman, MT

The City of Bozeman, MT has a high activity downtown with a limited parking supply, similar to Loveland's in size and scope. In order to minimize the prevalence of employees parking on-street, with

an interest of maximizing space turnover for convenient, scarce on-street spaces and keeping foot traffic for downtown businesses high, a two-hour time limit for all managed on-street parking in the downtown is enforced. Long-term parkers are encouraged to park off-street.

There is a total of four off-street public parking lots and one public parking garage. As of 2021, monthly parking permits are offered in all city-owned public parking lots for \$60 per month and in the Bridger Park Garage for \$80 per month. Permits are available for 30-day periods or for a full year, with those electing to purchase a permit for a whole year receiving a 10% discount over the month rate (12 months of permits). The 10% discount acts as an incentive to get permit buyers to buy a permit for a year.

## Santa Monica, CA

The City of Santa Monica, through its parking operator SP +, provides many options for long-term parkers or employees to park in its off-street parking facilities. Permits are only valid for certain structures or lots depending on the exact location of a place of employment for which the permit is tied, and rates vary by location. One example is Main Street employees. For employees along Main Street, who may purchase permits that allow parking in two specific facilities, permits are offered monthly, semi-annually, or annually, for \$20 per month, \$105 per semi-annual period, or \$155 per year respectively as of 2022.

In addition, the City offers a parking validation program for employees. Employee parking validation program. In certain designated city garages, employees who work within a designated area may purchase up to 20 validations per month.

For both permits and validations, employees must present a valid photo ID and proof of employment location in order to make a purchase. Two validation types are offered: up to 6 hours of parking per validation for \$6 and up to 9 hours of parking per validation for \$9. Per-hour costs for validations are lower than typical day parking rates, assuming employees are parked for the full time period allowed per validation type (6 or 9 hours).

## Consider an on-street parking permit program in the mid- to long-term

#### Columbus, OH

High Street is one of the most important thoroughfares in Columbus, connecting downtown with the University District, where the main campus for The Ohio State University is located. Land uses along the corridor are mixed, and the corridor goes through many residential neighborhoods. As a result, parking demands are high, and spillover parking and the crowding out of residents was a problem.

To address these challenges, the City established six residential permit parking zones along the High Street corridor. Paid parking via mobile payment only was employed in all six zones. The zones further from High Street were set at a lower hourly rate than the zones nearest High Street. Permits are offered to residents and businesses to park on-street and exceed posted three-hour time limit. Business permits are time-restricted after four permits.

Non-permitted vehicles must pay to park using mobile payment between 8:00 a.m. – 10:00 p.m. Paid parking manages spillover and encourages parking turnover, while generating valuable revenues to

promote access and mobility in the area. Other than High Street, payment is collected via mobile payment only. Permits are virtual and enforcement is done with mobile license plate recognition.

Collected on-street parking revenue (minus City operations and administrative expenses) is reinvested back into the area to manage existing parking; improve signage, wayfinding, and communications; improve parking technology; and promote mobility alternatives, such as car share, bike share, discounted TNC usage, discounted transit passes, and shuttling to discounted remote parking facilities.

A committee of community representatives advises on parking management in the area, including how parking benefit district funds should be spent.

## Boulder, CO

The City of Boulder has a robust on-street parking permit program that provides permit options for residents, employees who live within Boulder, and non-resident commuters. Permits are available for any of Boulder's 12 Neighborhood Parking Permit zones. Managed/enforced times generally extend for business hours on weekdays, though some zones have longer hours and are also enforced on Saturdays, depending on the specific context and needs of each zone. Time limits for non-permitted vehicles range from zero to three hours, depending on zone. Program details are summarized below:

- **Resident Permits.** These permits come in the form of a window sticker. The associated fee is \$30 per vehicle per calendar year, as of 2022. Each resident may purchase up to a maximum of two visitor permits for most zones for \$5 per permit, which enables stays of up to 24 hours per visitor. For any property over 4 units, or for the West Pearl NPP, the limit is one permit per person. Vehicles with resident permits may park anywhere within the permit area to which the permit is linked. Finally, residents may receive up to two guest permits that allow guests to park for periods of two weeks.
- **Business Employee Permits.** These permits come in the form of a hangtag. The associated fee is \$75 per permit per calendar year. Most eligible businesses may purchase up to three permits, though large businesses may apply for additional permits. According to Section 4-23-2-e, large businesses may be issued additional permits based on this formula: half the number of FTEs minus the number of off-street parking spaces under the control of the business at that location.

Vehicles with employee permits may park anywhere within the permit area to which the permit is linked. For businesses that have received more than three permits, the permits are linked to specific vehicles, and a list of vehicles for which permits are issued must be provided to the City as part of the application. The City excludes home occupations/businesses from the definition of "business" in the context of parking permits.

• **Commuter Permits.** These permits also come in the form of a hangtag. The associated fee is \$105 per permit per quarter, as of 2022. These permits are available only on a first-come, first-serve basis, and there is a set limit of how many commuter permits may be available in each NPP after resident and business/employer permits are accounted for.

A commuter permit lease doesn't guarantee space availability. Vehicles with commuter permits may only park on a particular assigned block number with the respective permit area. In Goss Grove, commuter permits issued to educational institutions (i.e., Naropa University) may take precedence over other employers.

By code, the maximum number of non-resident permits issued on any given block face within any zone is four. Also, the number of non-resident permits issued must be adjusted down if the on-street parking occupancy within a certain permit zone drops below 25% (15% in Goss-Grove) for 4 or more consecutive hours during weekdays.

Enforcement is conducted by parking enforcement officers employed by the City's Access and Parking Services Department using license plate reader (LPR) technology. Both mobile/handheld units and LPR-equipped vehicles are used.

## Code & Policy Recommendations

Consider developing a TDM ordinance to encourage new developments to participate in building a more multimodal downtown and reduce parking demand.

#### Denver, CO

In 2021, a new Transportation Demand Management Policy went into effect for all new developments within the City and County of Denver. The regulations require new developments to implement measures known as Transportation Demand Management (TDM) strategies that expand people's travel options and create attractive alternatives to driving.

The policy classifies all new developments into three different tiers, for which limits on the percentage of trips projected to be generated by single-occupancy vehicles (SOVs) have been placed. The tiers vary by land use type and intensity.

	TIER 0		TIER 2		
	No TDM requirements	Identify and construct TDM supportive infrastructure onsite or off site Assign a transportation coordinator Achieve a designated target commute SOV rate	All Tier 1 requirements + Identify and implement programmatic strategies + Conduct surveys to measure TDM program impacts + Demonstrate achievement of the target SOV rate		
Residential	0-24	25-49	50+		
	dwelling units	dwelling units	dwelling units		
Commerical	0-24,999	25,000-49,999	50,000+		
& Office	square feet	square feet	square feet		
Industrial	0-149,999	150,000-299,999	300,000+		
	square feet	square feet	square feet		

#### Source: City of Denver

Denver's TDM Plan will benefit the community by reducing the number of people driving, creating walkable, transit-friendly communities, and improving community health and the environment. Strategies provided under the ordinance are grouped into the following categories:

- Transit strategies
- Bicycle & pedestrian strategies
- Parking and carshare strategies

- Supportive strategies
- Event-related strategies

In all, 27 different strategies are provided, ranging from bicycle support amenities and new employee education kits to fully subsidized transit passes and transportation connection services

Examples of TDM strategies that developers may choose from to increase mobility options and reduce single occupancy vehicle trips, which contribute to traffic congestion and greater levels of greenhouse gas emissions include:

- Offering subsidized transit passes
- Supporting/offering car share opportunities
- Offering people who walk or bike to work amenities such as showers, lockers, and changing rooms
- Shared amenities for people who ride bikes, such as repair kits and air pumps
- Event or one-time transit passes or a transit validation program
- Eliminating policies/practices that subsidize parking and incentivize driving
- Work from Home and alternative work schedule policies

To assist developers, the City and County has issued a formal document containing all applicable rules and regulations, along with a publicly available Excel-based calculation tool designed to assist developers in understanding what TDM strategies may be required for them to meet the SOV requirements respective to their proposed development and achieve a desired rate of SOV trip reduction.

While the new policy does not affect parking requirements per se, it does limit developers' ability to provide parking in excess of the minimum in most cases. However, the percentage reductions allowed/projected for each strategy per the city's TDM calculator tool can also be used in support of providing parking below minimum requirements per a variance request, as SOV trips and parking demand are highly correlated (parking demand will decrease as SOV trip generation per site decreases).

As a result, the calculator provides another set of data points for percentage reductions possible or allowed in required parking supply or projected peak parking demand by selected TDM strategy. While the policy, and the percentage reductions allowed, are specific to the City and County of Denver, they were developed with the whole city in mind, and therefore are broadly applicable and account for a wide variety of densities and land use contexts.

TDM Measure Category	TDM Measure	Reduction	Notes
Transit	Subsidize Transit Passes (100% subsidized)	10.0%	Transit passes shall be offered at a 100% subsidy to all tenants through RTD's EcoPass program.
Strategies	Subsidize Transit Passes (min. 50% subsidy)	5.0%	Transit passes shall be offered at a minimum 50% subsidy to all tenants. Subsidies of 100% shall utilize the 100% subsidy strategy.

	Transit Station/Stop Investment	0.5%	The intent of this measure is to improve amenities provided at a bus stop (such as benches, shelters, real-time information). The transit stop should be on the subject property or within walking distance. This shall include long-term upkeep (such as through adopt-a-stop).		
	Transit Connection Services	7.0%	Shuttles should provide regular and predictable service between a worksite and and a high-frequency transit service.		
	Passenger pick- up/drop-off areas with Curb Management	0.5%	Shall only be used in conjunction with Transit Connection Services		
	Bicyclist Support: Shared Amenities (Non-residential)	2.0%	All of the following elements must be included in a location that is accessible to all tenants and employees: showers, lockers, changing rooms, bicycle repair kits.		
	Bicyclist Support: Shared Amenities (Residential)	0.5%	All of the following elements must be included and accessible to all tenants/residents: bicycle repair tools/kits, air pumps, adequate space to maintenance a bicycle		
Bicycle and Pedestrian	Provide bicycle, e-bike, or 14icromobility share	1.0%	Bike, e-bike, scooter or similar share/loaner program (separate from the publicly accessible options in the City) to provide employees and residents with short-term access for trips.		
Strategies	Subsidize shared mobility (e-bikes, e- scooters)		Provide at least \$30 a month for tenants to use on publicy accessible shared mobility options (such as shared e-bikes and scooters)		
	Pedestrian- and Cyclist-Scaled Wayfinding	0.5%	Provide signs, maps, and directions to point travelers to the location of nearby alternative commute routes, such as transit or shuttle routes, bicycle and pedestrian paths, as well as major nearby destinations.		
	Parking Fees	4.0%	Drivers must pay full market value for parking. Properties that validate parking (subsidize the cost of parking) are not eligible for this strategy. Cannot combine with Parking cash-out or Unbundled Parking.		
	Parking cash-out	4.0%	This allows people who would otherwise receive free parking to 'cash out' their parking in exchange for money instead of using the parking. Can not combine with Parking Fees or Unbundled Parking.		
	Unbundled Parking	4.0%	Lease or sell parking spaces separately from residential units or office space. Can not combine with Parking Fees or Parking Cash-out.		
Parking and Car Share	Preferential parking for sustainable modes	0.5%	Reserve the most desirable parking spaces for employees who use a sustainable mode such as carpool and vanpool to get to work.		
Strategies	Incentivize Carpooling/Vanpooling	0.5%	Actively promote carpooling and vanpooling through encouraging building occupants to register for the My Way to Go program to find carpool partners or through apps that utilize casual carpooling technology to provide flexible ridesharing solutions to building occupants. At a minimum, an annual event should be hosted to provide carpool/vanpool matching amongst employees. This can be hosted internally (transportation coordinator or other knowledgeable employee) or through My Way to Go.		
	Access to Car Share	1.0%	Provide preferential parking for car-share vehicle(s) and obtain a car-share service to utilize those parking spaces.		
Supportive Strategies	Membership in a Transportation Management Association (TMA)	3.0%	TMAs promote and facilitate TDM in specific service areas, and can provide TDM services and information to help properties meet their TDM goals. This strategy is only available for those within the boundaries served by the five (5) TMAs that currently serve the City of Denver. More information about service boundaries and services provided can be found by clicking the text in this box, which is hyperlinked.		
	Flexible Sustainable Transportation Incentive Fund	5.0%	Develop and manage an annual budget line item - the equivalent to the cost of providing an annual local pass to each residential unit or an annual local pass to each 1,000 square feet of occupiable building space. This funding is to be used on sustainable transportation incentives and programs.		

	Providing information via kiosks, transit screens, websites, or apps	1.0%	This strategy involves providing a physical (e.g., information kiosk or digital display) platform to provide information on transportation options, and could also leverage existing virtual platforms to increase effectiveness and reach. Information typically includes transit and shuttle maps and schedules, bike maps, location of car share and bike share as well as preferential carpool parking. Additional information displayed can include information on programs and promotions available to the target audience. Information should be specific to the building and not generalized to the region or City.
	New resident/employee kits	0.5%	Provide welcome kits to all new building occupants to educate them about transportation options available at their new residence or employment site. Minimum kit requirements: nearby transit route information, RTD tickets (min. 2 per resident/employee), bike map, bike parking information for location, and information on other TDM programs offered at the property. Depending on the service area micromobility credits (shared bikes and scooters) should be considered as well as any other relevant information specific to the site/location.
	Emergency Ride Home	0.5%	Emergency/Guaranteed Ride Home provides commuters who do not drive alone to work with a free ride home in case of an approved emergency. Instructions for utilizing the service should be easily found and posted in public spaces wherever possible (like OSHA posters).
	Offer Employees a Commuter Benefits Transit Account	0.5%	Employees shall be able to opt into a Commuter Benefits Transit Account to pay for transit passes and vanpool fees pre-tax. Cannot be combined with 100% Subsidized Transit.
	Teleworking / Work from Home Policy	1.0%	Applicable to offices only. Telework refers to allowing staff to work outside of the office some or all of the time. Telework can involve working from home, a satellite office or a telework center closer to home. Note: a new strategy will need to be selected if tenants do not have a policy that meets these requirements.
	Flexible or Alternative Work Schedules	0.5%	Applicable to offices only. Flexible work schedules allow eligible employees to vary their start and end times by a certain amount each day and allow for a compressed work week (for example a 4x10 schedule or 9x80). A new strategy will need to be selected if tenants do not have a policy that meets these requirements.
	On-site Child Care	2.0%	Include an on-site childcare facility to reduce commuting distances between households, places of employment, and childcare. The on-site childcare facility must comply with all state and City requirements.
Event- Related TDM	Event / One-time transit passes or Transit Validation Program	0.0%	Develop a program to provide visitors or customers with pre-paid transit passes or reimbursement for transit (similar to parking validation). This should be clearly advertised to visitors prior to their trip, such as in "how to get here" information on a webiste and/or emails.
Surategies	Valet Bike Parking	0.0%	Offer a valet bike parking service for use by employees and visitors.

Source: City of Denver

#### Aspen, CO

In 2014, the City of Aspen passed a Transportation Impact Analysis (TIA) Ordinance that applies to all new development within the City. The goal of the TIA process is to provide a technical approach to transportation impact analysis that is simple, consistent, and fair while ensuring that the City continue to meet certain trip limitation goals.

The purpose of a TIA is to assess transportation impacts of proposed projects on surrounding and supporting transportation infrastructure and services. It determines if the adverse effects constitute significant impacts and, if so, how the significant impacts can be mitigated. TDM programs in Aspen have been attributed to a 10% reduction in parking occupancy downtown, compared to before TDM programs were in place.

Depending on the age, type, and size of development, a TIA may or may not be required. Small developments and minor modifications of existing buildings may be exempt from a TIA.

Smaller projects require a Level One TIA. This level requires that the project determine its trips generated using a simple excel-based tool. The project will also be required to use the same tool to determine which measures it will use to mitigate those trips. This information must be submitted as part of the land use application, along with a narrative report.

Larger projects require a Level Two TIA. This level requires, at a minimum, a site plan review, trip generation capacity analysis and the use of the TDM/MMLOS tool to determine trip mitigation. The contents of a Level Two TIA will vary based on the nature of the proposed project.

The TIA Ordinance works in conjunction with alternative mobility and TDM programs offered within Aspen. The City of Aspen has fare-free local public transit within the city, and there is bus rapid transit service that connects Aspen with other communities in the region.

In conjunction with the TIA Ordinance, the city has a robust and comprehensive menu of TDM strategies available to its employees and residents. Examples of TDM used in Aspen include area-wide rideshare, city-coordinated local rideshare agreements, carpool parking permits, employer-based support programs, customized "zone passes" for employees that provide unlimited transit use for certain transit districts outside Aspen, and special events for commuters who use alternative modes of transit, including regular carpool/vanpool prizes and incentives.

Identify a codified ongoing funding source for the Downtown parking and mobility system, such as an in-lieu fee program or similar, or a combination of options

#### Golden, CO

The City of Golden has had a long-standing fee-in-lieu policy in place that allows developers to pay a fee to the City instead of providing 100% of their required parking onsite. The fee is typically structured as a function of, or is tied to, the construction or replacement cost of a new public parking space. The policy is advantageous as it encourages new infill development and change-of-use redevelopment to occur on sites that otherwise may not be able to feasibly support enough parking onsite due to space constraints and high expense associated with the construction of new parking. In Golden, the fee in lieu proceeds

go towards the maintenance, upgrades, and expansion of public, shared parking resources available for all developments within the downtown.

For new construction or building additions, the fee is based on 50% of current replacement cost of structured parking space. The fee is due at the time of the building permit or by an agreed upon payment plan up to 20 years in length.

Golden also provides the option of a fee in lieu for individual tenant changes of use for newer structures. In this context, developers may elect to make an annualized contribution based on 25% of the current replacement cost of a structured parking space, amortized over 30 years.

#### Breckenridge, CO

In most cases, fees in lieu are tied to, or are a function of, the capital costs of constructing a new public parking space, typically a structured space. In Breckenridge, however, a flat fee in lieu was established in 2013. The fee, which was \$19,236 when fees in lieu were first set in 2013, is adjusted annually to reflect the percentage increase, if any, in the consumer price index (CPI-U) for all items for the Denver-Boulder, Colorado area.

#### Santa Monica, CA

While most fees in lieu are intended expressly for the purpose of funding new parking, the City of Santa Monica has diversified the activities and items for which revenue from fees in lieu can be used from beyond simply parking. In Santa Monica, fees in lieu intended to add parking can be used to fund leases of existing parking from private property owners or to coordinate with valet parking operations with private property owners, in addition to be used to fund construction of new parking facilities.

However, revenue can also be used for trip reduction strategies, including but not limited to, improvement to parking use rates by means of improved wayfinding, signage information systems, management, and circulation and access. In-lieu fees can be used within the central business district to satisfy up to 100% of the minimum parking requirement.

## Boulder, CO

Boulder has a multi-faceted and diverse array of funding sources for its parking system. In addition to the general fund, Boulder has three general improvement districts, one business improvement district, and one transportation and access district within City limits. Some districts overlap each other and overlapping areas may qualify for or receive revenue from all the individual funding sources associated with each district.

Funding for parking for all of Boulder's districts comes from a combination of the following sources: parking enforcement revenue, parking meter revenue, parking permit revenue, property taxes, special assessment taxes, tax-increment financing, leases, mill levies, interest, payments in lieu/fees, and pedestrian mall fees

Other than parking (new construction, enforcement, operations, maintenance, and debt servicing), revenue also funds other mobility- and access-related purposes and strategies, depending on the district. For instance, within Boulder's Central Area and University Hill General Improvement Districts, revenue also funds EcoPasses, which are unlimited-use transit passes, as well as economic vitality, marketing, and events. Within the Business Improvement District, revenue funds streetscapes, banners,

landscaping, and signage. In the Boulder Junction Access District, revenue is used to fund car sharing programs and reduced cost bike sharing programs for those who live or work in the District.

Metric	Boulder	Fort Collins	Longmont	Greeley
City Reputation (2020)	102.250	160.810	09.995	108 705
Estimated City Population (2022)	108,175	172 321	101 409	112 816
Year Parking Management Began	NPP Program began in 1986, with first RPP zones established in 1993. CAGID established in September 1970. Parking meters have existed in downtown Boulder since the 1940s.	NPP program began in 2013 with pilot program, which was soon expanded to cover 10 zones Downtown had metered on-street parking downtown in the 1950s and 1960s, but has since been free, time-limited. Not sure when Fort Collins initiated paid parking in garages and lots downtown. The first parking structure was constructed in 1998 - 1999.	No active parking management	2016
Number of Visitors per Year	3.3 million (all of Boulder). 1.2 million (downtown Boulder).	1.73 million (all of Fort Collins) (2017).	No data available	436,964 (2019)
Overview of TDM or Alternative Transit Options	Boulder is served by the Regional Transportation District, B-cycle bike-share program, and a robust trail and bike path network. Boulder is one of four communities to have a platinum rating by the League of American Bicyclists. For employees of the City of Boulder, the following TDM strategies are available: parking cash-out option for all City of Boulder employees working at sites with paid parking, single day passes at sites with paid parking, books of 20 ned-ay parking passes available for a discounted rate of 560 free satellite parking location for downtown employees, market rate pricing for the use of close-in city-owned parking facilities, situ bisbidy for employee parking in structured, publicly accessible parking facilities, within X-mile walking distance to downtown city facilities, free bike shetters, electric-assist bikes available for mid-day use, free bike tune-ups, discounted bike accessines, free Boulder B-cycle memberships, free RTD EcoPasses, free parking at civic lots (closer-icity lots) for carpool and vanpool users, fleet whicles available, where the City fully reimburses new vanpoolers for the first two months of vanpool costs can be any vanpool options are available, where the City fully reimburses new vanpoolers for the first two months of vanpool cost. There is a free guaranteed in forme (provided through DRCCO). Boor to Downtown (120) was a subsidied molility program valiable for all downtown commuters. The program, which was established in 2016, was a partnership between the City of Boulder Community (1tality Department and Commutifi), Lyft, Uber, Rocky Mountain institute, and the Downtown Boulder Partnership. One of the goals of the program is no longer active as of 2022. The AMPS Implementation Plan, adopted in 2022, identified a Transportation Wallet (NPP) areas. One key aspect of the program is leveraging additional funds gained from changes made to the City of an obar strategies for revitalizing access which advalue to adverk thore whithan an NPP would program as to fand the progr	Fort Collins is served by TransFort, though other regional transit agencies such as Berthoud BATS, Loveland COLT, and Greeley GET provide connecting service to Fort Collins. Since COVID, there has been no fare to ride on Transfort. The NFMPO is the regional planning agency for Fort Collins. Through It, vanpool services are available through VanGO, with fares varying based on zone. VanGO vanpool trips must start or end within NFRMPO region. NoCe Bike & Ped is a collaborative group of residents and professionals who work to improve bicycle and trail networks and promote the usage of bicycles in and around Northern Colorado. In 2021, the City began an city-wide e-bikk and e-scooter share program, which is operated by Spin, which costs \$1 to start and 30 cents per minute to ride. 24-hour, 7-day, an 30-day unlimited passes are also available. Ride NOCO is an online commuting platform for nothern Colorado residents (including Loveland) that enables users to learn about and find multi-modal transportation optics that are customized for their needs. Fort Collins has received a rating of platinum by the League of American Bicyclists, a rating shared by only three other cities in the US as of 2020. Over 80% of Fort Collins' somidering implementing a city- wide TOM ordinance for new development, similar to Denver's from 2020. A TDM checklist would be required for new development, similar to Denver's from 2020. A TDM checklist would be required for new development, similar to Denver's from 2020. A TDM checklist would be negure available, Ride transit use. The proposed checklist would include elements to help developers achieve a TDM-supported designation, such as preferentia carpool spaces, bike parking, car sharing spaces, shower and change facilities, and mixed-use development. The City currently actively installs public bike parking rates and blocations upon request by individuals or businessowners within city limits, and recently tauched an on-stree tike corral program to provide businesses the opp	Longmont is served by the Regional Transportation District. A program called Ride Free Longmont, fundec through the City's Street Fund, has made riding local RTD busses within Longmont fare-free. RTD Access- Ride also qualifies for free rides within the city. Through RTD, EcoPasses can be purchased by employees. Loveland is also served by the FLEX dregional bus route, connecting Longmont with Loveland and For Collins. eGo Carshare service is available in Longmont fur Carshare service is available in Longmont. Longmont was classified as a Silver-ievel bicycle-friendly community by the Lague of American Bicyclists in 2016. In 2020, Longmont published its Equitable Carbon-free Transportation Road Map, which outlines partnering with local TDM agencies to develop a TDM program for city staff, received a grant bad a few programs, with the most recent being one run by Zagstercalled Pace. Most krecently, Commuting Solutions, the local TMA, received a grant bad ing worgraments for most non- residents, and low spaces and the Scyce to Longmont on a trial basis. Longmont has also eliminated minimum parking supply requirements for most non- residential land uses. Bike parking spaces are required by code.	Greeley is served by GET (Greeley Evans Transit) The transit service provides a flat fare of \$1.50 one way for all fixed routes; service for K-12 students is provided free of charge. GET also provides a regional connecting route to Windsor NRMPO, such as VanGO, are available for Greeley residents as Greeley is a constituent member of the MPO. Greeley experimented with a bikeshare system consisting of a single station with 6 bikes in 2016, but has no city-wide bikeshare or e-scooter system as of 2022, though UNC has a bikeshare program available for students. Greeley has a number of parking reduction credits available for new developments; such as an aexemption for the downtown GID, on-street parking credits, with all reductions being at the discretion of the Plannin Director. Bike parking spaces are also required.
Public/Managed Parking Inventory	5,222 managed parking spaces. Total number of on-street parking spaces in Boulder about 30,539. Over 3,700 public parking spaces downtown (off-street + on-street paid). 2,702 off-street managed public spaces.	About 2,700 time-limited and paid parking spaces in and around Olde Town (2019). About 855 time-limited on-street spaces downtown. Remainder (About 1,900 spaces) is spread across three structures and one lot.	In 2019: About 872 public off-street parking spaces. 1,022 on-street spaces within the downtown core and 1,864 total on-street spaces within the entire City of Longmont	More than 2,000 two-hour parking spaces.
Management Strategies Employed (Time Limts, Rates, Etc.)	Boulder has paid, metered on-street parking in three year-round areas and one seasonal area. The rate at the meter is currently \$1.50 per hour, with varying time limits. Typically, for most metered on-street parking, there are no time limits. On-street parking downtown is paid between Monday and Saturday, 9 AM - 7 PM. Downtown, there are 5 off-street public parking garages and 7 off street surface lost. Rates in all the off-street facilities are \$1.52 per hour on all days between 8 AM and 5 PM. Honors and a 3 Mar. For seasonal on-street parking, the rate is \$2.53 per hour on all days between 8 AM and 5 PM. Honors bay to Labor 9.07 ff-street parking is free on weeks. Boulder has 12 esident permits are \$30 per vehicle per year, visitor permits are \$5 per permit, up to two permits, once annually. Residents are also eligible for up to two 2-week guest permits per permits are \$50 per year. Finally, nonresident commuter permits are available on a limited basis for \$105 per quarter within RPPP zones.	Fort Collins does not have paid on-street parking. For most on-street downtown parking, there is a 2-hour time limit, with a "Move II" ordinance in place prohibiting relocation of a vehicle to the same block face for at least 4 hours once time has expired. All loading zones have a 30-minute time limit in place. There are three paid off-street public parking structure The rate is \$1 per hour in the garages without a permit. The off-street supplic parking structure parking facilities range from \$30 to \$60 depending on facility, which a discount for advance payment. Transfort transit users can qualify for a \$3 discount for parking garage permits if parking on to plevels. Fort Collins has 12 RPPs zones. All zones except one offer 2-hour parking without a permit once per day. Permit costs range from \$0 for stays of 2 hours or fewer to \$10 for stays of between 25 hours and 15 days. For some RPP zones, all voes cal hours or lever to \$30 availed resident or guest permit during certain events, such as CSU football game days.	All public parking is currently free. Most close-in on- street parking is limited to 2 hours and peripheral on- street parking is limited to 3 hours, though time limits of 30 minutes and 1 hour are also found. Out of 12 of street facilities, 9 are 2-hour, 1 is 3-hour, and 2 are ali- day. For off-street lost shat are time limited, all-day permits are available for purchase at 55 per day. Annual permits are available for between \$240 and \$432, depending on the lot (2016).	All public parking downtown that is not a permit only area is free for two hours between 7 AM and 5 PM on weekdays. If desired, people can use the Passport parking platform to "pay to stay" beyond two hours at a rate of \$2 per hour up to 10 hours. Within a designated "Orange Zone," vehicles must move either two blocks away or outside of the zone entirely once their time limit is up, unless they pay to stay longer. Two off-street public lots offer free parking all day. All parking is free after 5 PM, and non- permitted vehicles may park in permit lots after 5 PM. Greeley also has an RPP program, with five zones in and around the UNC Campus and one north of the North Colorado Medical Center, RPP permits are provided free of charge to qualifying residents. For permit lots, permits are available for purchase for between \$45 and \$75 per quarter, depending on the lot. "Pay to stay" is only available via smartphone app; there are no POF stations.
Who Conducts Enforcement/Operates Managed	Enforcement is conducted by the Access and Parking Services Office, under the umbrella of the Department of Community Vitality.	Parking Services Department	No separate parking management division or	Parking Services Department
Enforcement Strategies Employed	For paid areas, PEOs mostly conduct enforcement on foot with handheld devices and the T2 Flex application/platform, though LPR- based enforcement on a vehicle is also used. PEOs enter license plate numbers into device with each passtyn and the system determines whether payment has been rendered in ParkMobile for that plate and/or whether paid time has expired. Also, PEOs w heck windsheilds for paid parking receipts placed on the dashboard. For time limited parking, either LPR is used or the odometer number is recorded along with the valve stem placement by an on-foot PEO. On subsequent passbys (depending on time limit), the flex LPR records the same plate number/the odometer reading is the same, and the valve stem is oreientated in the same way, a clation will be issued. Tickers are either physically generated and left under a winddshied wiper, presented directly to a driver, mailed via USPS to owner of vehicle, or through a summons/complained served on the driver. For NPPs, a timer countdown begins for each plate number recorded by LPR or entered into handheid device by PEO. PEOs return every 2 or 3 hours. If same plate number is recorded, a citation is issued. Vehicles displaying permits or guest passes are skipped.	IF For time limited parking and in RPPs, PEOs use golf cart-like vehicles that are outfitted with PR technology. The LPR platform records the GPS location along with a license plate numbe for all time limited on-street parking. Tickets are issued if the system alerts the PEO that a vehicle has stayed in the same location past the posted time limit, at which point the PEO wil Issue either a warning or a citation, placed underneath the windshield wiper blade.	For time-limited areas, PEO's use chalking and license plate reader (LPR) technology to enforce . In both cases, tickets are generated via an eTicketing program by Brazos Technology.	Greeley consolidated all its parking enforcement and other parking operations into one department in 2019, when it mowed to a parking, access, and revenue control platform operated by Pasport, which streamlined parking operations and information sharing and enabled more efficient and effective communication and enforcement. All enforcement is conducted digitally with LPR-equipped vehicles. The technolog valos gives the Parking Services Department the ability to track and note abandoned or derelict vehicles, alleviating the responsibility from the Police Department. Also, the platform can register and record parking permits for permit holders, eliminating the need to display a physical permit/hangtag. PEOs enforce in downtown as well as in the RPP areas.
----------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Funding Strategies/Funding Structure	Nulliple strategies and structures: CAGID 68% Parking, 26% tax, interest, TIF, 5% Lesses, 1% Other. CAGID property tax mill levy 5.657 (2005), BID: 5.633 additional mill levy (2005). Approximately 1,065 businesses. UHGID: 90% Parking, 10% tax, interest. Mill ievy (2005) 2.564. BJAD: TOM: Property taxes. Developers paid payment in lieu ot taxes (PILOT) fees for first two years. BJAD Parking: Parking revenues; FGTFGID: property taxes. Developers paid payment in lieu ot taxes (PILOT) fees for first two years. BJAD Parking: Parking revenues; FGTFGID: property taxes. IIII levy, Fund used to pay for £coPasses for all residents. Mill Pavi, 1292. Gener, [Parking] Fund: Parking enforcement (75%), NPE (3%), Metres (15%), Mall Fees (5%), Excludes CAGID but includes "Civic Lots" (Ubrary tot, Park Central Lot, Municipal Lot), DUHMD: Downtown, University Hill Management Division (and Parking Services). Management division funded by and providing service for CAGID, UHGID, and General Parking Fund. General (Parking) Fund operates as an enterprise fund.	Special Revenue Fund.	General Fund and Capital Improvement Fund. Revenu from public lot permits goes to the Downtown Parking CIP. Some Downtown Development Authority staffing costs are changed to the Downtown Parking Fund.	Enterprise Fund.
Total Revenue of Management Program	\$12.377 million (2019).	\$2.85 million (2019)	\$93,600 (2019) (Downtown Parking CIP). \$126,349 (2019) (Parking enforcement/fines in General Fund	\$244,100 (2019 Budget)
Annual Cost to Run/Operate Parking Program	\$12.394 million (2019)	\$3.04 million (2019)	Not publicly available- similar to Loveland, Longmont manages its parking across multiple departments unde the General Fund	\$217,393 (2019 Budget)
Number of Staff Required for Parking Program	10 dedicated parking patrol officers.	2 customer service reps, 6 PEOs and 1 PEO supervisor. PEOs enforce in downtown and in RPPs. (2017 - 2018)	2 PEOs serving a combined total of 60 hours per week, along with handicapped parking patrol volunteers (2016). The two PEOs, along with patrolling and enforcing, are also tasked with performing all departmental administrative duties related to parking enforcement (2016).	2 PEOS (2019 - 2020 Budget). 1 court clerk is also appointed for parking under the purview of the Court budget.
Cost Recovery (Percentage)	99%	94%	117% (Downtown Parking CIP). 79% (Parking enforcement/fines in General Fund	112%
What Happens to Excess Funds, if Any?	After funds dedicated to subsidizing EcoPass programs, revenues fund streetscape improvements and enhanced public WiFi facilities. After 2022, will also be used to fund Transportation Wallet and subsidize parking passes for equity populations.	Parking appeared to run at a small loss for all budgets looked at; no excess revenue typically.	Annual revenues in excess of of annual expenses of the Parking Enforcement Service in the General Fund are transferred to the Downtown Parking Fund.	Reserves are used to set aside funds for maintenance and replacement of capital structures, and excess balances are commonly used to "save" funds for a major capital construction and rehabilitation.

## **APPENDIX H**

Public Survey Questions & Responses/Written Comments from the General Public

















### Written Comments:

NO.	June 8 to November 2022. Anonymous entries: 51 online comments and 24 hardcopy comments out of 717 survey responses. Of 75 written comments, 20 support parking management, 21 are against it, and 25 are undetermined.	Support Parking Management (Yes/No) or Undetermined
1	To local Loveland Residents, Free Parking after 6 pm should be free to all to help aid local businesses.	Yes
2	For businesses, parking should have an option to purchase permits for employees.	Yes
3	Differs topic street learning. Many Cities have Mon/Wed or Mon/Tues Street cleaning 8:00 am – 12 pm. People go to work or have a moment to move to the other side of the street—alternate cleaning by day. I heard the sweeper	Yes

	at 5 am. Cars are all in place; nothing gets cleaned. Also, all the derelict cars	
	<ul> <li>get them off—citations for not moving cars. Once the sweeper goes, cars</li> </ul>	
	can move back. Thank you! But other. I parked up in the Foundry. Heft for a	
4	To local Loveland Residents. Free Parking after 6 nm should be free to all to	
-	help aid local businesses.	Yes
5	For businesses, parking should have an option to purchase permits for employees	Yes
6	Very inadequate disability parking near the Metrol us Downtown. Would	
	one of you drive yourself downtown with a backpack and wheelchair and	
	try to find your way from a parking spot to the theater? By yourself? It's	Yes
	nearly impossible. Also, it is very dangerous to have no crosswalks across	
	Cleveland and Lincoln at 3 <sup>rd</sup> Street.	
7	More handicap parking, more enforcement of handicap parking.	Yes
8	I would like more accessible parking for getting a stroller/small child safety	Yes
Q	More parking options in downtown by foundry so people don't take	
	residents parking spaces in front of their houses. My driveway is constantly	Yes
	being blocked when there's events at the foundry.	
10	If another parking garage will be built, it should accommodate passing and	
	cornering. The Foundry garage is a nightmare to navigate when two vehicles	Yes
	need to pass or longer vehicles are parked there.	
11	Why are the parking spot straight in and not at an angle? Also, the compact	No.
	car spots need to be marked better. All of the markings in the garage are	Yes
12	When are you going to get off of your ASS and start enforcement <sup>111</sup> For god	
	sakes, this issue has been studied to death. There is a parking app for Estes,	Yes
	Cheyenne, Fort Collinssimple and easy. Do It.	
13	Put more focus and money into making downtown pedestrian-friendly, less	Yes
	automobiles!	100
14	It is important that large residential developments like Patina Flats, etc.,	Vac
	free or paid	res
15	Where ever more parking area is keep it monitored, safe, and clean and	
	picked up. No homeless hanging around.	Yes
16	On-street parking should costs; surface lots and garages should be free.	
	Employees Downtown should be encouraged to move away from on-street	Yes
	parking. Downtown residents should have parking permits.	
17	It's always been very difficult with the lack of handicap parking downtown	Vee
	and has been a huge struggle of those with disabilities. Make Main Street	res
18	Use and app like Fort Collins! Makes it super easy.	Yes
19	Parking lot at park on 1 <sup>st</sup> near walking paths, trolley or tram to downtown.	
	Also the old fairgrounds park and baseball area. Use peripheral parking and	Yes
	trolleys free trolleys or trams. Make it festive.	
20	Please add signage stating no parking within 2 car lengths from the curb.	
	Our downtown streets have many blind spots at intersections requiring	Yes
21	ariver to enter the intersection before crossing.	
21	some intersections are difficult to cross – i.e., 3°°. and Lincoln—too much speeding on Lincoln and Cleveland	Undetermined
	speciality on Elicon and Cleveland.	

22	Resident safety and priority are not feasible for a gate system in the garage.	Undetermined
	Free parking is important; it promotes business.	
23	I love the resurgence of the downtown area. However, I have struggled to find handicap parking for my mother-in-law.	Undetermined
24	Make 4 <sup>th</sup> Street a Pedestrian Mall for 2 blocks	Undetermined
25	I believe that 4 <sup>th</sup> Street should be closed between Lincoln and Cleveland. This should be a permanent closure to create a pedestrian mall like in Denver, Boulder, and Fort Collins.	Undetermined
26	I would rather not park downtown at all if it were safer to get to by bike and there were more places to lock a bike, bike valet for events & bike racks closer to common destinations.	Undetermined
27	Blocking off parking spots in front of Door 222 for summer patio dining is annoying as it creates less spots. Also, who wants to eat with cars next to them especially if the light is red.	Undetermined
28	Recently had a temporary disability and gave up on going to downtown Loveland. I get it now.	Undetermined
29	Downtown needs to be much friendlier to pedestrians and cyclists, much less car-oriented.	Undetermined
30	Honestly, I don't feel there is a major parking issue in downtown. There's plenty of spots near major areas. Yes, you have to walk a block or two, potentially, but that's not bad.	Undetermined
31	There's enough parking. People are complaining about having to walk minimal.	Undetermined
32	Protected bike lanes, streets closed to cars, buses, and trains.	Undetermined
33	I hate the idea of meters downtown, it's old school and inconvenient. I prefer to pay for parking garages with an app like Fort Collins, if we are going that route.	Undetermined
34	Golf cart shuttles. Not everyone can walk 3 blocks. Sell advertising on the shuttle.	Undetermined
35	We need to encourage people who have too much to drink to uber home or call a friend not to worry about if their car will be towed or fined for overnight parking.	Undetermined
36	Redesign of top parking deck in current Foundry garage. Limited turnaround space when garage is full. With no options to reverse the flow of cars – drivers literally had to back out of garage.	Undetermined
37	There should be a size regulation for the garage. No large trucks or suvs since the garage was built for compacts cars.	Undetermined
38	Remove all parking in 4 <sup>th</sup> Street and turn it into a pedestrian mall.	Undetermined
39	Need better bike racks and a pedestrian signal at 3 <sup>rd</sup> and Lincoln.	Undetermined
40	And a depot for an electric train to downtown Denver would be great.	Undetermined
41	None.	Undetermined
42	Nothing at the moment.	Undetermined
43	We don't do downtown stuff often because the parking is so bad.	Undetermined
44	No comment.	Undetermined
45	Thank you.	Undetermined
46	Parking is great, buses are great, and the ability to walk – sidewalks people friendly! And flexible.	No
47	Parking garage is too narrow; don't put in pay spots.	No
48	There has NEVER been parking meters downtown, and that will not SOLVE anything.	No

49	Please do not start charging to park downtown. That would make us go to alternate areas where parking is close and free like it should be!	No
50	Free parking is extremely important – I am more likely to visit businesses.	No
51	Parking should remain free in the downtown area. If there needs to be paid parking, that should be the garage and get security so it's safe and not dangerous as it is now. No meters for surface lots.	No
52	Don't start charging for parking at all. This isn't Fort Collins, and it isn't Boulder. This is silly.	No
53	Questions 7 and 8 are designed to be quite a trap as only metered or paid for parking are included. I only answered them because you have also done a totally self-serving plan by making them mandatory.	No
54	No parking, more public transit. Bus every 10 minutes.	No
55	I am AGAINST parking meters/paid parking.	No
56	Very much appreciate the free parking options in Loveland and ease of access, even on weekend nights. I think the free and easy parking is something that helps attract people to downtown Loveland.	No
57	This survey sucks. No meters. No annoying apps. Let people visit and walk and change their mind when they discover downtown and not worry about their meter. Foundry Garage too small	No
58	I am opposed to paid downtown parking. Loveland business struggle to compete with neighbor cities as it is. Downtown parking is not exactly premo and not worth paying extra.	No
59	I don't believe there is a parking problem. There is a car culture problem. Enhanced access by bike, walking and transit with fewer parking spaces would do more to solve the problem in the long run.	No
60	We frequent downtown Loveland several times a week and typically do not have troubles with parking. We love that there are several options and we are super thankful that those options are still free.	No
61	Do not charge for parking. It deters people from visiting.	No
62	Please please, please add free overnight parking. This will help save lives and people from drunk driving. Not everyone can make a plan ahead, but if they can leave their car. This will help. Thank you.	No
63	Parking should remain free but the foundry parking structure needs more levels from the get-go just like now Larimer county building (needed more floors)!	No
64	We should never pay for parking in Loveland. Stop building garages only certain pet have access to.	No
65	Do charge for parking!!!	Yes
66	Free overnight public parking should be located everywhere. Very few cars are parked downtown overnight, we should value people making good choices over a few \$ revenue.	No

# **APPENDIX I**

Survey Questions & Responses/Written Comments from Business Associations









6. Please describe how we can improve parking in the downtown business zone?		Support Parking Management (Yes/No) or Undetermined
1	Get the restaurants off the streets – there is no more COVID closure.	Yes
2	Parking garage is always decent option, but keep it as close to the center of downtown as possible.	Yes
3	The outdoor parking space dining needs to be a bit stricter as far as the restaurants and bars that are offering it need to be open the majority of the time. Maybe have signs up on 4th St guiding people to where there might be alternate parking that is with in walking distance to where they want to be.	Yes
4	We are a veterans organization, and our membership is aging. It would be helpful if there was more parking available for downtown so our members could park on third nearest the building.	Yes

5	Go back to enforcing the 2-hour parking. We have cars parked on our block for 8 hours a day.	Yes
6	Enforce 2hr parking. Many employees of businesses park in 2hr diagonal parking all day long instead of the long-term parking areas.	Yes
7	The outdoor patio program was necessary during the pandemic but is not necessary now. The establishments that are using parking spaces already have patios they can use and are just moving customers from indoor seating to outdoors. It is not increasing sales.	Yes
8	Adding a parking garage north of 4th	Yes
9	Adding long-term parking lots and enforcing short-term parking.	Yes
10	Clean up the lots making them feel safe. Many homeless crowd in the lots making it unsafe for our staff to park far away.	Undetermined
11	Parking garages so far have only helped the apartments they come with. Great idea but hasn't helped with day-to-day parking. Adding additional apartments only gives what little parking is available to residents and their guests. Stop adding apartments.	Undetermined
12	Just more of it. Parking garages are good. Using parking spots for outdoor dining is sometimes OK but the merchants who need customers probably don't like it since it is not used most of the day.	Undetermined
13	I think we just need more available!	Yes
14	Enforce the parking times that are detailed on the street signs.	Yes
15	Block off 4th street between Lincoln and Cleveland (there isn't room for a turn lane, and traffic backs up, and then they can patio out all they want) and change Cleveland to two lanes at about 7th St. and put diagonal parking on each side of Cleveland from 7th to 4th instead of 3 lanes with parallel parking. Diagonal is easier to park, and it allows more cars. Plus, it might slow down the traffic through that area. And enforce 2 hr. parking with the credit card paid meters like most other modern cities.	Yes
16	I think all the boutique shops benefit from foot traffic generated by restaurants and microbrews that get people outside sitting still and looking around. People either do window shopping for future visits or impulse decisions to go in. Totally different shopping experience than running errands. Now that we have the parking garage, I don't have a problem getting a parking spot, but I would like more drop-off zones so someone can get out and put our names in (less walking for the elderly, etc.). Sometimes we get lucky and find a spot when we do that. Walking is pleasant downtown, lots to look at and enjoy these days!	Yes
17	We don't need employee parking, but it would very nice for clients to have relatively convenient parking. Our clients (2-8 per week) are in 203 hours at a time. We don't have as many clients as some in our building. Many workers/owners in our block take up street parking spaces all day every single day. It would be nice to strongly encourage with an official notice or possibly enforcement for those individuals and businesses to not take up multiple spaces directly in front of or adjacent to our building for 8 hours, 5 days a week. That would help with our clients as well as the nearby retail, restaurants and other businesses.	Yes
18	Regulators Business owners take up all the parking, and then they park in front of my shop, especially door to 22 he will park in front of my shop all day long all of ours, and still take up half the street for's diner not Cole no I don't know Enforce the two-hour parking as well ask business owners to not let their employees park on fourth street. I tell them all to park somewhere else in the wall.	Yes

19	Put in meters and enforce parking!	Yes
20	Please do not put in parking meters.	No
21	Let downtown business owners/residents purchase parking passes. Then start educating folks/cars that parking is going to begin to be enforced for a few months. Put flyers on cars that would be getting a ticket at first. Then start enforcing it, but give each car one freebie. We're Lovelandenforce parking, but be friendly about it.	Yes
22	There are several signs throughout that state that there is time limits, but these are not enforced. There is also cars parking in the back alley when they should be parking in actual spots rather than blocking deliveries and WM pickup.	Yes
23	Enforce the two hour limit. Quick retail and restaurant customers struggle to find parking because the main spots are taken up by people work work downtown.	Yes







10. Please describe where is truck parking when you get a delivery?		
1	In nearby alley	
2	Alleyway	
3	Just on the side of 4 <sup>th</sup> St, not in a designated area. Usually in front of the Ballet Studio	
4	Normally the trucks park in the alley for deliveries unless it is blocked, at which time they park in the middle of the street to allow cars to get around them	
5	On 4th street in front of our business	
6	At the front door to the church	
7	Delivery is just through USPS, UPS, and FedEx so wherever they can find parking	
8	Trucks use the alley for deliveries	
9	Outside of Cleveland Room	
10	N/A	
11	Behind the building via loading dock/alleyway	
12	The middle of the street/across multiple parking spots	
13	Our parking lot or in the street (Garfield Ave)	
14	Front of building. Twice a week. Depending	
15	Street	
16	They just park wherever they can	
17	In our Alley in between 4 <sup>th</sup> and 5 <sup>th</sup> Street	
18	In front of store, on street	
19	In front of the business	
20	Edge of the street and often briefly block parked cars – we are on 4 <sup>th</sup>	
21	UPS and FedEx	
22	Street	
23	On street, less than 10 minutes.	
24	In the alley.	
25	Currently in the back alley when cars are not parked in the back. If there are parks blocking, they use the front loading zone.	
26	Alley	

# **APPENDIX J**

Ordinance Example

### 2-2-15. - Neighborhood Permit Parking Zones.

- (a) Restricting parking on streets in certain areas zoned for residential uses primarily to persons residing within such areas will reduce hazardous traffic conditions, promote traffic safety, and preserve the safety of children and other pedestrians in those areas; protect those areas from polluted air, excessive noise, trash, and refuse; protect residents of those areas from unreasonable burdens in gaining access to their residences; preserve the character of those areas as residential; promote efficiency in the maintenance of those streets in a clean and safe condition; preserve the value of the property in those areas; and protect the peace, good order, comfort, convenience, and welfare of the inhabitants of the city. The city council also finds that, in some cases, residential streets serve an important parking function for nonresidents in the public and commercial life of the city. Some accommodation for parking by others may be appropriate in these cases.
- (b) The city manager will conduct an annual study to determine if a neighborhood permit parking permit zone should be established in a neighborhood, and what its boundaries should be. Priority Based Neighborhood Access Management strategy will be used to make that determination. This strategy entails an annual evaluation of the entire city by zone or neighborhood based on key metrics, such as parking occupancy, trip generation, and access to other modes of transportation, to determine an appropriate neighborhood parking management and permitting strategy. The manager may consider, without limitation, the extent to which parking spaces are occupied during working or other hours, the extent to which parked vehicles are registered to persons not apparently residing within the neighborhood, the impact that businesses and facilities located within or without the neighborhood have upon neighborhood parking within the neighborhood, such other factors as the manager deems relevant to determine whether parking by nonresidents of the neighborhood substantially impacts the ability of residents of the proposed parking permit zone to park their vehicles on the streets of the proposed zone with reasonable convenience, and the extent to which a neighborhood permit parking zone would significantly reduce this impact. The manager shall also determine the need for reasonable public access to parking in the area, and the manner and extent that it should be provided, along with the hours and days on which parking restrictions should apply. No such parking restrictions shall apply on Sundays or holidays unless exempted by regulation promulgated by the city manager pursuant to Chapter 1-4, "Rulemaking," B.R.C. 1981. The manager shall conduct one citywide Priority Based Neighborhood Access analysis annually in the month and the manner set forth by regulation promulgated by the city manager pursuant to Chapter 1-4, "Rulemaking," B.R.C. 1981.
- (c) The manager shall on an annual basis conduct a Priority Based Neighborhood Access Management analysis to identify locations where establishing, altering, or deleting a neighborhood permit parking zone is in the public interest. The manager may accept eligible applications year-round and evaluate them on an annual basis subsequent to completion of the

#### Boulder, CO Municipal Code

analysis. Threshold eligibility for applications is determined by whether the location falls within an approved location based on the Priority Based Neighborhood Access Management analysis and signed by twenty-five adult residents of a neighborhood proposing a neighborhood permit parking zone. If the application is eligible, the manager shall prepare a proposal for the zone, specifying the boundaries, the hours and days on which parking restrictions will apply, and the provisions, if any, for nonresident permit parking. The manager may hold such public meetings as deemed advisable to assist the manager in formulating such proposal. The manager shall determine whether a proposal is eligible and if so, shall annually present one or more proposal(s) for zone(s) to the Transportation Advisory Board. The board, after including in its normal public notice these features of the manager's plan, shall hold a public hearing on the manager's proposal, and shall recommend to the manager that the zone be established, that it be established with certain modifications which are within the manager's authority under this code and any adopted regulations, or that it not be established. The manager shall, within thirty days of the board's recommendation, provide the city council with the manager's proposal to the board, the board's recommendation and related comments, the manager's final plan, and the reason for any difference between the recommendation and the final plan. If the city council does not call up the manager's final plan within thirty days, the manager may establish the zone. If the city council calls up the manager's final plan, it shall hold a public hearing on the plan and, by motion, direct the manager not to establish the zone, or to establish the zone with any modifications which are within the manager's authority, or to establish the zone in accordance with the manager's final plan. The manager shall establish the zone approved by regulation, but if the zone is established after a city council call-up, the manager shall not call for public comment in the notice of proposed regulation.

- (d) Upon establishment of a zone, the manager shall, subject to the availability of funds appropriated for the purpose, install the necessary traffic control devices within the zone and issue neighborhood parking zone permits pursuant to Chapter 4-23, "Neighborhood Parking Zone Permits," B.R.C. 1981.
- (e) The manager may by regulation prescribe additional standards, not inconsistent with those set out in this section, which must be met before the manager designates a neighborhood permit parking zone, or adds or deletes territory from an established zone. The manager may issue regulations governing the issuance and use of neighborhood parking permits not inconsistent with Chapter 4-23, "Neighborhood Parking Zone Permits," B.R.C. 1981.
- (f) The city manager shall monitor the program on a regular basis and annually provide the city council with a report on the neighborhood permit parking program generally, including its relationship to parking supply and demand in adjacent areas of the city and the status of zone

block faces under Subsection <u>4-23-2(j)</u>, B.R.C. 1981. The details of the monitoring effort shall be contained in administrative regulations promulgated by the city manager pursuant to Chapter 1-4, "Rulemaking," B.R.C. 1981.

(g) This Section shall not apply to the area as defined by <u>Section 2-2-21</u>, "Chautauqua Parking Management Plan," B.R.C. 1981.

Ordinance Nos. 4966 (1986); 5869 (1997); <u>8179 (2017)</u>; <u>8238 (</u>2018); 8509 (2021)